



Everything You Wanted to Know About Blacklists But Were Afraid to Ask

Leigh Metcalf
Jonathan M. Spring
CERT Network Situational Awareness Group
netsa-contact@cert.org
Publication CERTCC-2013-39

September 2013

Executive Summary

This document compares the contents of 25 different common public-internet blacklists in order to discover any patterns in the shared entries. Some lists contain IP addresses, and other lists contain domain names; these types of lists form the two cohorts that are compared. The contents of the lists are compared directly. The contents are also expanded to closely related identifiers using a passive DNS data source, and these expanded contents are also expanded. The list contents are also compared temporally to determine which, if either, list consistently provided any shared indicators before another list.

The results demonstrate that most of the time, list contents are unique. There is surprisingly little overlap between any two blacklists. Though there are exceptions to this pattern, the intersection between the lists in general remains low even after expanding each list to a larger neighborhood of related indicators. The results also show that some lists do consistently provide content before certain other lists, but more often there is no intersection in the first place. When there *is* intersection, there is often no pattern to which list came first.

These results suggest that each blacklist is describing a distinct sort of malicious activity. The lists do not appear to converge on one version of all the malicious indicators for the internet-at-large. Network defenders would be advised, therefore, to obtain and evaluate as many lists as practical, since it does not appear that any new list can be rejected out-of-hand as redundant.

When we began this analysis, the allegory of the blind men feeling the elephant came to mind. In the allegory, several blind men are feeling an elephant, trying to determine what it is. Because each man is touching only one part of the elephant, each has his own idea about what it is—one thinks it is a wall, another thinks it is a whip, and another thinks it is a tree trunk. Seeing the entire elephant at once would reveal its true identity. The situation with blacklists on the public internet takes this allegory a step further: like the blind men in the allegory, we cannot see the entire situation at once, but we are also trying to describe many kinds of "animals." We must first figure out what we are describing before we can accurately tie our reports together.



Copyright 2013 Carnegie Mellon University

This material is based upon work funded and supported by the Department of Defense under Contract No. FA8721-05-C-0003 with Carnegie Mellon University for the operation of the Software Engineering Institute, a federally funded research and development center.

Any opinions, findings and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Department of Defense.

This report was prepared for the
SEI Administrative Agent
AFLCMC/PZM
20 Schilling Circle, Bldg 1305, 3rd floor
Hanscom AFB, MA 01731-2125

NO WARRANTY. THIS CARNEGIE MELLON UNIVERSITY AND SOFTWARE ENGINEERING INSTITUTE MATERIAL IS FURNISHED ON AN "AS-IS" BASIS. CARNEGIE MELLON UNIVERSITY MAKES NO WARRANTIES OF ANY KIND, EITHER EXPRESSED OR IMPLIED, AS TO ANY MATTER INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO, WARRANTY OF FITNESS FOR PURPOSE OR MERCHANTABILITY, EXCLUSIVITY, OR RESULTS OBTAINED FROM USE OF THE MATERIAL. CARNEGIE MELLON UNIVERSITY DOES NOT MAKE ANY WARRANTY OF ANY KIND WITH RESPECT TO FREEDOM FROM PATENT, TRADEMARK, OR COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT.

This material has been approved for public release and unlimited distribution except as restricted below.

Internal use:* Permission to reproduce this material and to prepare derivative works from this material for internal use is granted, provided the copyright and "No Warranty" statements are included with all reproductions and derivative works.

External use:* This material may be reproduced in its entirety, without modification, and freely distributed in written or electronic form without requesting formal permission. Permission is required for any other external and/or commercial use. Requests for permission should be directed to the Software Engineering Institute at permission@sei.cmu.edu.

* These restrictions do not apply to U.S. government entities.

Carnegie Mellon®, CERT® and CERT Coordination Center® are registered marks of Carnegie Mellon University.

DM-0000569

Contents

1	Motivation	14
2	Method	14
2.1	Method for Part II	15
2.1.1	IP methods	16
2.1.2	Domain methods	17
2.2	Method for Part III	17
2.3	Method for Part IV	18
2.4	Method for Part V	19
3	Results	19
4	Conclusion	20
	References	20
I	The List Types	21
A	The Blacklists – DNSBL	21
B	The Feeds	21
C	The Whitelists	22
D	Non-Routable/Reserved IPs	22
II	Initial Analysis	23
E	IP-Based Blacklists	23
E.1	Initial Analysis – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	23
E.2	Initial Analysis – 2012 IPs – Feeds	32
E.3	Initial Analysis – 2012 IPs – All Lists	36
E.4	Initial Analysis – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	40
E.5	Initial Analysis – 2013 IPs – Feeds	48
E.6	Initial Analysis – 2013 IPs – All Lists	51
F	Domain-Based Blacklists	55
F.1	Initial Analysis – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	55
F.2	Initial Analysis – 2012 Domains – Feeds	59
F.3	Initial Analysis – 2012 Domains – All Lists	62
F.4	Initial Analysis – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	63
F.5	Initial Analysis – 2013 Domains – Feeds	67
F.6	Initial Analysis – 2013 Domains – All Lists	71
III	Extended Analysis	72
G	IPs to Domain (ID)	72
G.1	Initial Analysis – 2012 ID – DNSBL	72
G.2	Initial Analysis – 2012 ID – Feeds	81
G.3	Initial Analysis – 2013 ID – DNSBL	85
G.4	Initial Analysis – 2013 ID – Feeds	94

H	Domains to IP (DI)	98
H.1	Initial Analysis – 2012 DI – DNSBL	98
H.2	Initial Analysis – 2012 DI – Feeds	101
H.3	Initial Analysis – 2012 DI – All Sets	103
H.4	Initial Analysis – 2013 DI – DNSBL	104
H.5	Initial Analysis – 2013 DI – Feeds	107
H.6	Initial Analysis – 2013 DI – All Sets	109
IV	Time Series	111
I	Time Series – IP-Based Lists – DNSBLs	111
I.1	Results for January 2012 (DNSBL)	111
I.2	Results for February 2012 (DNSBL)	117
I.3	Results for March 2012 (DNSBL)	122
I.4	Results for April 2012 (DNSBL)	127
I.5	Results for May 2012 (DNSBL)	132
I.6	Results for June 2012 (DNSBL)	137
I.7	Results for July 2012 (DNSBL)	142
I.8	Results for August 2012 (DNSBL)	147
I.9	Results for September 2012 (DNSBL)	152
I.10	Results for October 2012 (DNSBL)	157
I.11	Results for November 2012 (DNSBL)	162
I.12	Results for December 2012 (DNSBL)	167
I.13	Results for January 2013 (DNSBL)	172
I.14	Results for February 2013 (DNSBL)	177
I.15	Results for March 2013 (DNSBL)	182
J	Time Series – IP-Based Lists – Feeds	187
J.1	Results for February 2012 (Feeds)	187
J.2	Results for March 2012 (Feeds)	188
J.3	Results for April 2012 (Feeds)	189
J.4	Results for May 2012 (Feeds)	190
J.5	Results for June 2012 (Feeds)	192
J.6	Results for July 2012 (Feeds)	193
J.7	Results for August 2012 (Feeds)	194
J.8	Results for September 2012 (Feeds)	195
J.9	Results for October 2012 (Feeds)	196
J.10	Results for November 2012 (Feeds)	197
J.11	Results for December 2012 (Feeds)	198
J.12	Results for January 2013 (Feeds)	199
J.13	Results for February 2013 (Feeds)	200
J.14	Results for March 2013 (Feeds)	201
K	Time Series – Domain-Based Lists – DNSBLs	202
K.1	Results for January 2012 (DNSBL)	202
K.2	Results for February 2012 (DNSBL)	207
K.3	Results for March 2012 (DNSBL)	211
K.4	Results for April 2012 (DNSBL)	214
K.5	Results for May 2012 (DNSBL)	217
K.6	Results for June 2012 (DNSBL)	221
K.7	Results for July 2012 (DNSBL)	225
K.8	Results for August 2012 (DNSBL)	228
K.9	Results for September 2012 (DNSBL)	232
K.10	Results for October 2012 (DNSBL)	236
K.11	Results for November 2012 (DNSBL)	239
K.12	Results for December 2012 (DNSBL)	243

K.13 Results for January 2013 (DNSBL)	246
K.14 Results for February 2013 (DNSBL)	250
K.15 Results for March 2013 (DNSBL)	254
L Time Series – Domain-Based Lists – Feeds	257
L.1 Results for February 2012 (Feeds)	257
L.2 Results for March 2012 (Feeds)	258
L.3 Results for April 2012 (Feeds)	259
L.4 Results for May 2012 (Feeds)	260
L.5 Results for June 2012 (Feeds)	262
L.6 Results for July 2012 (Feeds)	264
L.7 Results for August 2012 (Feeds)	266
L.8 Results for September 2012 (Feeds)	268
L.9 Results for October 2012 (Feeds)	270
L.10 Results for November 2012 (Feeds)	272
L.11 Results for December 2012 (Feeds)	274
L.12 Results for January 2013 (Feeds)	276
L.13 Results for February 2013 (Feeds)	278
L.14 Results for March 2013 (Feeds)	280
V Time-Series Analysis	282
M DNSBL – IPs	282
N Feeds – IPs	290
O All Lists – IPs	293
P DNSBL – Domains	301
Q Feeds – Domains	304
R All Lists – Domains	306

List of Tables

A.1 Blacklists – DNSBL	21
B.1 Blacklists – Feeds Edition	22
C.1 Whitelists	22
D.1 Reserved Blocks and Their Uses	22
E.1 Counts – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	23
E.2 Reverse Counts – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	23
E.3 Intersection by Count – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	24
E.4 Intersection by Percentage – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	25
E.5 Distinct Intersections – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	25
E.6 Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	26
E.7 ASN Counts – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	26
E.8 Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	27
E.9 ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	28
E.10 ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	28
E.11 Active in passive DNS – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	29
E.12 Whitelist Intersections	29
E.13 Counts – 2012 IPs – Feeds	32
E.14 Reverse Counts – 2012 IPs – Feeds	32
E.15 Intersection by Count – 2012 IPs – Feeds	32
E.16 Intersection by Percentage – 2012 IPs – Feeds	32

E.17	Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 IPs – Feeds	32
E.18	ASN Counts – 2012 IPs – Feeds	33
E.19	Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2012 IPs – Feeds	33
E.20	ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – Feeds	34
E.21	ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – Feeds	34
E.22	Active in passive DNS – 2012 IPs – Feeds	34
E.23	Whitelist Intersections	34
E.24	Reverse Counts – 2012 IPs – All Lists	36
E.25	Intersection by Count – 2012 IPs – All Lists	36
E.26	ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – All Lists	36
E.27	ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – All Lists	38
E.28	Counts – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	40
E.29	Reverse Counts – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	40
E.30	Intersection by Count – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	41
E.31	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	42
E.32	Distinct Intersections – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	42
E.33	Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	43
E.34	ASN Counts – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	43
E.35	Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	43
E.36	ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	45
E.37	ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	46
E.38	Active in passive DNS – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	46
E.39	Whitelist Intersections	47
E.40	Counts – 2013 IPs – Feeds	48
E.41	Reverse Counts – 2013 IPs – Feeds	48
E.42	Intersection by Count – 2013 IPs – Feeds	48
E.43	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 IPs – Feeds	48
E.44	Distinct Intersections – 2013 IPs – Feeds	48
E.45	Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 IPs – Feeds	48
E.46	ASN Counts – 2013 IPs – Feeds	49
E.47	Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2013 IPs – Feeds	49
E.48	ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – Feeds	50
E.49	ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – Feeds	50
E.50	Active in passive DNS – 2013 IPs – Feeds	50
E.51	Whitelist Intersections	50
E.52	Reverse Counts – 2013 IPs – All Lists	51
E.53	Intersection by Count – 2013 IPs – All Lists	51
E.54	ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – All Lists	51
E.55	ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – All Lists	53
F.1	Counts – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	55
F.2	Reverse Counts – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	55
F.3	Intersection by Count – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	55
F.4	Intersection by Percentage – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	55
F.5	Google Safe Browsing – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	55
F.6	Top 5 TLDs – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	56
F.7	Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	56
F.8	Active in passive DNS – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	57
F.9	Name servers and Domains – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	57
F.10	Top 5 Name servers – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	57
F.11	Counts – 2012 Domains – Feeds	59
F.12	Reverse Counts – 2012 Domains – Feeds	59
F.13	Intersection by Count – 2012 Domains – Feeds	59
F.14	Intersection by Percentage – 2012 Domains – Feeds	59
F.15	Google Safe Browsing – 2012 Domains – Feeds	59
F.16	Top 5 TLDs – 2012 Domains – Feeds	59
F.17	Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 Domains – Feeds	60

F.18	Active in passive DNS – 2012 Domains – Feeds	60
F.19	Name servers and Domains – 2012 Domains – Feeds	61
F.20	Top 5 Name servers – 2012 Domains – Feeds	61
F.21	Reverse Counts – 2012 Domains – All Lists	62
F.22	Top TLDs – 2012 Domains – All Lists	62
F.23	Top Hostnames – 2012 Domains – All Lists	62
F.24	Counts – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	63
F.25	Reverse Counts – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	63
F.26	Intersection by Count – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	63
F.27	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	63
F.28	Google Safe Browsing – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	63
F.29	Top 5 TLDs – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	64
F.30	Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	64
F.31	Active in passive DNS – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	65
F.32	Name servers and Domains – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	65
F.33	Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	65
F.34	Counts – 2013 Domains – Feeds	67
F.35	Reverse Counts – 2013 Domains – Feeds	67
F.36	Intersection by Count – 2013 Domains – Feeds	67
F.37	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 Domains – Feeds	67
F.38	Google Safe Browsing – 2013 Domains – Feeds	67
F.39	Top 5 TLDs – 2013 Domains – Feeds	67
F.40	Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – Feeds	68
F.41	Active in passive DNS – 2013 Domains – Feeds	69
F.42	Name servers and Domains – 2013 Domains – Feeds	69
F.43	Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – Feeds	69
F.44	Reverse Counts – 2013 Domains – All Lists	71
F.45	Top TLDs – 2013 Domains – All Lists	71
F.46	Top Hostnames – 2013 Domains – All Lists	71
G.1	Counts – 2012 ID – DNSBL	72
G.2	Reverse Counts – 2012 ID – DNSBL	72
G.3	Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – DNSBL	72
G.4	Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – DNSBL	74
G.5	Google Safe Browsing – 2012 ID – DNSBL	76
G.6	Top 5 TLDs – 2012 ID – DNSBL	76
G.7	Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 ID – DNSBL	77
G.8	Average Number of Domains – 2012 ID – DNSBL	78
G.9	Top 5 IP Addresses – 2012 ID – DNSBL	78
G.10	Counts – 2012 ID – Feeds	81
G.11	Reverse Counts – 2012 ID – Feeds	81
G.12	Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – Feeds	81
G.13	Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – Feeds	81
G.14	Google Safe Browsing – 2012 ID – Feeds	82
G.15	Top 5 TLDs – 2012 ID – Feeds	82
G.16	Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 ID – Feeds	83
G.17	Average Number of Domains – 2012 ID – Feeds	83
G.18	Top 5 IP Addresses – 2012 ID – Feeds	84
G.19	Counts – 2013 ID – DNSBL	85
G.20	Reverse Counts – 2013 ID – DNSBL	85
G.21	Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – DNSBL	85
G.22	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – DNSBL	87
G.23	Google Safe Browsing – 2013 ID – DNSBL	89
G.24	Top 5 TLDs – 2013 ID – DNSBL	89
G.25	Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 ID – DNSBL	90
G.26	Average Number of Domains – 2013 ID – DNSBL	91
G.27	Top 5 IP Addresses – 2013 ID – DNSBL	91

G.28	Counts – 2013 ID – Feeds	94
G.29	Reverse Counts – 2013 ID – Feeds	94
G.30	Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – Feeds	94
G.31	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – Feeds	94
G.32	Google Safe Browsing – 2013 ID – Feeds	95
G.33	Top 5 TLDs – 2013 ID – Feeds	95
G.34	Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 ID – Feeds	96
G.35	Average Number of Domains – 2013 ID – Feeds	96
G.36	Top 5 IP Addresses – 2013 ID – Feeds	97
H.1	Counts – 2012 DI – DNSBL	98
H.2	Reverse Counts – 2012 DI – DNSBL	98
H.3	Intersection by Count – 2012 DI – DNSBL	98
H.4	Intersection by Percentage – 2012 DI – DNSBL	98
H.5	Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 DI – DNSBL	99
H.6	Average IPs per Domain – 2012 DI – DNSBL	99
H.7	Top 5 Domains – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	99
H.8	Counts – 2012 DI – Feeds	101
H.9	Reverse Counts – 2012 DI – Feeds	101
H.10	Intersection by Count – 2012 DI – Feeds	101
H.11	Intersection by Percentage – 2012 DI – Feeds	101
H.12	Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 DI – Feeds	101
H.13	Average IPs per Domain – 2012 DI – Feeds	101
H.14	Top 5 Domains – 2012 IPs – Feeds	102
H.15	Intersection by Count – 2012 DI – All Sets	103
H.16	Intersection by Percentage – 2012 DI – All Sets	103
H.17	Counts – 2013 DI – DNSBL	104
H.18	Reverse Counts – 2013 DI – DNSBL	104
H.19	Intersection by Count – 2013 DI – DNSBL	104
H.20	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 DI – DNSBL	104
H.21	Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 DI – DNSBL	105
H.22	Average IPs per Domain – 2013 DI – DNSBL	105
H.23	Top 5 Domains – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	105
H.24	Counts – 2013 DI – Feeds	107
H.25	Reverse Counts – 2013 DI – Feeds	107
H.26	Intersection by Count – 2013 DI – Feeds	107
H.27	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 DI – Feeds	107
H.28	Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 DI – Feeds	107
H.29	Average IPs per Domain – 2013 DI – Feeds	108
H.30	Top 5 Domains – 2013 IPs – Feeds	108
H.31	Intersection by Count – 2013 DI – All Sets	109
H.32	Intersection by Percentage – 2013 DI – All Sets	110
I.1	Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL	111
I.2	Reverse Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL	111
I.3	Intersection by Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL	111
I.4	Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL	114
I.5	Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL	117
I.6	Reverse Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL	117
I.7	Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL	117
I.8	Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL	119
I.9	Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL	122
I.10	Reverse Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL	122
I.11	Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL	122
I.12	Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL	124
I.13	Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL	127
I.14	Reverse Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL	127
I.15	Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL	127

I.16	Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL	129
I.17	Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL	132
I.18	Reverse Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL	132
I.19	Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL	132
I.20	Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL	134
I.21	Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL	137
I.22	Reverse Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL	137
I.23	Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL	137
I.24	Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL	139
I.25	Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL	142
I.26	Reverse Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL	142
I.27	Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL	142
I.28	Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL	144
I.29	Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL	147
I.30	Reverse Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL	147
I.31	Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL	147
I.32	Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL	149
I.33	Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL	152
I.34	Reverse Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL	152
I.35	Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL	152
I.36	Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL	154
I.37	Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL	157
I.38	Reverse Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL	157
I.39	Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL	157
I.40	Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL	159
I.41	Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL	162
I.42	Reverse Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL	162
I.43	Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL	162
I.44	Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL	164
I.45	Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL	167
I.46	Reverse Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL	167
I.47	Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL	167
I.48	Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL	169
I.49	Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL	172
I.50	Reverse Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL	172
I.51	Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL	172
I.52	Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL	174
I.53	Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL	177
I.54	Reverse Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL	177
I.55	Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL	177
I.56	Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL	179
I.57	Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL	182
I.58	Reverse Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL	182
I.59	Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL	182
I.60	Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL	184
J.1	Count – February 2012 IPs – Feeds	187
J.2	Reverse Count – February 2012 IPs – Feeds	187
J.3	Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – Feeds	187
J.4	Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – Feeds	187
J.5	Count – March 2012 IPs – Feeds	188
J.6	Reverse Count – March 2012 IPs – Feeds	188
J.7	Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – Feeds	188
J.8	Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – Feeds	188
J.9	Count – April 2012 IPs – Feeds	189
J.10	Reverse Count – April 2012 IPs – Feeds	189
J.11	Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – Feeds	189

J.12	Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – Feeds	189
J.13	Count – May 2012 IPs – Feeds	190
J.14	Reverse Count – May 2012 IPs – Feeds	190
J.15	Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – Feeds	190
J.16	Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – Feeds	190
J.17	Count – June 2012 IPs – Feeds	192
J.18	Reverse Count – June 2012 IPs – Feeds	192
J.19	Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – Feeds	192
J.20	Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – Feeds	192
J.21	Count – July 2012 IPs – Feeds	193
J.22	Reverse Count – July 2012 IPs – Feeds	193
J.23	Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – Feeds	193
J.24	Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – Feeds	193
J.25	Count – August 2012 IPs – Feeds	194
J.26	Reverse Count – August 2012 IPs – Feeds	194
J.27	Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – Feeds	194
J.28	Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – Feeds	194
J.29	Count – September 2012 IPs – Feeds	195
J.30	Reverse Count – September 2012 IPs – Feeds	195
J.31	Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – Feeds	195
J.32	Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – Feeds	195
J.33	Count – October 2012 IPs – Feeds	196
J.34	Reverse Count – October 2012 IPs – Feeds	196
J.35	Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – Feeds	196
J.36	Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – Feeds	196
J.37	Count – November 2012 IPs – Feeds	197
J.38	Reverse Count – November 2012 IPs – Feeds	197
J.39	Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – Feeds	197
J.40	Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – Feeds	197
J.41	Count – December 2012 IPs – Feeds	198
J.42	Reverse Count – December 2012 IPs – Feeds	198
J.43	Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – Feeds	198
J.44	Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – Feeds	198
J.45	Count – January 2013 IPs – Feeds	199
J.46	Reverse Count – January 2013 IPs – Feeds	199
J.47	Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – Feeds	199
J.48	Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – Feeds	199
J.49	Count – February 2013 IPs – Feeds	200
J.50	Reverse Count – February 2013 IPs – Feeds	200
J.51	Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – Feeds	200
J.52	Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – Feeds	200
J.53	Count – March 2013 IPs – Feeds	201
J.54	Reverse Count – March 2013 IPs – Feeds	201
J.55	Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – Feeds	201
J.56	Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – Feeds	201
K.1	Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL	202
K.2	Reverse Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL	202
K.3	Intersection by Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL	202
K.4	Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL	204
K.5	Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL	207
K.6	Reverse Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL	207
K.7	Intersection by Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL	207
K.8	Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL	209
K.9	Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL	211
K.10	Reverse Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL	211
K.11	Intersection by Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL	211

K.12	Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL	212
K.13	Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL	214
K.14	Reverse Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL	214
K.15	Intersection by Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL	214
K.16	Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL	215
K.17	Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL	217
K.18	Reverse Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL	217
K.19	Intersection by Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL	217
K.20	Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL	219
K.21	Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL	221
K.22	Reverse Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL	221
K.23	Intersection by Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL	221
K.24	Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL	223
K.25	Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL	225
K.26	Reverse Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL	225
K.27	Intersection by Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL	225
K.28	Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL	226
K.29	Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL	228
K.30	Reverse Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL	228
K.31	Intersection by Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL	228
K.32	Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL	230
K.33	Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL	232
K.34	Reverse Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL	232
K.35	Intersection by Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL	232
K.36	Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL	234
K.37	Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL	236
K.38	Reverse Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL	236
K.39	Intersection by Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL	236
K.40	Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL	237
K.41	Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL	239
K.42	Reverse Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL	239
K.43	Intersection by Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL	239
K.44	Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL	241
K.45	Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL	243
K.46	Reverse Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL	243
K.47	Intersection by Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL	243
K.48	Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL	244
K.49	Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL	246
K.50	Reverse Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL	246
K.51	Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL	246
K.52	Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL	248
K.53	Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL	250
K.54	Reverse Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL	250
K.55	Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL	250
K.56	Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL	252
K.57	Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL	254
K.58	Reverse Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL	254
K.59	Intersection by Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL	254
K.60	Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL	256
L.1	Count – February 2012 Domains – Feeds	257
L.2	Reverse Count – February 2012 Domains – Feeds	257
L.3	Count – March 2012 Domains – Feeds	258
L.4	Reverse Count – March 2012 Domains – Feeds	258
L.5	Count – April 2012 Domains – Feeds	259
L.6	Reverse Count – April 2012 Domains – Feeds	259
L.7	Intersection by Count – April 2012 Domains – Feeds	259

L.8	Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 Domains – Feeds	259
L.9	Count – May 2012 Domains – Feeds	260
L.10	Reverse Count – May 2012 Domains – Feeds	260
L.11	Intersection by Count – May 2012 Domains – Feeds	260
L.12	Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 Domains – Feeds	260
L.13	Count – June 2012 Domains – Feeds	262
L.14	Reverse Count – June 2012 Domains – Feeds	262
L.15	Intersection by Count – June 2012 Domains – Feeds	262
L.16	Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 Domains – Feeds	262
L.17	Count – July 2012 Domains – Feeds	264
L.18	Reverse Count – July 2012 Domains – Feeds	264
L.19	Intersection by Count – July 2012 Domains – Feeds	264
L.20	Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 Domains – Feeds	264
L.21	Count – August 2012 Domains – Feeds	266
L.22	Reverse Count – August 2012 Domains – Feeds	266
L.23	Intersection by Count – August 2012 Domains – Feeds	266
L.24	Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – Feeds	266
L.25	Count – September 2012 Domains – Feeds	268
L.26	Reverse Count – September 2012 Domains – Feeds	268
L.27	Intersection by Count – September 2012 Domains – Feeds	268
L.28	Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – Feeds	268
L.29	Count – October 2012 Domains – Feeds	270
L.30	Reverse Count – October 2012 Domains – Feeds	270
L.31	Intersection by Count – October 2012 Domains – Feeds	270
L.32	Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – Feeds	270
L.33	Count – November 2012 Domains – Feeds	272
L.34	Reverse Count – November 2012 Domains – Feeds	272
L.35	Intersection by Count – November 2012 Domains – Feeds	272
L.36	Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 Domains – Feeds	272
L.37	Count – December 2012 Domains – Feeds	274
L.38	Reverse Count – December 2012 Domains – Feeds	274
L.39	Intersection by Count – December 2012 Domains – Feeds	274
L.40	Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – Feeds	274
L.41	Count – January 2013 Domains – Feeds	276
L.42	Reverse Count – January 2013 Domains – Feeds	276
L.43	Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – Feeds	276
L.44	Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 Domains – Feeds	277
L.45	Count – February 2013 Domains – Feeds	278
L.46	Reverse Count – February 2013 Domains – Feeds	278
L.47	Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – Feeds	278
L.48	Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 Domains – Feeds	279
L.49	Count – March 2013 Domains – Feeds	280
L.50	Reverse Count – March 2013 Domains – Feeds	280
L.51	Intersection by Count – March 2013 Domains – Feeds	280
L.52	Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 Domains – Feeds	281
M.1	Precedence Analysis – 2012 IPs – DNSBL	282
M.2	Precedence Analysis – 2013 IPs – DNSBL	285
N.1	Precedence Analysis – 2012 IPs – Feeds	290
N.2	Precedence Analysis – 2013 IPs – Feeds	291
O.1	Precedence Analysis – 2012 IPs – All	293
O.2	Precedence Analysis – 2013 IPs – All	296
P.1	Precedence Analysis – 2012 Domains – DNSBL	301
P.2	Precedence Analysis – 2013 Domains – DNSBL	302
Q.1	Precedence Analysis – 2012 Domains – Feeds	304
Q.2	Precedence Analysis – 2013 Domains – Feeds	304
R.1	Precedence Analysis – 2012 Domains – All	306

R.2 Precedence Analysis – 2013 Domains – All 307

1 Motivation

A variety of organizations provide information about malicious touch points on the public internet. This information usually comes in the form of a list of resource identifiers—usually IP addresses, domain names, or URLs—that are dangerous and the user should not visit. Such a list is called a blacklist, and the user is advised not to contact those resources. In a corporate environment, adherence to blacklists may be mandated by IT policy and procedures. Our analysis also includes several whitelists. A whitelist is a list of resources that should be explicitly allowed. One can use a whitelist to block anything not on the whitelist, or to simply overrule the contents of a blacklist.

Although there are quite a few organizations that provide blacklists, there is little information about how various lists are related and how the organizations actually produce the lists. Most blacklist providers are engaged in essentially a battle of wits with adversaries, and the providers cannot reasonably disclose the precise procedure of generating the lists without the risk of compromising the quality of the list.

From an operational point of view the question is quite practical. Network defenders need to know which list or lists they should use to defend their networks. If lists are expensive and lists overlap, then the cost-benefit analysis of which lists to obtain is altered. It is also possible that several dozen lists may all provide value, and that network defenders without robust access to all such lists is lacking valuable information to defend their network.

On the other hand, blacklist interrelation bears on the academic information security literature and process as well. Several academic papers rate performance of a particular task according to agreement with some blacklist or lists. Given that blacklist generation procedures are trade secrets, this method is not conducive to academic openness. If all lists were equal, this method would be acceptable; however, because each list is different, the ability to alter results by choice of list leaves the academic process open to manipulation, as an author can choose the list that offers the best agreement.

There is no known comparison of existing blacklists in the open literature. The authors have seen small comparisons of lists presented in private settings; these presentations inspired the current work, and the analysis in this document is far more exhaustive than any previous work the authors have seen. To be clear, the goal of this document is not to judge the quality of any list presented here, and mention of a list does not imply an endorsement of any kind. The quality of a list is based on relevance to a defender's environment, and each defender must make that judgment independently. The following analysis measures the extent to which various blacklists are the same.

2 Method

Our analysis compares 28 different blacklists in a variety of ways. The blacklists are also compared to seven whitelists. Altogether 35 operational lists were compared. The period of comparison was January 1, 2012 through March 31, 2013. All lists contain IP addresses and/or domain names.

Not all lists are directly comparable. A list of IP addresses cannot be compared to a list of domain names. The lists are therefore broken into two broad groups – domain name blacklists and IP blacklists. The groups were also partitioned according to time. All the lists collected for 2012 were analyzed separately from the first quarter of 2013. Partitioning the data makes processing more practical, however the analytic benefit is that the shorter time frame of three months in 2013 provides a more granular view.

Differentiating by collection type further divides the list groups. Some lists we obtain directly from the source, and have a complete copy of the list – the *feeds*. The contents of some lists are inferred from the contents of DNS messages observed via passive DNS (pDNS); such lists are all DNS-based block lists (DNSBL), which are lists queried or distributed via the DNS protocol. Since the passive DNS source cannot guarantee the completeness of DNSBL collection, we provide both separate and combined analysis of these lists with the complete lists.

The list of all DNSBLs used in the analysis is described in Section A. All lists obtained directly as feeds are described in Section B. The various whitelists gathered are described in Section C.

All autonomous system number (ASN) tables use ASN identifiers derived from a combination of the Oregon Route Views [1] and RIPE NCC [2] open BGP (border gateway protocol) data sources. These two projects collect BGP announcements about which ASN has the best paths to which IP addresses. From these various announcements, collected from routers around the world, we determine a mapping of which AS is the source/owner of which IP address. Although this data can change dynamically, the blacklists are stored according to a summary of the time period that most accurately represents the actual IP-to-ASN mapping.

The dynamic nature of BGP and ASNs presents some challenges, as an IP may change ASN or an IP may go on and off a blacklist during the course of the year. However, for this initial analysis, we made a simplifying assumption and mapped the IP to the ASN which owned it on December 1, 2012. Making this mapping more granular is left for future work. This mapping permits analysis of the blacklists based on which ASNs are represented by the IP addresses on the list. The WHOIS databases maintained by the Regional Internet Registries (RIRs) also allow us to determine the company that owns each ASN and the country in which that company is registered.

2.1 Method for Part II

The following groups of lists are analyzed, for 12 groups in total:

- 2012 IPs from feeds
- 2012 IPs from DNSBLs
- 2013Q1 IPs from feeds
- 2013Q1 IPs from DNSBLs
- 2012 domains from feeds
- 2012 domains from DNSBLs
- 2013Q1 domains from feeds
- 2013Q1 domains from DNSBLs
- Each pair of groups from the same time frame and identifier type (e.g., 2012 IPs from feeds with 2012 IPs from DNSBLs)

Several measures are computed for each of the groups. The initial analysis, reported in Part II, computes the following information about IP-address-based lists (Section E):

1. Counts
2. Reverse Counts
3. Intersections by Count
4. Intersections by Percentage
5. Distinct Intersections
6. Intersections with Non-Routable
7. ASN Counts
8. Top 5 Countries by ASN
9. ASN Intersections by Count
10. ASN Intersections by Percentage
11. Valid DNS A/AAAA records
12. Whitelist Intersections

And the following information about domain-name-based lists (Section F):

1. Counts
2. Reverse Counts
3. Intersection Counts

4. Intersection Percentage
5. Google Safe Browsing Results
6. Top 5 TLDs
7. Top 5 Hostnames
8. Valid DNS A/AAAA records
9. Name Servers and Domains
10. Top 5 Name Servers

For both IPs and domains, the analysis in Part II is the same for information items 1-4 in both of the above lists, and essentially the same for “Valid DNS A/AAAA records” (11 and 8, respectively). The other items are different because they are based on the properties of IPs and domains, respectively.

“Counts” is simple; it is the number of unique entries on the list during the time period. “Reverse count” is a measure of how many lists contain certain identifiers (IP or domain name). It is generated by creating a master list of the identifier paired with the list it came from, sorting by identifier, counting number of entries per identifier, and finally reporting how many identifiers were seen to have entries on precisely so many lists.

“Intersection counts” reports the largest rote intersection of identifiers for various numbers of lists, from two lists up to all lists in the group. This calculation is made by determining the intersection of all possible combinations of lists, and reporting the largest such intersection. “Intersection percentage” is calculated similarly, except instead of rote values, percentage is calculated as the number of entries in the intersection over the size of the smallest list involved in the intersection.

The “Valid DNS A/AAAA records” table name is used on both types of lists, but has a slightly different interpretation based on whether it is calculated on an IP-based or domain-based list. It has a similar derivation because it always uses passive DNS records. An identifier from a blacklist is counted as active if there was a valid DNS response connecting a domain to an IP address regarding the identifier on the blacklist. For a list of IPs, the percentage reported is how many IPs on the list were in the `rdata` section of such a DNS record; that is, some domain resolved to those IP addresses. For a list of domains, the percentage reported is how many domains on the list were in the `rname` section of such a DNS record; that is, there was some IP address to which the domains resolved. The existence of such records implies that the resource was available to the internet at large, and that someone attempted to access it; the duration of availability or volume of attempts is not measured in this manner.

2.1.1 IP methods

“Distinct intersections” is a list of the blacklists that were distinct from each other – that is, the intersection between the two lists was 0. If there were no pair of lists with a null intersection (i.e., all pairs of lists shared at least one indicator), then this table is omitted.

“Intersections with Non-Routable” reports the magnitude of the set intersection between the blacklist in question and the IPv4 address space that is not supposed to be routed on the public internet for various reasons. The explicit list of this non-routable space is presented in Table D.1.

“ASN Counts” displays the number of unique ASNs represented by IPs on the blacklist, the total number of IPs that all of those ASNs represent.

“Top 5 Countries by ASN” takes the ASN counts one step further. Each IP in the blacklist is associated with an ASN, as before. Then each ASN is associated with the country in which the company that owns the ASN is registered. This does not necessarily represent the geolocation of the IP addresses, but it does indicate which countries are in legal control of the host companies, which indicates a level of legal control over the IPs listed on the blacklist. In this tables, “UNK” represents unknown.

For “ASN Intersections by Count” and “ASN Intersections by Percentage” the numbers reported are calculated over the list of ASNs associated with each list during the time period. So if each list has at least one IP address that is owned by the same ASN, that ASN is counted as shared between the list. It does not mean the IP addresses are necessarily the same. Otherwise, the method is similar to the IP address intersections, in that the intersections are calculated using standard set operations. Likewise, the percentage reported is the percentage of the smaller list.

“Whitelist Intersections” measures the intersection of each blacklist with each available IP-based whitelist. Each blacklist is presented with the intersections it shares with each whitelist. Standard set operations are

used to determine the intersection. The rote counts, percentage of the blacklist represented by that count, and percentage of the whitelist represented are all presented.

2.1.2 Domain methods

The intersection of each list with Google's Safe Browsing corpus of malicious URLs [3] must be determined using methods unlike the other intersection methods. Google does not make the clear-text URLs available. Rather, Google provides the hashes of entries in a custom data structure, and a client for checking URLs against that hash database. We have stored all the hashes listed as malicious by Google Safe Browsing since October 1, 2011. To check if a domain from a blacklist was also known by Google, we must check to see if the domain tests positive for any time between October 2011 and April 30, 2013. Due to the nature of the Safe Browsing checking algorithm, there is not a one-to-one match between known malicious domains and hashes in the database, so we cannot accurately state how many domains are on the Safe Browsing blacklist. Thus Safe Browsing results cannot be further compared to the other lists.

The "Top 5 TLDs" and "Top 5 Hostnames" are simply measures of the most common labels for domains in the list – the top-level and lowest-level label, respectively. To calculate each of these, the label of interest is broken off, assuming an ASCII "." as the delimiter. The frequency that each label appears is then calculated, and the five most prevalent are presented in the table.

The "Name Servers and Domains" tables report only for blacklists about domains. To be active in the DNS, a domain name must have a name server. It may not have an A/AAAA record, but if any information about a domain must be provided by its name server. Thus this table similarly uses passive DNS data for the time period in question to determine the number and percentage of domains on the list that had name server (NS) records. The number of unique name servers for all domains on a given list is also calculated, and we calculate some statistics about the relationship between the domains and their name servers. Namely, the average number of name servers a given domain uses and the number of domains on the list usually associated with a given name server.

The "Top 5 Name Servers" extracts one item from the process for the name servers and domains. Instead of displaying the average number of domains per name server, the table displays the five name servers which served the largest number of domains on each blacklist.

2.2 Method for Part III

In order to extend the analysis, we attempted to find any latent links between the lists. We did this by expanding the lists to other identifiers which could be considered immediately related to those on the list. The source of the expansion mechanism was the same pDNS source used to determine whether or not a resource was active in Part II.

Indicator expansion is a general process of "using one or more data sources to obtain more indicators of malicious activity by identifying those related to currently known indicators" [4]. The first step in Part III was to use a simple indicator expansion on all the data sets listed in Sections A and B. Every list was expanded one step. For lists that contained IPs, the IP addresses were expanded to domains ("ID"); for lists that contained domains, the domains were expanded to IP addresses ("DI").

"Expanded to" is a specific process. "ID" indicates that any IPs from the lists that appeared in the `rdata` field of a DNS response in the pDNS data source had all their A records pulled for the time period in question, and all domains that had mapped to that IP for the time period are included in the result. "DI" indicates that any domains from the lists that appeared in the `rname` field of a DNS response in the pDNS data source had all their A records pulled for the duration of the time period in question, and all IP addresses that mapped to that domain during the time period are included in the result. Section G contains results related to all the "ID" expansions, and Section H contains all results related to "DI" expansions.

The reason for this expansion is to try to gather information about whether lists are monitoring similar resources but reporting more specific results. One IP address may commonly host 10,000 domains. In the rare case they are all malicious, one list may contain half, and another list may contain the other half, making it appear that the lists are disjoint. However, after one "DI" expansion, each list would contain the same, single IP, indicating that these lists are more related than initially believed.

Once the expanded lists were obtained, the information collected about each list was similar to that described in 2.1. The tables of counts and reverse counts are calculated in exactly the same way. The intersections are displayed differently. Only intersections of two lists are considered, however the cardinality

(size of the set) of every combination of two-list intersections is reported. These reports are sorted both by rote cardinality and by the percentage of the smaller list which is included in the larger list, as in Part II.

Since Section G contains analyses of lists of domains, it uses similar methods as described for Section F. The most common TLDs and hostnames are reported for each of the expanded lists, calculated the same way as in the prior section.

The indicator expansion also provides some new information. The new information computed over each group of lists for the “ID” expanded lists (Section G) is

1. Average number of domains per IP in the original list
2. IP addresses on the original list that hosted the most domains during the time period

The first is a measure of how quickly the list expanded. Each IP address on the original list has a certain number of domains associated with it, and the value is a standard mean calculated over these rote numbers. The domains are not deduplicated or preprocessed first. The second measure reports which IPs from the original list host the largest number of domains.

Since Section H contains analyses of lists of IP addresses, the methods in this section are similar to those in Section E. Counts, reverse counts, intersections, and intersections by percentage are calculated as described above. List expansion information is also calculated for

1. Non-routable IP addresses
2. Average number of IPs per domain in the original list
3. Domains on the original list with the most IPs associated with them during the time period

The method for table types 2 and 3 in Section H is analogous to the method for table types 1 and 2 in Section G, except Section H shows IPs per domain instead of domains per IP. The number of non-routable IP addresses is calculated to get a sense of how many domains on the list were not directly available all or part of the time they had a valid DNS response. They would not have been available because their supposed IP address would have been unreachable. Non-routable IPs used are enumerated in Section D. The value reported for this measure is simply the cardinality of the intersection between the IP-based list with the set of non-routable IPs; it does not consider how many domains mapped to each of the non-routable IPs, for example.

The final new analysis type for Part III is comparing the expanded “DI” lists to the original lists containing the IP addresses. In this way, we can derive some measure of similarity between the domain-based lists and the IP-based lists. The lists were compared in pairs of two, one list from the original IP-based lists, and one list from the “DI” expanded lists. The five pairs with the largest rote intersection cardinality and largest intersection based on the percentage of the smaller list are reported for these comparisons.

Finally, lists that contain both domains and IPs can be compared to themselves. In this case, the domains from such lists were extracted, a “DI” expansion was performed, and the IP addresses derived from expansion were compared to the IP addresses on the same list. The percentage of IPs derived from the expansion that also appeared on the original list is reported.

2.3 Method for Part IV

Part IV presents the data in a more granular time frame. Each of the four broad groups described above (IPs from feeds, IPs from DNSBLs, domains from feeds, domains from DNSBLs) are broken down with measurements calculated only for indicators reported per month, instead of the longer time periods used in the above measurements. For each month between January 2012 and March 2013, the following four pieces of information are presented about the identifiers present on the lists any time in that month:

1. list size counts
2. reverse counts
3. rote pairwise list intersection cardinality
4. pairwise list intersection, as a percentage of the size of the smaller list

These measures are calculated as described in 2.1.

2.4 Method for Part V

There is only one kind of table in the sections of Part V. The tables in this section examine the timing differences between when different lists published certain identifiers. Each table contains 5 columns. Each row of a table compares a single pair of lists.

- rote intersection size
- percentage relative to each of the two lists
- list A and how many identifiers it published before list B
- list B and how many identifiers it published before list A
- how many identifiers were published on the same day

The values in these tables were calculated by finding the intersection between the two lists for the relevant time period (2012 or 2013Q1) and comparing the date that each list published each identifier. Due to our collection infrastructure, the variable rate at which lists publish data, and analysis practicalities, the extent of our granularity for the comparison was one calendar day. Each identifier was considered to be published on a date if the UTC time of publication to the list fell on that date.

Sections O and R present combinations of data derived from DNSBLs and data derived from feeds according to their respective identifier type (IP or domains). The tables in these two sections exclude any rows that already exist in time-series analysis comparisons in Sections M and N (for Section O) or Sections P and Q (for Section R).

3 Results

The complete results are presented in the tables in Parts II-V of the Appendix.

The general theme of the results seems to be that the lists are more disjoint than they are similar. However, some lists are largely subsumed by other lists. For example, in Table E.16, 99.8% of the IPs on feed_07 were found on feed_02. A natural question is “Which list, if either, was first in obtaining the indicators as malicious?” The tables in Part V, Section N provide an answer. In this case, it appears that the smaller feed_07 is usually later taken up by feed_02, since feed_02 lists only 5,233 of the 32,895 shared indicators first, while feed_07 is first with 26,435; 1,227 of the year 2012 indicators shared between the two lists were posted at about the same time.

From the extended analysis we can infer that some lists follow similar malicious resources differently. For example, while the IP addresses on list_12 and list_03 do not overlap much in 2013, after indicator expansion to the domains on those IPs, there is over 99% overlap (Table G.22).

Although there are such occasional instances of a pair of lists being related and sharing a large portion of their indicators, it does not seem that lists in general converge. The extent of uniqueness varies by source. For example, 99.6% of IPs on the examined feeds for 2012 appeared on only one list; that is, these IPs were unique (Table E.14). However, the IPs from the DNSBLs for the same period demonstrated significantly more overlap; 60.5% of the DNSBL IPs were unique (Table E.2).

Most identifiers are not shared across more than two lists. IPs are more frequently held in common than domains. This observation makes sense in the context of how the public internet is arranged. There are fewer IP addresses than possible domain names. Furthermore, IP addresses are more often shared or reused. These two factors should make it more likely that an IP is listed at some time during the year, and so it is not surprising that there are more shared IPs than domains. One possible confounding factor is the following situation: an IP was listed in January by list 1; the IP was cleaned, reallocated to a different entity, compromised again, and listed in December by list 2. These two listings are not actually reporting on the same event and should not really be counted together. Since Part IV lists each intersection by month, rather than larger time frames, it is perhaps a better source of closely-coupled matching.

Although timeliness is only one measure of the quality of a list, the results tables do allow for some analysis of which lists produce their shared results fastest. Feed_04 seems to be faster than lists with which it shares intersections almost all the time (see Part V).

The lists’ relative resistance to intersection was preserved even when we expanded the indicators to larger, related lists. The reverse count tables in Part III preserve the same general shape as the reverse count tables in Part II. This parallelism suggests that the lists are actually describing different sorts of malicious

phenomena, since not only do they contain different identifiers, but also the identifiers appear to be more than one degree of separation apart.

“Name servers and domains” tables can provide some interesting insights. Name servers can be used to measure centrality of control, since the name server controls the domain in the DNS. So if a particular name server has a large number of domains from a given list, that name server is particularly important. This, however, is not usually the case across a whole list. The “top 5 name servers” tables help identify the outliers. The difficulty is separating out name servers that are simply common registrar name servers. Any name server that is in charge of 10 million domains probably has a share of malicious ones, but that does not mean we should automatically block that name server and its 10 million domains to prevent access to the 50,000 malicious ones. This is a risk-based decision the defender must make. However, if a name server is in charge of 75,000 domains, and 50,000 are on a blacklist, that name server should probably be blocked.

4 Conclusion

There are many common blacklists describing indicators of malicious activity for the internet at large. These lists do not intersect to a large degree. Therefore, it appears that these lists do not converge on one set of malicious indicators. For comprehensive detection, it is best to consider all the lists together than to rely on an intersection.

From a practical point of view, one might surmise that each list, or perhaps a pair of related lists, is describing and following a specific type of malicious behavior. Each of these malicious behaviors is a particular kind of malicious behavior, but it is identified differently from other sorts of malicious behavior. We cannot compare one list to another list to determine how well it identifies any particular behavior, because each list is idiosyncratically following a different kind of behavior. This, in turn, means that there is no thorough or convenient way to evaluate the performance of any of these lists, since each list is a one-of-a-kind authority on the particular type of activity it detects.

A further difficulty with this situation is that there is no ready taxonomy or terminology for describing precisely what activity a malicious actor is performing. Attempts to categorize a list as following a particular malicious activity will run into terminology and communications issues between researchers. The best way to determine what malicious activity a list is following is to know what algorithm the list uses; however, as stated above, list population algorithms are understandably almost never shared. This leaves both the academic and operational cyber security community with few resources to evaluate efficacy.

This problem is especially acute for academic researchers attempting to prove their method is accurate by comparing their results to known lists. Most lists do not intersect—and if they do intersect they do so haphazardly—so what a researcher considers to be a “good” rate of intersection to prove a research method accurate may be meaningless. Further, it is important to consider which lists are used as benchmarks since so few common public lists intersect.

From a practical point of view, the network defender’s take-away from this analysis is that any one list, or any ten lists, cannot provide a comprehensive description of all malicious indicators. Every list the defender can obtain and utilize will probably continue to provide new, non-overlapping defense to the network. Though the defender must evaluate the quality of new identifiers, any new list can provide useful identifiers of malicious activity not already contained in the defender’s list.

References

- [1] Route-Views, “University of oregon route views project.” <http://www.routeviews.org>, January 3, 2012.
- [2] RIPE Network Coordination Center, “Routing information service (RIS).” <http://www.ripe.net/data-tools/stats/ris/routing-information-service>, January 3, 2012.
- [3] Google, “Google Safe Browsing FAQ.” http://code.google.com/apis/safebrowsing/safebrowsing_faq.html, November 2, 2011.
- [4] J. M. Spring, “A notation for describing the steps in indicator expansion,” in *IEEE eCrime Researchers Summit*, (San Francisco), September 17, 2013.

APPENDIX

Part I

The List Types

A The Blacklists – DNSBL

The blacklists considered, along with a note or two about them, is in Table A.1. Lists 11 through 16 are different lists from the same vendor.

Blacklist	Notes
list_01	Anti-spam list based in People’s Republic of China (PRC)
list_02	A combination list composed of all lists offered by a large US-based organization
list_03	A combination list composed of lists from an anti-spam organization
list_04	A list of abusive email sources
list_05	A combination list composed of lists from an anti-spam organization
list_06	A list of abusive email sources
list_07	An anti-spam blacklist
list_08	A list of abusive email sources
list_09	A vendor-specific blacklist
list_10	Anti-spam list based in Canada
list_11	A blacklist from a US-based vendor
list_12	A blacklist from a US-based vendor
list_13	A blacklist from a US-based vendor
list_14	A blacklist from a US-based vendor
list_15	A blacklist from a US-based vendor
list_16	A blacklist from a US-based vendor
list_17	A Singaporean blacklist

Table A.1: Blacklists – DNSBL

B The Feeds

The resources downloaded daily as complete feeds of malicious indicators are displayed in Table B.1.

Blacklist	Start Date	Notes
feed_01	20120215	Free list of command and control domains
feed_02	20120531	A free list of IPs with low reputation
feed_03	20120425	A list of malicious domains and IP addresses
feed_04	20120502	A free list of malicious domains and IP addresses
feed_05	20120217	A free list of malicious domains used as a malware DNS black hole list
feed_06	20130226	A free list of malicious URLs
feed_07	20120218	A free list IP addresses that make scan attempts
feed_08	20130222	A free list of phishing URLs
feed_09	20120217	A free list of IP address that are reportedly attempting brute force ssh attacks
feed_10	20120216	A list of malicious IP ranges

Table B.1: Blacklists – Feeds Edition

C The Whitelists

The whitelists referenced in this paper are in Table C.1.

Whitelist	Description
white_01	Mail server whitelist, based in PRC
white_02	Mail server whitelist, based in USA
white_03	Accredited whitelist organized by US-based company
white_04	A free whitelist service
white_05	A free whitelist. Historically valid, though it seems to be unsupported now
white_06	A free DNS-based whitelist
white_07	A free crowd-sourced rating site's whitelist

Table C.1: Whitelists

D Non-Routable/Reserved IPs

The non-routable IPs referenced in this report come from the list in Table D.1.

Network	Description
0.0.0.0/8	Used for self-identification
10.0.0/8	Reserved for private networks
100.64.0.0/10	Shared Address Space, e.g., Telecom NAT
127.0.0.0/8	Assigned for loopback addresses
169.254.0.0/16	The link local block
172.16.0.0/12	Reserved for private networks
192.0.0.0/24	Reserved for IETF protocol assignments
192.0.2.0/24	Reserved for documentation and example code
192.88.99.0/24	Allocated for use in 6 to 4 anycast
192.168.0.0/16	Reserved for private networks
198.18.0.0/15	Allocated for benchmark tests
198.51.100.0/24	Reserved for documentation and example code
203.0.113.0/24	Reserved for documentation and example code
224.0.0.0/4	Reserved for multicast
240.0.0.0/4	Reserved for future use

Table D.1: Reserved Blocks and Their Uses

Part II

Initial Analysis

E IP-Based Blacklists

E.1 Initial Analysis – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Table E.1: Counts – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_02	35,428,918
list_06	11,376,399
list_08	6,453,622
list_07	5,264,716
list_09	4,071,373
list_15	3,607,338
list_04	1,210,278
list_10	759,569
list_01	9,534
list_12	8,375
list_05	2,128
list_03	1,519
list_13	717

Table E.2: Reverse Counts – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	24,192,826	60.5361%
2	8,982,188	22.4755%
3	3,548,699	8.8797%
4	1,769,772	4.4284%
5	854,623	2.1385%
6	362,385	0.9068%
7	168,314	0.4212%
8	82,860	0.2073%
9	2,593	0.0065%
10	16	0.0000%
11	9	0.0000%

Table E.3: Intersection by Count – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist		Intersection Count
list_06	list_02	8,622,450
list_07	list_08	2,674,041
list_02		
list_06	list_07	1,325,624
list_08	list_02	
list_15	list_06	621,100
list_07	list_08	
list_02		
list_15	list_06	346,480
list_07	list_08	
list_09	list_02	
list_04	list_15	177,293
list_06	list_07	
list_08	list_09	
list_02		
list_10	list_04	84,293
list_15	list_06	
list_07	list_08	
list_09	list_02	
list_10	list_01	2,551
list_04	list_15	
list_06	list_07	
list_08	list_09	
list_02		
list_10	list_04	23
list_15	list_03	
list_06	list_07	
list_08	list_09	
list_02	list_05	
list_10	list_01	9
list_04	list_15	
list_03	list_06	
list_07	list_08	
list_09	list_02	
list_05		

Table E.4: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_07 list_02	95.2851%
list_04 list_08 list_02	57.9364%
list_01 list_07 list_09 list_02	49.4231%
list_01 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	46.0982%
list_01 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	42.0076%
list_01 list_04 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	38.0113%
list_01 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	34.3193%
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	26.7569%
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	1.5142%
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	0.5925%

Table E.5: Distinct Intersections – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Blacklist
list_10	list_13
list_01	list_12
list_01	list_13
list_15	list_13
list_04	list_13
list_12	list_05
list_12	list_03
list_13	list_07
list_13	list_08
list_13	list_03

Table E.6: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_10	19,958
list_12	408
list_13	60
list_03	54
list_02	7
list_05	6
list_04	6
list_01	5
list_07	3
list_08	1
list_06	1
list_15	1
list_09	1

Table E.7: ASN Counts – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_02	20,566
list_09	17,541
list_06	16,663
list_07	16,439
list_08	16,218
list_15	14,233
list_04	13,758
list_10	13,563
list_01	1,831
list_12	1,467
list_05	766
list_03	597
list_13	248

Table E.8: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Countries	
list_01	US	395
	RU	182
	UA	78
	PL	63
	CN	52
list_05	US	226
	GB	31
	CN	28
	RU	24
	DE	22
list_10	US	3,645
	RU	1,446
	UNK	823
	UA	565
	BR	398
list_08	US	3,402
	RU	1,954
	UNK	1,266
	UA	793
	PL	556
list_04	US	2,711
	RU	1,663
	UNK	958
	UA	670
	BR	464
list_13	US	85
	CN	17
	JP	13
	GB	9
	EU	8
list_06	US	4,204
	RU	1,822
	UNK	957
	UA	774
	BR	512
list_02	US	5,089
	RU	2,262
	UNK	1,569
	UA	957
	PL	635
list_15	US	2,712
	RU	1,785
	UNK	1,105
	UA	722
	PL	501
list_07	US	3,547
	RU	1,918
	UNK	1,223
	UA	784
	BR	540
list_09	US	3,850
	RU	1,994
	UNK	1,257
	UA	836
	PL	560
list_03	US	237
	GB	28
	DE	17
	CA	17

Table E.9: ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_09 list_02	16,149
list_07 list_08 list_02	14,610
list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	13,771
list_15 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	12,673
list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	11,604
list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	10,733
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	9,461
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	1,602
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_12 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	405
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	232

Table E.10: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percentage
list_15 list_02	99.7541%
list_09 list_02 list_05	96.3446%
list_07 list_09 list_02 list_05	95.0392%
list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	93.8642%
list_04 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	92.4282%

Table E.10: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Intersection Percentage
list_04 list_15 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	91.5144%
list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	90.6005%
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	89.2950%
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	60.1340%
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	38.8610%

Table E.10: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)**Table E.11:** Active in passive DNS – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Percentage Active
list_03	80.9085
list_05	71.1466
list_01	61.3174
list_04	37.6356
list_06	34.6664
list_09	30.0122
list_15	27.8793
list_08	27.468
list_07	27.3859
list_02	24.5766
list_13	3.48675
list_12	2.77015

Table E.12: Whitelist Intersections

Blacklist	Whitelist	Count	Percent BL	Percent WL
list_09	white_01	15	0.0004%	0.0429%
list_09	white_02	258	0.0063%	0.0472%
list_09	white_03	172	0.0042%	0.0549%
list_09	white_04	3,155	0.0775%	0.3365%

Table E.12: Whitelist Intersections (Continued)

Blacklist	Whitelist	Count	Percent BL	Percent WL
list_09	white_05	3,533	0.0868%	0.4320%
list_09	white_06	131,044	3.2187%	0.3065%
list_09	white_07	893	0.0219%	0.3741%
list_07	white_01	46	0.0009%	0.1314%
list_07	white_02	214	0.0041%	0.0391%
list_07	white_03	70	0.0013%	0.0223%
list_07	white_04	2,104	0.0400%	0.2244%
list_07	white_05	3,763	0.0715%	0.4601%
list_07	white_06	89,341	1.6970%	0.2089%
list_07	white_07	1,246	0.0237%	0.5220%
list_08	white_01	12	0.0002%	0.0343%
list_08	white_02	11	0.0002%	0.0020%
list_08	white_03	5	0.0001%	0.0016%
list_08	white_04	1,350	0.0209%	0.1440%
list_08	white_05	2,955	0.0458%	0.3613%
list_08	white_06	74,190	1.1496%	0.1735%
list_08	white_07	1,062	0.0165%	0.4449%
list_01	white_01	1	0.0105%	0.0029%
list_01	white_02	84	0.8811%	0.0154%
list_01	white_03	181	1.8985%	0.0578%
list_01	white_04	977	10.2475%	0.1042%
list_01	white_05	403	4.2270%	0.0493%
list_01	white_06	4,838	50.7447%	0.0113%
list_01	white_07	164	1.7202%	0.0687%
list_15	white_01	6	0.0002%	0.0171%
list_15	white_02	102	0.0028%	0.0187%
list_15	white_03	11	0.0003%	0.0035%
list_15	white_04	1,446	0.0401%	0.1542%
list_15	white_05	2,467	0.0684%	0.3017%
list_15	white_06	59,838	1.6588%	0.1399%
list_15	white_07	767	0.0213%	0.3213%
list_06	white_01	262	0.0023%	0.7486%
list_06	white_02	717	0.0063%	0.1312%
list_06	white_03	568	0.0050%	0.1814%
list_06	white_04	2,866	0.0252%	0.3056%
list_06	white_05	2,964	0.0261%	0.3624%
list_06	white_06	94,996	0.8350%	0.2222%
list_06	white_07	1,286	0.0113%	0.5388%
list_04	white_01	4	0.0003%	0.0114%
list_04	white_02	110	0.0091%	0.0201%
list_04	white_03	23	0.0019%	0.0073%
list_04	white_04	1,952	0.1613%	0.2082%
list_04	white_05	2,637	0.2179%	0.3225%
list_04	white_06	72,835	6.0180%	0.1703%
list_04	white_07	589	0.0487%	0.2468%
list_05	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_05	white_02	2	0.0940%	0.0004%
list_05	white_03	3	0.1410%	0.0010%
list_05	white_04	5	0.2350%	0.0005%
list_05	white_05	1	0.0470%	0.0001%
list_05	white_06	145	6.8139%	0.0003%
list_05	white_07	0	0.0000%	0.0000%

Table E.12: Whitelist Intersections (Continued)

Blacklist	Whitelist	Count	Percent BL	Percent WL
list_03	white_01	3	0.1975%	0.0086%
list_03	white_02	18	1.1850%	0.0033%
list_03	white_03	7	0.4608%	0.0022%
list_03	white_04	34	2.2383%	0.0036%
list_03	white_05	12	0.7900%	0.0015%
list_03	white_06	258	16.9849%	0.0006%
list_03	white_07	6	0.3950%	0.0025%
list_12	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_12	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_12	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_12	white_04	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_12	white_05	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_12	white_06	2	0.0239%	0.0000%
list_12	white_07	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_04	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_05	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_06	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_07	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_02	white_01	20	0.0001%	0.0571%
list_02	white_02	301	0.0008%	0.0551%
list_02	white_03	58	0.0002%	0.0185%
list_02	white_04	3,053	0.0086%	0.3256%
list_02	white_05	4,898	0.0138%	0.5989%
list_02	white_06	141,680	0.3999%	0.3313%
list_02	white_07	1,759	0.0050%	0.7369%

Table E.12: Whitelist Intersections (Continued)

E.2 Initial Analysis – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Table E.13: Counts – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	30,780,259
feed_10	5,061,378
feed_02	2,315,116
feed_07	32,931
feed_09	11,862
feed_04	2,679

Table E.14: Reverse Counts – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	37,956,666	99.6837%
2	113,895	0.2991%
3	6,432	0.0169%
4	117	0.0003%
5	1	0.0000%

Table E.15: Intersection by Count – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 feed_02	62,125
feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	5,462
feed_03 feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	109

Table E.16: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
feed_02 feed_07	99.8907%
feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	46.0462%
feed_03 feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	0.9189%

Table E.17: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	7,038
feed_09	2
feed_07	0
feed_02	0
feed_04	0
feed_10	0

Table E.18: ASN Counts – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	33,883
feed_02	7,610
feed_07	4,048
feed_09	2,451
feed_04	762
feed_10	158

Table E.19: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Countries
feed_07	US 729
	RU 466
	UA 158
	GB 118
	CN 106
feed_09	US 479
	RU 229
	CN 99
	GB 75
	UNK 74
feed_02	US 1,612
	RU 794
	UA 334
	UNK 278
	GB 214
feed_03	US 10,680
	RU 2,899
	UNK 2,654
	UA 1,156
	DE 945
feed_04	US 191
	RU 53
	DE 41
	NL 32
	UA 31
feed_10	US 33
	RU 21
	UNK 18
	UA 17
	RO 15

Table E.19: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table E.20: ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_02 feed_03	7,420
feed_02 feed_03 feed_07	3,987
feed_02 feed_03 feed_07 feed_09	1,931

Table E.21: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percentage
feed_02 feed_07	99.9259%
feed_02 feed_03 feed_07	98.4931%
feed_02 feed_03 feed_07 feed_09	78.7842%

Table E.22: Active in passive DNS – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Percentage Active
feed_04	86.2262
feed_09	51.2393
feed_07	41.921
feed_02	29.3317
feed_10	1.83061

Table E.23: Whitelist Intersections

Blacklist	Whitelist	Count	Percent BL	Percent WL
feed_03	white_01	1	0.0000%	0.0029%
feed_03	white_02	8	0.0000%	0.0015%
feed_03	white_03	6	0.0000%	0.0019%
feed_03	white_04	101	0.0003%	0.0108%
feed_03	white_05	2,344	0.0076%	0.2866%
feed_03	white_06	65,120	0.2116%	0.1523%
feed_03	white_07	1,079	0.0035%	0.4520%
feed_02	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_02	white_02	9	0.0004%	0.0016%
feed_02	white_03	4	0.0002%	0.0013%
feed_02	white_04	502	0.0217%	0.0535%
feed_02	white_05	286	0.0124%	0.0350%
feed_02	white_06	12,040	0.5201%	0.0282%
feed_02	white_07	24	0.0010%	0.0101%
feed_04	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_04	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_04	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_04	white_04	1	0.0373%	0.0001%
feed_04	white_05	2	0.0747%	0.0002%
feed_04	white_06	106	3.9567%	0.0002%
feed_04	white_07	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_07	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%

Table E.23: Whitelist Intersections (Continued)

Blacklist	Whitelist	Count	Percent BL	Percent WL
feed_07	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_07	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_07	white_04	2	0.0061%	0.0002%
feed_07	white_05	4	0.0121%	0.0005%
feed_07	white_06	253	0.7683%	0.0006%
feed_07	white_07	4	0.0121%	0.0017%
feed_09	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_09	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_09	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_09	white_04	2	0.0169%	0.0002%
feed_09	white_05	4	0.0337%	0.0005%
feed_09	white_06	135	1.1381%	0.0003%
feed_09	white_07	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_10	white_01	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_10	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_10	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_10	white_04	21	0.0004%	0.0022%
feed_10	white_05	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_10	white_06	982	0.0194%	0.0023%
feed_10	white_07	0	0.0000%	0.0000%

Table E.23: Whitelist Intersections (Continued)

E.3 Initial Analysis – 2012 IPs – All Lists

Table E.24: Reverse Counts – 2012 IPs – All Lists

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	42,799,153	66.0519%
2	11,736,822	18.1134%
3	5,216,018	8.0499%
4	2,582,977	3.9863%
5	1,341,547	2.0704%
6	646,923	0.9984%
7	285,919	0.4413%
8	129,623	0.2000%
9	54,218	0.0837%
10	2,825	0.0044%
11	150	0.0002%
12	29	0.0000%
13	4	0.0000%

Table E.25: Intersection by Count – 2012 IPs – All Lists

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 list_02	12,394,156
feed_03 list_06 list_02	3,549,356
feed_03 list_07 list_08 list_02	1,534,591
list_04 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	361,692

Table E.26: ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – All Lists

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_02 list_09	16,984
list_07 list_02 list_08	15,355
list_07 list_02 list_09 list_08	14,484
list_15 list_07 list_02 list_09 list_08	13,305
list_15 list_06 list_07 list_02 list_09 list_08	12,160
list_15 list_06 list_07 list_04 list_02 list_09 list_08	11,244

Table E.26: ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

Blacklist		Intersection Count
list_15	list_06	5,706
list_07	list_04	
list_02	feed_02	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	list_06	3,460
list_07	list_04	
list_02	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	sk.rulez	1,832
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	sk.rulez	756
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
list_01	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	sk.rulez	323
list_05	list_06	
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_01	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	sk.rulez	205
list_05	list_06	
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_03	
list_01	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	sk.rulez	133
list_05	list_06	
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_03	
list_01	feed_02	
feed_04	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	sk.rulez	66
list_05	list_06	
list_12	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
list_03	list_01	
feed_02	feed_04	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		

Table E.26: ASN Intersections by Count – 2012 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

Table E.27: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – All Lists

Blacklist	Intersection Percentage
feed_02 feed_07	99.8828%
list_05 list_02 list_09	96.4646%
list_05 list_07 list_02 list_09	95.2020%
list_05 list_07 list_02 list_09 list_08	94.0657%
list_05 list_07 list_04 list_02 list_09 list_08	92.6768%
list_15 list_05 list_07 list_04 list_02 list_09 list_08	91.7929%
list_15 list_05 list_06 list_07 list_04 list_02 list_09 list_08	90.9091%
list_15 list_05 list_06 list_07 list_04 list_02 feed_02 list_09 list_08	85.6061%
list_15 list_05 list_06 list_07 list_04 list_02 feed_02 feed_07 list_09 list_08	73.3586%
list_15 sk.rulez list_05 list_06 list_07 list_04 list_02 feed_02 feed_07 list_09 list_08	61.2374%
list_15 sk.rulez list_05 list_06 list_07 list_04 list_02 list_03 feed_02 feed_07 list_09 list_08	45.3074%
list_15 sk.rulez list_06 list_12 list_07 list_04 list_02 list_01 feed_02 feed_07 list_09 list_08 list_13	33.7302%

Table E.27: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

Blacklist		Intersection Percentage
list_15	sk.rulez	
list_05	list_06	
list_12	list_07	
list_04	list_02	26.1905%
list_01	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08	list_13	
list_15	sk.rulez	
list_05	list_06	
list_12	list_07	
list_04	list_02	19.0476%
list_03	list_01	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_13		

Table E.27: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2012 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

E.4 Initial Analysis – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Table E.28: Counts – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_02	8,613,338
list_06	2,415,727
list_08	1,294,259
list_09	1,245,542
list_07	1,067,342
list_15	760,187
list_10	516,755
list_04	282,088
list_01	4,858
list_03	3,449
list_12	2,281
list_05	338
list_13	88

Table E.29: Reverse Counts – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	6,879,974	67.7432%
2	1,891,271	18.6223%
3	684,004	6.7350%
4	333,713	3.2859%
5	177,483	1.7476%
6	95,236	0.9377%
7	56,730	0.5586%
8	37,005	0.3644%
9	539	0.0053%
10	4	0.0000%

Table E.30: Intersection by Count – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist		Intersection Count
list_06	list_02	1,605,545
list_06	list_07	468,349
list_02		
list_06	list_07	258,024
list_08	list_02	
list_06	list_07	163,043
list_08	list_09	
list_02		
list_15	list_06	109,471
list_07	list_08	
list_09	list_02	
list_10	list_15	63,118
list_06	list_07	
list_08	list_09	
list_02		
list_10	list_04	37,075
list_15	list_06	
list_07	list_08	
list_09	list_02	
list_10	list_01	452
list_04	list_15	
list_06	list_07	
list_08	list_09	
list_02		
list_01	list_04	1
list_15	list_03	
list_06	list_07	
list_08	list_09	
list_02	list_05	
list_10	list_01	0
list_04	list_12	
list_13	list_03	
list_06	list_07	
list_08	list_09	
list_02		

Table E.31: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_07 list_02	93.6417%
list_04 list_08 list_02	52.3872%
list_04 list_07 list_08 list_02	37.8045%
list_04 list_15 list_07 list_08 list_02	28.0973%
list_04 list_15 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	22.3086%
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_08 list_09 list_02	19.4524%
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	13.1431%
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	9.3042%
list_01 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	0.2959%
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_12 list_13 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	0%

Table E.32: Distinct Intersections – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Blacklist
list_10	list_13
list_01	list_12
list_01	list_13
list_15	list_13
list_04	list_12
list_04	list_13
list_12	list_05
list_13	list_09
list_13	list_07
list_13	list_08
list_13	list_06
list_13	list_02

Table E.33: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_10	12,475
list_03	564
list_12	100
list_13	12
list_04	4
list_02	4
list_05	2
list_01	1
list_08	1
list_06	1
list_15	1
list_07	1
list_09	1

Table E.34: ASN Counts – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_02	17,066
list_09	14,059
list_06	14,057
list_08	12,591
list_07	11,877
list_10	11,728
list_15	10,561
list_04	9,651
list_03	1,022
list_01	827
list_12	612
list_05	215
list_13	47

Table E.35: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Countries
list_01	US 287
	RU 38
	CN 35
	GB 30
	DE 20
list_05	US 62
	CN 16
	GB 10
	TH 8
	TR 8
list_10	US 3,400
	RU 1,089
	UNK 721
	UA 514
	PL 338

Table E.35: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Countries	
list_08	US	2,612
	RU	1,434
	UNK	977
	UA	623
	BR	447
list_04	US	1,982
	RU	1,035
	UNK	633
	UA	474
	PL	320
list_13	US	20
	CN	4
	JP	3
	SY	2
	IT	2
list_06	US	3,521
	RU	1,479
	UNK	862
	UA	664
	PL	431
list_02	US	4,102
	RU	1,877
	UNK	1,340
	UA	837
	BR	574
list_15	US	2,078
	RU	1,217
	UNK	788
	UA	546
	PL	368
list_07	US	2,493
	RU	1,265
	UNK	870
	UA	601
	BR	407
list_09	US	3,028
	RU	1,561
	UNK	1,000
	UA	686
	BR	451
list_03	US	429
	RU	44
	GB	33
	DE	29
	CA	28
list_12	US	200
	JP	33
	DE	23
	KR	23
	EU	22

Table E.35: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table E.36: ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_09 list_02	12,826
list_08 list_09 list_02	11,200
list_06 list_08 list_09 list_02	10,072
list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	9,366
list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	8,633
list_10 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	7,721
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	7,029
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	754
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	288
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_12 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	99

Table E.37: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percentage
list_15 list_02	99.8390%
list_09 list_02 list_05	96.7442%
list_06 list_09 list_02 list_05	95.8140%
list_06 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	95.3488%
list_15 list_06 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	93.4884%
list_04 list_15 list_06 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	92.5581%
list_10 list_04 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	91.6279%
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	90.6977%
list_10 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	71.1628%
list_10 list_01 list_04 list_15 list_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02 list_05	43.7209%

Table E.38: Active in passive DNS – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Percentage Active
list_01	76.8217
list_05	62.1302
list_03	51.6382
list_04	27.7006
list_06	22.9057
list_09	21.7999
list_15	17.6539
list_08	17.2566
list_07	17.2266
list_02	14.8206
list_12	2.89347
list_13	2.27273

Table E.39: Whitelist Intersections

Blacklist	Whitelist	Count	Percent BL	Percent WL
list_09	white_02	23	0.0018%	0.0171%
list_09	white_03	30	0.0024%	0.0162%
list_09	white_06	15,185	1.2191%	0.0996%
list_07	white_02	10	0.0009%	0.0074%
list_07	white_03	25	0.0023%	0.0135%
list_07	white_06	10,641	0.9970%	0.0698%
list_08	white_02	1	0.0001%	0.0007%
list_08	white_03	1	0.0001%	0.0005%
list_08	white_06	8,336	0.6441%	0.0547%
list_01	white_02	15	0.3088%	0.0111%
list_01	white_03	128	2.6348%	0.0693%
list_01	white_06	2,323	47.8180%	0.0152%
list_15	white_02	1	0.0001%	0.0007%
list_15	white_03	1	0.0001%	0.0005%
list_15	white_06	7,228	0.9508%	0.0474%
list_06	white_02	112	0.0046%	0.0831%
list_06	white_03	346	0.0143%	0.1873%
list_06	white_06	24,807	1.0269%	0.1628%
list_04	white_02	3	0.0011%	0.0022%
list_04	white_03	10	0.0035%	0.0054%
list_04	white_06	6,687	2.3705%	0.0439%
list_05	white_02	1	0.2959%	0.0007%
list_05	white_03	1	0.2959%	0.0005%
list_05	white_06	8	2.3669%	0.0001%
list_03	white_02	4	0.1160%	0.0030%
list_03	white_03	2	0.0580%	0.0011%
list_03	white_06	93	2.6964%	0.0006%
list_12	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_12	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_12	white_06	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_13	white_06	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
list_02	white_02	16	0.0002%	0.0119%
list_02	white_03	6	0.0001%	0.0032%
list_02	white_06	17,731	0.2059%	0.1163%

Table E.39: Whitelist Intersections (Continued)

E.5 Initial Analysis – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Table E.40: Counts – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	9,746,783
feed_10	6,024,192
feed_02	1,575,065
feed_07	37,846
feed_09	6,417
feed_04	1,369

Table E.41: Reverse Counts – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	17,325,152	99.8181%
2	28,220	0.1626%
3	3,312	0.0191%
4	36	0.0002%

Table E.42: Intersection by Count – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 feed_02	18,428
feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	3,116
feed_03 feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	24

Table E.43: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
feed_02 feed_09	55.9919%
feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	48.5585%
feed_03 feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	0.3740%

Table E.44: Distinct Intersections – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Blacklist
feed_04	feed_09

Table E.45: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_09	5
feed_07	0
feed_02	0
feed_03	0
feed_04	0
feed_10	0

Table E.46: ASN Counts – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	14,204
feed_02	6,457
feed_07	4,384
feed_09	1,608
feed_04	536
feed_10	120

Table E.47: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Countries	
feed_07	US	774
	RU	512
	UA	170
	GB	127
	UNK	121
feed_09	US	290
	RU	132
	CN	85
	UNK	53
	BR	50
feed_02	US	1,337
	RU	611
	UA	332
	UNK	260
	DE	205
feed_03	US	2,813
	RU	1,752
	UNK	1,207
	UA	712
	BR	522
feed_04	US	148
	RU	45
	DE	29
	UA	27
	GB	24
feed_10	US	30
	RU	17
	UA	15
	RO	11
	UNK	10

Table E.47: Top 5 Countries by ASN – 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table E.48: ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_02 feed_03	4,663
feed_02 feed_03 feed_07	2,701
feed_02 feed_03 feed_07 feed_09	1,155

Table E.49: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percentage
feed_02 feed_04	93.0970%
feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	81.0945%
feed_02 feed_03 feed_07 feed_09	71.8284%

Table E.50: Active in passive DNS – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Percentage Active
feed_04	80.2776
feed_07	40.4931
feed_09	36.0137
feed_02	18.069
feed_10	1.76864

Table E.51: Whitelist Intersections

Blacklist	Whitelist	Count	Percent BL	Percent WL
feed_03	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_03	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_03	white_06	12,141	0.1246%	0.0797%
feed_02	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_02	white_03	2	0.0001%	0.0011%
feed_02	white_06	2,407	0.1528%	0.0158%
feed_04	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_04	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_04	white_06	10	0.7305%	0.0001%
feed_07	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_07	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_07	white_06	52	0.1374%	0.0003%
feed_09	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_09	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_09	white_06	18	0.2805%	0.0001%
feed_10	white_02	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_10	white_03	0	0.0000%	0.0000%
feed_10	white_06	55	0.0009%	0.0004%

Table E.51: Whitelist Intersections (Continued)

E.6 Initial Analysis – 2013 IPs – All Lists

Table E.52: Reverse Counts – 2013 IPs – All Lists

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	17,123,159	74.3910%
2	3,502,662	15.2172%
3	1,266,362	5.5017%
4	543,050	2.3593%
5	272,854	1.1854%
6	147,747	0.6419%
7	80,819	0.3511%
8	49,435	0.2148%
9	30,786	0.1337%
10	875	0.0038%
11	30	0.0001%
12	3	0.0000%

Table E.53: Intersection by Count – 2013 IPs – All Lists

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 list_02	4,060,183
feed_03 list_06 list_02	885,286
feed_03 list_07 list_08 list_02	340,993
feed_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_02	191,151
feed_03 list_06 list_07 list_08 list_09 list_02	120,090
feed_02 list_10 list_04 list_15 list_08 list_09 list_02	2,075

Table E.54: ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – All Lists

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_02 list_09	13,437
list_02 list_09 list_08	11,717
list_06 list_02 list_09 list_08	10,525
list_06 list_07 list_02 list_09 list_08	9,783
list_15 list_06 list_07 list_02 list_09 list_08	9,006

Table E.54: ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

Blacklist		Intersection Count
list_15	list_06	7,869
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	list_06	3,895
list_07	list_04	
list_02	feed_02	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	list_06	2,479
list_07	list_04	
list_02	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	sk.rulez	1,150
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	sk.rulez	407
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
list_03	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	sk.rulez	228
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
list_03	list_01	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	sk.rulez	106
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
list_03	list_01	
feed_02	feed_04	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	sk.rulez	52
list_05	list_06	
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_03	
list_01	feed_02	
feed_04	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	

Table E.54: ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

Blacklist		Intersection Count
list_15	sk.rulez	
list_05	list_06	
list_12	list_07	
list_04	list_02	23
list_03	list_01	
feed_02	feed_04	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		

Table E.54: ASN Intersections by Count – 2013 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

Table E.55: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – All Lists

Blacklist		Intersection Percentage
list_15	list_02	99.8462%
list_05	list_02	96.9697%
list_09		
list_05	list_06	96.1039%
list_02	list_09	
list_05	list_06	95.6710%
list_02	list_09	
list_08		
list_05	list_06	93.9394%
list_04	list_02	
list_09	list_08	
list_05	list_06	93.0736%
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	list_05	90.4762%
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	list_05	85.2814%
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
feed_02	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	list_05	79.6537%
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	list_05	66.6667%
list_06	list_07	
list_04	list_02	
list_03	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		

Table E.55: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

Blacklist		Intersection Percentage
list_15	sk.rulez	
list_05	list_06	
list_07	list_04	54.1126%
list_02	list_03	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_15	sk.rulez	
list_05	list_06	
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_03	39.8268%
list_01	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08		
list_15	sk.rulez	
list_06	list_12	
list_07	list_04	
list_02	list_03	34.6939%
list_01	feed_02	
feed_07	list_09	
list_08	list_13	
list_15	sk.rulez	
list_05	list_06	
list_12	list_07	
list_04	list_02	24.4898%
list_03	list_01	
feed_02	feed_07	
list_09	list_08	
list_13		

Table E.55: ASN Intersections by Percent – 2013 IPs – All Lists (Continued)

F Domain-Based Blacklists

F.1 Initial Analysis – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Table F.1: Counts – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_16	2,654,074
list_03	341,674
list_05	291,220
list_13	211,248
list_12	193,555
list_04	15,220

Table F.2: Reverse Counts – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2,441,996	82.7289%
2	309,676	10.4911%
3	158,167	5.3583%
4	38,809	1.3148%
5	3,030	0.1026%
6	126	0.0043%

Table F.3: Intersection by Count – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_05 list_03	68,820
list_05 list_16 list_03	14,015
list_05 list_13 list_16 list_03	702

Table F.4: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_04 list_05	35.2760%
list_04 list_05 list_03	20.2300%
list_04 list_05 list_16 list_03	3.6859%

Table F.5: Google Safe Browsing – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
list_16	37,597	1.4166%
list_05	10,319	3.5434%
list_03	8,000	2.3414%
list_12	3,396	1.7545%
list_13	2,226	1.0537%
list_04	586	3.8502%

Table F.6: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	TLDs	
list_04	com	5,227
	ru	4,424
	info	1,339
	net	1,280
	in	321
list_13	com	153,920
	org	19,055
	net	12,942
	info	10,077
	ru	2,975
list_05	com	187,693
	info	60,705
	ru	51,075
	net	26,451
	in	18,353
list_03	com	160,657
	info	61,922
	ru	23,770
	in	21,213
	net	19,757
list_12	com	148,719
	net	13,936
	org	11,810
	info	3,169
	us	1,661
list_16	com	1,866,964
	org	236,627
	info	149,528
	net	138,601
	in	48,441

Table F.6: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)**Table F.7:** Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_13	www	49
	com	36
	blogspot	26
	co	24
	google	23
list_04	inbound	9
	mail2	6
	mail3	5
	mx2	4
	pop	4

Table F.7: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_05	nikolatesla	18
	l2all	14
	kvdiffusions	14
	murl	13
	trydoctors	12
list_03	www	896
	email	68
	click	55
	google	44
	images	44
list_12	www	122
	google	52
	blogspot	21
	co	15
	state	14

Table F.7: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

Table F.8: Active in passive DNS – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Percentage
list_12	94.5287%
list_13	92.0274%
list_04	88.9159%
list_05	87.8806%
list_16	87.5718%
list_03	87.5639%

Table F.9: Name servers and Domains – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Number of Domains	Percentage of Domains	Number of NS	Avg NS per Domain	Avg Domains per NS
list_16	2,398,180	86.7231	733,140	3.4176	11.1795
list_03	307,472	86.8342	207,608	4.4252	6.5539
list_05	265,080	64.5182	207,137	4.6222	5.9152
list_12	187,800	96.8426	130,131	3.6899	5.3251
list_13	200,320	93.9292	121,610	3.7458	6.1703
list_04	13,867	91.1104	17,182	4.5257	3.6525

Table F.10: Top 5 Name servers – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Name servers	
list_04	name-services.com	5,930
	registrar-servers.com	5,233
	monikerdns.net	3,444
	canadajob.ru	1,460
	domaincontrol.com	1,100

Table F.10: Top 5 Name servers – 2012 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Name servers	
list_13	domaincontrol.com	65,761
	registrar-servers.com	56,640
	name-services.com	46,680
	monikerdns.net	36,792
	worldnic.com	24,891
list_05	registrar-servers.com	250,747
	name-services.com	141,630
	monikerdns.net	107,855
	domaincontrol.com	38,487
	name.com	11,632
list_03	registrar-servers.com	380,062
	name-services.com	138,957
	monikerdns.net	132,173
	domaincontrol.com	43,029
	domainsite.com	14,845
list_12	domaincontrol.com	58,928
	name-services.com	25,745
	dnsmadeeasy.com	19,660
	registrar-servers.com	15,162
	worldnic.com	12,876
list_16	domaincontrol.com	960,283
	registrar-servers.com	585,569
	name-services.com	451,394
	worldnic.com	226,175
	monikerdns.net	190,309

Table F.10: Top 5 Name servers – 2012 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

F.2 Initial Analysis – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Table F.11: Counts – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	11,219,857
feed_05	30,488
feed_04	3,665
feed_01	480

Table F.12: Reverse Counts – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	11,244,674	99.9591%
2	3,996	0.0355%
3	608	0.0054%

Table F.13: Intersection by Count – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 feed_04	1,070

Table F.14: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
feed_03 feed_01	32.5000%

Table F.15: Google Safe Browsing – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
feed_05	9,107	29.8708%
feed_03	4,348	0.0388%
feed_04	1,284	35.0341%
feed_01	13	2.7083%

Table F.16: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	TLDs	
feed_03	bo	190,488
	lc	190,467
	ag	190,454
	tw	190,396
	hn	189,872
feed_01	com	193
	ru	131
	in	35
	net	34
	info	13

Table F.16: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Blacklist	TLDs	
feed_04	com	1,228
	tk	353
	ru	307
	net	289
	br	226
feed_05	com	12,240
	ru	4,233
	info	2,525
	net	2,044
	org	1,855

Table F.16: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Table F.17: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Hostname	
feed_03	www	427
	www2	118
	www1	109
	ns7	47
	ns2	46
feed_01	www	25
	zxr0	2
	ae-21-70	2
	to3rta7nol	1
	yandex2012	1
feed_04	www	351
	img	34
	4	23
	ftp	16
	a	13
feed_05	4	19
	img	18
	ftp	12
	ad	12
	update	11

Table F.17: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Table F.18: Active in passive DNS – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Percentage
feed_04	41.6279%
feed_05	36.7023%
feed_01	31.9767%
feed_06	18.1615%
feed_03	0.43991%

Table F.19: Name servers and Domains – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Number of Domains	Percentage of Domains	Number of NS	Avg NS per Domain	Avg Domains per NS
feed_05	2,345	7.6916	5,541	4.8162	2.0383
feed_03	2,033	0.0181	4,431	4.4929	2.0614
feed_04	447	12.1965	1,927	5.7584	1.3358
feed_01	19	3.9583	71	5.0000	1.3380

Table F.20: Top 5 Name servers – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Name servers	
feed_03	domaincontrol.com	182
	registrar-servers.com	180
	freedns.ws	140
	mars.orderbox-dns.com	135
	earth.orderbox-dns.com	135
feed_01	oininers.ru	9
	cnmsn.com	8
	hosting.com	6
	nic-reg-dns.com	5
	naunet.ru	4
feed_04	registrar-servers.com	57
	domaincontrol.com	50
	ceredinopl.ru	44
	analunakis.ru	44
	lemonadiom.ru	44
feed_05	domaincontrol.com	418
	registrar-servers.com	207
	name-services.com	200
	monikerdns.net	192
	above.com	158

Table F.20: Top 5 Name servers – 2012 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

F.3 Initial Analysis – 2012 Domains – All Lists

Table F.21: Reverse Counts – 2012 Domains – All Lists

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	13,680,233	96.6043%
2	314,570	2.2214%
3	159,025	1.1230%
4	3,933	0.0278%
5	3,186	0.0225%
6	156	0.0011%
7	5	0.0000%

Table F.22: Top TLDs – 2012 Domains – All Lists

TLD	Count
com	2,582,192
info	322,232
org	317,119
net	245,623
ru	217,613
tw	192,848
in	192,440
ag	190,668
bo	190,620
pe	190,525

Table F.23: Top Hostnames – 2012 Domains – All Lists

Hostname	Count
www	16,892
2fwww	604
email	534
mail	503
click	381
google	372
a	346
support	318
images	312
co	274

F.4 Initial Analysis – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Table F.24: Counts – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_03	999,640
list_16	883,544
list_05	101,313
list_13	48,976
list_12	39,622
list_04	4,468

Table F.25: Reverse Counts – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	550,715	70.7642%
2	183,690	23.6033%
3	40,644	5.2226%
4	3,065	0.3938%
5	126	0.0162%

Table F.26: Intersection by Count – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_16 list_03	290,637
list_05 list_16 list_03	46,301
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03	7,062

Table F.27: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_04 list_03	95.9714%
list_05 list_04 list_03	90.0179%
list_05 list_16 list_04 list_03	81.4235%

Table F.28: Google Safe Browsing – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
list_16	10,022	1.1343%
list_03	9,454	0.9457%
list_05	2,660	2.6255%
list_12	501	1.2644%
list_13	375	0.7657%
list_04	35	0.7833%

Table F.29: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	TLDs	
list_04	com	2,514
	ru	710
	net	357
	info	269
	mobi	195
list_13	com	37,032
	org	4,300
	net	3,206
	info	1,477
	uk	577
list_05	com	63,320
	ru	13,421
	info	12,768
	net	10,359
	us	5,366
list_03	com	614,135
	org	60,123
	net	48,794
	info	46,873
	ru	45,707
list_12	com	31,019
	net	2,817
	org	2,165
	info	411
	edu	320
list_16	com	648,847
	org	84,302
	net	44,974
	info	26,742
	uk	11,793

Table F.29: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)**Table F.30:** Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_13	blogspot	12
	www	10
	google	9
	facebook	6
	expedia	5
list_04	narkop	4
	doctorcoll	2
	atopyear	2
	doctorbutt	2
	775hiphop	2

Table F.30: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_05	www	27
	narkop	21
	liferc	19
	swimpool	14
	rus-sexy	12
list_03	www	15,025
	2fwww	602
	email	494
	mail	403
	click	367
list_12	www	20
	google	17
	cartoonnetwork	11
	blogspot	10
	assoc-amazon	5

Table F.30: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

Table F.31: Active in passive DNS – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Percentage
list_12	94.5287%
list_13	92.0274%
list_04	88.9159%
list_05	87.8806%
list_16	87.5718%
list_03	87.5639%

Table F.32: Name servers and Domains – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Number of Domains	Percentage of Domains	Number of NS	Avg NS per Domain	Avg Domains per NS
list_03	637,994	60.7234	254,874	2.8155	7.0476
list_16	732,333	80.9578	243,430	2.7519	8.2787
list_05	53,835	42.5906	33,296	3.5277	5.7038
list_12	38,454	96.9469	32,613	3.1628	3.7293
list_13.	43,593	88.4347	32,566	3.1885	4.2681
list_04	3,065	68.5989	1,671	4.1504	7.6128

Table F.33: Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklist	Name servers	
list_04	name-services.com	5,855
	registrar-servers.com	3,288
	monikerdns.net	330
	name.com	124
	freedns.ws	72

Table F.33: Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Name servers	
list_13	domaincontrol.com	10,342
	name-services.com	8,480
	worldnic.com	4,952
	dnsmadeeasy.com	4,564
	registrar-servers.com	3,936
list_05	name-services.com	46,228
	registrar-servers.com	33,546
	monikerdns.net	4,920
	topdns.com	4,113
	dnspod.net	3,662
list_03	domaincontrol.com	146,120
	name-services.com	89,484
	worldnic.com	69,133
	registrar-servers.com	55,972
	dnsmadeeasy.com	37,213
list_16	domaincontrol.com	240,717
	name-services.com	107,835
	worldnic.com	81,024
	registrar-servers.com	55,876
	dnsmadeeasy.com	46,368
list_12	domaincontrol.com	7,767
	dnsmadeeasy.com	5,794
	akam.net	3,358
	name-services.com	2,342
	worldnic.com	2,082

Table F.33: Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – DNSBL (Continued)

F.5 Initial Analysis – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Table F.34: Counts – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	6,189,675
feed_05	21,985
feed_06	4,482
feed_04	1,720
feed_01	172

Table F.35: Reverse Counts – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	6,203,166	99.8823%
2	7,065	0.1138%
3	245	0.0039%
4	1	0.0000%

Table F.36: Intersection by Count – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 feed_05	6,409
feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	143

Table F.37: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
feed_01 feed_05	66.2791%
feed_01 feed_03 feed_05	21.5116%

Table F.38: Google Safe Browsing – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
feed_05	9,000	40.9370%
feed_03	6,899	0.1115%
feed_06	400	8.9246%
feed_04	383	22.2674%
feed_01	9	5.2326%

Table F.39: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	TLDs	
feed_06	com	2,009
	ru	428
	net	290
	kr	228
	cn	193

Table F.39: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Blacklist	TLDs	
feed_03	ag	105,136
	pe	104,656
	tw	104,544
	bo	104,487
	hn	104,431
feed_01	com	48
	ru	37
	in	15
	net	15
	eu	9
feed_04	com	648
	ru	176
	br	175
	net	160
	tk	85
feed_05	com	7,461
	ru	3,559
	net	1,927
	info	1,846
	org	1,779

Table F.39: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Table F.40: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Hostname	
feed_06	www	898
	upload	109
	down	105
	a	55
	download	51
feed_03	www	536
	ns2	174
	emergency	126
	www2	124
	17	123
feed_01	www	9
	zxr0	2
	ae-21-70	2
	doliv777	1
	zaebiz	1
feed_04	www	237
	4	22
	download	10
	img	9
	6	6

Table F.40: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Blacklist	Hostname	
feed_05	a	81
	4	24
	img	19
	papesgames	15
	update	15

Table F.40: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Table F.41: Active in passive DNS – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Percentage
feed_04	41.6279%
feed_05	36.7023%
feed_01	31.9767%
feed_06	18.1615%
feed_03	0.43991%

Table F.42: Name servers and Domains – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Number of Domains	Percentage of Domains	Number of NS	Avg NS per Domain	Avg Domains per NS
feed_03	36,897	0.5961	13,181	2.5992	7.2757
feed_05	9,345	42.5043	7,635	2.7042	3.3099
feed_06	870	19.4110	1,584	2.9322	1.6105
feed_04	692	40.2326	980	2.8497	2.0122
feed_01	70	40.6977	82	2.2714	1.9390

Table F.43: Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklist	Name servers	
feed_06	needhed.com	156
	kamisca.com	150
	domaincontrol.com	118
	name-services.com	64
	boomsco.com	54
feed_03	conficker-sinkhole.net	15,239
	conficker-sinkhole.org	15,239
	conficker-sinkhole.com	15,239
	conficker-sinkhole.cn	4,201
	ee28.cn	2,744
feed_01	microsoftinternetsafety.net	36
	oversee-228-manage.net	14
	yahoo.com	10
	masterhost.ru	9
	jino.ru	8
feed_04	name.com	128
	registrar-servers.com	67
	pipni.cz	65
	name-services.com	65
	directwebhosts.com	56

Table F.43: Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

Blacklist	Name servers	
feed_05	domaincontrol.com	1,585
	registrar-servers.com	1,100
	above.com	538
	needhed.com	492
	ee28.cn	458

Table F.43: Top 5 Name servers – 2013 Domains – Feeds (Continued)

F.6 Initial Analysis – 2013 Domains – All Lists

Table F.44: Reverse Counts – 2013 Domains – All Lists

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	7,516,207	95.6611%
2	258,820	3.2941%
3	67,426	0.8582%
4	13,870	0.1765%
5	790	0.0101%
6	7	0.0001%

Table F.45: Top TLDs – 2013 Domains – All Lists

TLD	Count
com	1,436,783
org	170,208
ru	128,864
net	127,611
info	108,383
tw	105,703
ag	105,334
pe	105,038
bo	104,621
hn	104,499

Table F.46: Top Hostnames – 2013 Domains – All Lists

Hostname	Count
www	16,892
2fwww	604
email	534
mail	503
click	381
google	372
a	346
support	318
images	312
co	274

Part III

Extended Analysis

Using the passive DNS database, the data in both the IP sets and the Domain sets were expanded by one step. For more on indicator expansion, see [4]. The resulting IPs and Domains are examined in a fashion similar to the methods in II.

G IPs to Domain (ID)

G.1 Initial Analysis – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Table G.1: Counts – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_02	156,784,689
list_06	47,234,048
list_08	30,903,237
list_09	20,185,117
list_04	13,183,731
list_07	12,531,786
list_10	11,300,518
list_15	8,046,898
list_05	4,862,757
list_12	849,656
list_13	742,682
list_03	508,406
list_01	306,898

Table G.2: Reverse Counts – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	163,502,488	77.1774%
2	31,006,423	14.6358%
3	5,433,562	2.5648%
4	3,681,132	1.7376%
5	2,973,937	1.4038%
6	1,966,187	0.9281%
7	2,123,193	1.0022%
8	1,127,653	0.5323%
9	33,737	0.0159%
10	3,728	0.0018%
11	780	0.0004%

Table G.3: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
list_09	list_05	91,980
list_09	list_02	11,728,080
list_10	list_09	7,667,933
list_10	list_07	5,009,302
list_10	list_08	5,099,246
list_10	list_01	180,204

Table G.3: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
list_10	list_15	5,318,742
list_10	list_06	4,454,969
list_10	list_04	6,346,579
list_10	list_05	29,359
list_10	list_03	86,587
list_10	list_12	128
list_10	list_13	10
list_10	list_02	7,613,055
list_07	list_09	8,204,526
list_07	list_08	5,562,184
list_07	list_05	43,320
list_07	list_02	9,080,840
list_08	list_09	5,883,711
list_08	list_05	193,358
list_08	list_02	30,574,530
list_01	list_09	116,927
list_01	list_07	217,385
list_01	list_08	69,573
list_01	list_15	40,868
list_01	list_06	125,646
list_01	list_04	65,711
list_01	list_05	1,281
list_01	list_03	839
list_01	list_12	4
list_01	list_13	3
list_01	list_02	119,576
list_15	list_09	5,234,612
list_15	list_07	4,982,193
list_15	list_08	6,529,791
list_15	list_06	4,384,772
list_15	list_05	28,585
list_15	list_03	22,928
list_15	list_12	116
list_15	list_13	23
list_15	list_02	7,931,558
list_06	list_09	6,724,714
list_06	list_07	5,565,977
list_06	list_08	5,160,091
list_06	list_05	52,962
list_06	list_02	10,272,912
list_04	list_09	7,812,598
list_04	list_07	4,813,815
list_04	list_08	4,899,193
list_04	list_15	4,504,030
list_04	list_06	4,319,582
list_04	list_05	102,679
list_04	list_03	37,056
list_04	list_12	146
list_04	list_13	13
list_04	list_02	7,903,853
list_03	list_09	107,488
list_03	list_07	47,744
list_03	list_08	16,763
list_03	list_06	37,796

Table G.3: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
list_03	list_05	194,045
list_03	list_02	104,851
list_12	list_09	313
list_12	list_07	142
list_12	list_08	235
list_12	list_06	353
list_12	list_05	25
list_12	list_03	6,225
list_12	list_13	3
list_12	list_02	1,081
list_13	list_09	31
list_13	list_07	20
list_13	list_08	40
list_13	list_06	15
list_13	list_05	0
list_13	list_03	0
list_13	list_02	46
list_02	list_05	484,734

Table G.3: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.4: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
list_09	list_05	1.8915%
list_09	list_02	58.1026%
list_10	list_09	67.8547%
list_10	list_07	44.3281%
list_10	list_08	45.1240%
list_10	list_01	58.7179%
list_10	list_15	66.0968%
list_10	list_06	39.4227%
list_10	list_04	56.1618%
list_10	list_05	0.6038%
list_10	list_03	17.0311%
list_10	list_12	0.0151%
list_10	list_13	0.0013%
list_10	list_02	67.3691%
list_07	list_09	65.4697%
list_07	list_08	44.3846%
list_07	list_05	0.8909%
list_07	list_02	72.4625%
list_08	list_09	29.1488%
list_08	list_05	3.9763%
list_08	list_02	98.9363%
list_01	list_09	38.0996%
list_01	list_07	70.8330%
list_01	list_08	22.6697%
list_01	list_15	13.3165%
list_01	list_06	40.9406%
list_01	list_04	21.4113%
list_01	list_05	0.4174%

Table G.4: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
list_01	list_03	0.2734%
list_01	list_12	0.0013%
list_01	list_13	0.0010%
list_01	list_02	38.9628%
list_15	list_09	65.0513%
list_15	list_07	61.9145%
list_15	list_08	81.1467%
list_15	list_06	54.4902%
list_15	list_05	0.5878%
list_15	list_03	4.5098%
list_15	list_12	0.0137%
list_15	list_13	0.0031%
list_15	list_02	98.5667%
list_06	list_09	33.3152%
list_06	list_07	44.4149%
list_06	list_08	16.6976%
list_06	list_05	1.0891%
list_06	list_02	21.7490%
list_04	list_09	59.2594%
list_04	list_07	38.4128%
list_04	list_08	37.1609%
list_04	list_15	55.9723%
list_04	list_06	32.7645%
list_04	list_05	2.1115%
list_04	list_03	7.2887%
list_04	list_12	0.0172%
list_04	list_13	0.0018%
list_04	list_02	59.9516%
list_03	list_09	21.1422%
list_03	list_07	9.3909%
list_03	list_08	3.2972%
list_03	list_06	7.4342%
list_03	list_05	38.1673%
list_03	list_02	20.6235%
list_12	list_09	0.0368%
list_12	list_07	0.0167%
list_12	list_08	0.0277%
list_12	list_06	0.0415%
list_12	list_05	0.0029%
list_12	list_03	1.2244%
list_12	list_13	0.0004%
list_12	list_02	0.1272%
list_13	list_09	0.0042%
list_13	list_07	0.0027%
list_13	list_08	0.0054%
list_13	list_06	0.0020%
list_13	list_05	0.0000%
list_13	list_03	0.0000%
list_13	list_02	0.0062%
list_02	list_05	9.9683%

Table G.4: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.5: Google Safe Browsing – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
list_02	486,658	0.3104%
list_09	240,240	1.1902%
list_07	177,222	1.4142%
list_08	140,707	0.4553%
list_06	139,731	0.2958%
list_04	95,688	0.7258%
list_10	51,224	0.4533%
list_15	49,012	0.6091%
list_05	24,375	0.5013%
list_03	3,170	0.6235%
list_01	2,769	0.9023%
list_12	187	0.0220%
list_13	1	0.0001%

Table G.6: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	TLD	
list_04	com	5,227
	ru	4,424
	info	1,339
	net	1,280
	in	321
list_13	com	153,920
	org	19,055
	net	12,942
	info	10,077
	ru	2,975
list_05	com	187,693
	info	60,705
	ru	51,075
	net	26,451
	in	18,353
list_03	com	160,657
	info	61,922
	ru	23,770
	in	21,213
	net	19,757
list_12	com	148,719
	net	13,936
	org	11,810
	info	3,169
	us	1,661
list_16	com	1,866,964
	org	236,627
	info	149,528
	net	138,601
	in	48,441

Table G.6: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.7: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_01	mail	107,218
	www	39,655
	smtp	36,593
	pop3	2,936
	ns1	2,223
list_05	www	115,106
	mail	4,021
	blog	3,802
	ns1	2,535
	ns2	1,601
list_06	www	1,440,949
	mail	685,649
	daily	183,427
	triband-mum-59	78,812
	ns	68,977
list_04	www	1,563,313
	mail	342,616
	ns1	66,304
	ns2	51,427
	ns	48,179
list_13	pending	215
	www	68
	mail	8
	ns2	5
	ns1	5
list_08	www	839,104
	mail	202,775
	ns1	44,990
	ns2	32,840
	triband-mum-120	32,617
list_15	www	488,882
	mail	116,749
	ns1	29,801
	ns2	22,824
	ns	16,377
list_02	www	7,250,805
	pc	1,074,999
	mail	496,175
	mx	349,507
	inbound	257,341
list_07	www	1,062,359
	mail	615,005
	mailserver	185,722
	ns	64,992
	ns1	55,786

Table G.7: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_03	www	95,287
	mail	2,499
	ns1	907
	ns2	639
	click	564
list_09	www	1,967,624
	mail	623,218
	ns1	130,124
	ns	101,798
	ns2	83,660
list_12	68	220,764
	23	90,773
	70	89,695
	98	81,374
	220	52,688

Table G.7: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.8: Average Number of Domains – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Average
list_13	29707.6000
list_12	3694.1652
list_05	3218.5893
list_03	433.7425
list_01	80.9748
list_06	51.8158
list_04	30.4013
list_02	21.3696
list_08	18.1110
list_09	17.5759
list_07	10.0422
list_15	8.7300

Table G.9: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2012 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	IP Addresses	
list_01	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502
list_05	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502

Table G.9: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	IP Addresses	
list_06	66.96.250.117	1,065,671
	66.96.249.133	954,666
	1.1.1.1	837,060
	1.0.0.0	742,531
	85.25.153.99	685,160
list_08	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	208.91.197.27	1,834,920
	62.116.181.25	1,692,380
list_04	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502
list_13	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502
list_15	66.96.249.133	954,666
	1.1.1.1	837,060
	1.0.0.0	742,531
	85.25.153.99	685,160
	184.164.148.250	493,749
list_02	204.236.147.150	38,216,842
	46.51.137.8	29,697,562
	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	74.125.224.111	11,133,751
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
list_07	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502
list_09	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	208.91.197.27	1,834,920
	62.116.181.25	1,692,380
list_03	66.96.250.117	1,065,671
	66.96.249.133	954,666
	1.1.1.1	837,060
	1.0.0.0	742,531
	85.25.153.99	685,160
list_12	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502

Table G.9: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2012 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

G.2 Initial Analysis – 2012 ID – Feeds

Table G.10: Counts – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_02	171,358,797
feed_04	20,685,086
feed_03	6,868,306
feed_10	5,483,784
feed_07	1,027,937
feed_09	790,265

Table G.11: Reverse Counts – 2012 ID – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	152,802,887	85.3767%
2	25,113,857	14.0321%
3	1,050,045	0.5867%
4	7,462	0.0042%
5	705	0.0004%
6	11	0.0000%

Table G.12: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
feed_03	feed_02	1,664,044
feed_03	feed_04	295,724
feed_03	feed_07	8,015
feed_03	feed_09	6,506
feed_03	feed_10	10,015
feed_02	feed_04	20,441,989
feed_02	feed_07	1,027,526
feed_02	feed_09	756,959
feed_02	feed_10	3,338,846
feed_04	feed_07	2,242
feed_04	feed_09	1,086
feed_04	feed_10	11,864
feed_07	feed_09	745,332
feed_07	feed_10	4,455
feed_09	feed_10	1,376

Table G.12: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2012 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Table G.13: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
feed_03	feed_02	24.2279%
feed_03	feed_04	4.3056%
feed_03	feed_07	0.7797%
feed_03	feed_09	0.8233%
feed_03	feed_10	0.1826%

Table G.13: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
feed_02	feed_04	98.8248%
feed_02	feed_07	99.9600%
feed_02	feed_09	95.7855%
feed_02	feed_10	60.8858%
feed_04	feed_07	0.2181%
feed_04	feed_09	0.1374%
feed_04	feed_10	0.2163%
feed_07	feed_09	94.3142%
feed_07	feed_10	0.4334%
feed_09	feed_10	0.1741%

Table G.13: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Table G.14: Google Safe Browsing – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
feed_02	2,678,530	1.5631%
feed_03	46,283	0.6739%
feed_10	34,140	0.6226%
feed_07	5,366	0.5220%
feed_09	1,399	0.1770%

Table G.15: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	TLD	Count
feed_03	bo	190,488
	lc	190,467
	ag	190,454
	tw	190,396
	hn	189,872
feed_01	com	193
	ru	131
	in	35
	net	34
	info	13
feed_04	com	1,228
	tk	353
	ru	307
	net	289
	br	226
feed_05	com	12,240
	ru	4,233
	info	2,525
	net	2,044
	org	1,855

Table G.15: Top 5 TLDs – 2012 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Table G.16: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Hostname	
feed_07	www	29,264
	ns1	9,744
	mail	9,269
	ns2	8,632
	ns3	3,775
feed_09	www	14,119
	ns1	8,025
	ns2	6,884
	a	4,590
	mail	4,579
feed_02	www	24,521,865
	pc	1,079,905
	mail	931,674
	mx	362,476
	ns1	253,261
feed_03	www	579,769
	68	222,130
	23	91,977
	70	91,274
	98	82,753
feed_04	www	3,884,055
	pc	1,023,668
	ww35	83,652
	mail	53,871
	rm	46,278
feed_10	www	113,340
	ns1	28,535
	ns2	24,157
	a	7,287
	mail	6,502

Table G.16: Top 5 Hostnames – 2012 ID – Feeds (Continued)**Table G.17:** Average Number of Domains – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Average
feed_04	9475.2113
feed_02	329.1964
feed_09	130.2270
feed_07	74.6299
feed_10	63.3000
feed_03	2.8413

Table G.18: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2012 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	IP Addresses	
feed_07	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502
feed_09	85.25.153.99	685,160
	46.45.128.3	18,820
	65.49.42.138	3,668
	174.143.169.191	3,203
	65.98.72.34	2,808
feed_02	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502
feed_03	1.1.1.1	837,060
	1.0.0.0	742,531
	85.25.153.99	685,160
	188.40.70.27	214,520
	98.139.135.22	210,702
feed_04	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	208.91.197.27	1,834,920
	62.116.181.25	1,692,380
	204.13.162.123	1,396,283
	208.87.35.107	1,199,078
feed_10	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	64.202.189.170	4,230,919
	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	202.172.26.11	2,871,502

Table G.18: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2012 ID – Feeds (Continued)

G.3 Initial Analysis – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Table G.19: Counts – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_02	76,674,685
list_06	18,156,017
list_03	5,776,389
list_09	5,625,291
list_08	4,957,101
list_04	2,953,241
list_07	2,314,803
list_10	2,018,884
list_15	1,804,374
list_12	837,208
list_01	193,150
list_05	167,577
list_13	2

Table G.20: Reverse Counts – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	93,081,090	90.6032%
2	5,811,039	5.6563%
3	1,458,859	1.4200%
4	990,334	0.9640%
5	537,824	0.5235%
6	383,993	0.3738%
7	335,425	0.3265%
8	130,347	0.1269%
9	5,938	0.0058%
10	37	0.0000%

Table G.21: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
list_09	list_05	8,014
list_09	list_02	2,605,783
list_10	list_09	590,804
list_10	list_07	308,838
list_10	list_08	367,578
list_10	list_01	20,857
list_10	list_15	276,591
list_10	list_06	388,893
list_10	list_04	389,211
list_10	list_05	1,460
list_10	list_03	5,414
list_10	list_12	25
list_10	list_13	0
list_10	list_02	485,615
list_07	list_09	1,335,193
list_07	list_08	1,028,656
list_07	list_05	2,127
list_07	list_02	1,576,906

Table G.21: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
list_08	list_09	1,299,369
list_08	list_05	144,711
list_08	list_02	4,815,500
list_01	list_09	36,114
list_01	list_07	26,742
list_01	list_08	30,239
list_01	list_15	28,323
list_01	list_06	58,854
list_01	list_04	34,179
list_01	list_05	557
list_01	list_03	339
list_01	list_12	0
list_01	list_13	0
list_01	list_02	34,884
list_15	list_09	1,422,350
list_15	list_07	1,104,977
list_15	list_08	993,925
list_15	list_06	709,279
list_15	list_05	827
list_15	list_03	10,036
list_15	list_12	67
list_15	list_13	0
list_15	list_02	1,791,525
list_06	list_09	2,020,103
list_06	list_07	973,064
list_06	list_08	1,039,285
list_06	list_05	5,460
list_06	list_02	1,914,425
list_04	list_09	1,960,430
list_04	list_07	1,111,918
list_04	list_08	985,140
list_04	list_15	1,274,638
list_04	list_06	1,044,811
list_04	list_05	5,589
list_04	list_03	15,976
list_04	list_12	94
list_04	list_13	0
list_04	list_02	1,847,016
list_03	list_09	36,063
list_03	list_07	16,912
list_03	list_08	349,929
list_03	list_06	26,256
list_03	list_05	151,782
list_03	list_02	472,406
list_12	list_09	191
list_12	list_07	70
list_12	list_08	126
list_12	list_06	106
list_12	list_05	1
list_12	list_03	837,076
list_12	list_13	0
list_12	list_02	567
list_13	list_09	0
list_13	list_07	0

Table G.21: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
list_13	list_08	0
list_13	list_06	0
list_13	list_05	0
list_13	list_03	0
list_13	list_02	0
list_02	list_05	152,633

Table G.21: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.22: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
list_09	list_05	4.7823%
list_09	list_02	46.3226%
list_10	list_09	29.2639%
list_10	list_07	15.2975%
list_10	list_08	18.2070%
list_10	list_01	10.7983%
list_10	list_15	15.3289%
list_10	list_06	19.2628%
list_10	list_04	19.2785%
list_10	list_05	0.8712%
list_10	list_03	0.2682%
list_10	list_12	0.0030%
list_10	list_13	0.0000%
list_10	list_02	24.0536%
list_07	list_09	57.6806%
list_07	list_08	44.4382%
list_07	list_05	1.2693%
list_07	list_02	68.1227%
list_08	list_09	26.2123%
list_08	list_05	86.3549%
list_08	list_02	97.1435%
list_01	list_09	18.6974%
list_01	list_07	13.8452%
list_01	list_08	15.6557%
list_01	list_15	14.6637%
list_01	list_06	30.4706%
list_01	list_04	17.6956%
list_01	list_05	0.3324%
list_01	list_03	0.1755%
list_01	list_12	0.0000%
list_01	list_13	0.0000%
list_01	list_02	18.0606%
list_15	list_09	78.8279%
list_15	list_07	61.2388%
list_15	list_08	55.0842%
list_15	list_06	39.3089%
list_15	list_05	0.4935%
list_15	list_03	0.5562%
list_15	list_12	0.0080%
list_15	list_13	0.0000%

Table G.22: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
list_15	list_02	99.2879%
list_06	list_09	35.9111%
list_06	list_07	42.0366%
list_06	list_08	20.9656%
list_06	list_05	3.2582%
list_06	list_02	10.5443%
list_04	list_09	66.3823%
list_04	list_07	48.0351%
list_04	list_08	33.3579%
list_04	list_15	70.6416%
list_04	list_06	35.3785%
list_04	list_05	3.3352%
list_04	list_03	0.5410%
list_04	list_12	0.0112%
list_04	list_13	0.0000%
list_04	list_02	62.5420%
list_03	list_09	0.6411%
list_03	list_07	0.7306%
list_03	list_08	7.0591%
list_03	list_06	0.4545%
list_03	list_05	90.5745%
list_03	list_02	8.1782%
list_12	list_09	0.0228%
list_12	list_07	0.0084%
list_12	list_08	0.0151%
list_12	list_06	0.0127%
list_12	list_05	0.0006%
list_12	list_03	99.9842%
list_12	list_13	0.0000%
list_12	list_02	0.0677%
list_13	list_09	0.0000%
list_13	list_07	0.0000%
list_13	list_08	0.0000%
list_13	list_06	0.0000%
list_13	list_05	0.0000%
list_13	list_03	0.0000%
list_13	list_02	0.0000%
list_02	list_05	91.0823%

Table G.22: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.23: Google Safe Browsing – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
list_02	274,526	0.3580%
list_09	154,822	2.7522%
list_06	73,501	0.4048%
list_08	65,229	1.3159%
list_04	36,949	1.2511%
list_07	30,644	1.3238%
list_10	26,142	1.2949%
list_15	18,531	1.0270%
list_03	18,460	0.3196%
list_05	1,857	1.1081%
list_01	763	0.3950%
list_12	147	0.0176%
list_13	0	0.0000%

Table G.24: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	TLD	
list_04	com	2,514
	ru	710
	net	357
	info	269
	mobi	195
list_13	com	37,032
	org	4,300
	net	3,206
	info	1,477
	uk	577
list_05	com	63,320
	ru	13,421
	info	12,768
	net	10,359
	us	5,366
list_03	com	614,135
	org	60,123
	net	48,794
	info	46,873
	ru	45,707
list_12	com	31,019
	net	2,817
	org	2,165
	info	411
	edu	320
list_16	com	648,847
	org	84,302
	net	44,974
	info	26,742
	uk	11,793

Table G.24: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.25: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_01	mail	86,686
	smtp	34,885
	www	17,033
	pop3	1,324
	pop	657
list_05	www	82,343
	ns1	614
	mail	538
	ns2	383
	forum	111
list_06	www	740,731
	mail	317,418
	daily	183,283
	ns	32,360
	ns1	30,046
list_04	www	315,606
	mail	85,626
	ns1	15,132
	ns2	11,681
	ns	11,255
list_13	anantes-651-1-49-3	1
	sentinel-pc120-093	1
list_08	www	845,409
	mail	88,724
	ns1	11,653
	ns	10,486
	forum	9,152
list_15	www	196,864
	mail	51,280
	ns1	7,030
	ns	6,664
	ns2	5,681
list_02	www	4,030,820
	pc	1,022,549
	mail	250,459
	ns1	92,898
	nflx	74,943
list_07	www	269,140
	mail	127,902
	ns	20,917
	ns1	13,212
	ns2	8,502

Table G.25: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Hostname	
list_03	68	223,629
	www	140,587
	23	93,614
	70	92,695
	98	84,582
list_09	www	894,408
	mail	271,766
	ns1	42,344
	ns	39,569
	ns2	24,847
list_12	68	220,763
	23	90,773
	70	89,695
	98	81,374
	220	52,688

Table G.25: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Table G.26: Average Number of Domains – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	Average
list_12	12685.0000
list_03	3980.2526
list_05	801.8517
list_06	70.3931
list_02	64.7645
list_01	52.0960
list_04	46.0977
list_08	23.7916
list_09	21.2408
list_15	13.8770
list_07	12.9906
list_13	1.0000

Table G.27: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2013 ID – DNSBL

Blacklist	IP Addresses	
list_01	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798
list_05	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798

Table G.27: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	IP Addresses	
list_06	205.251.203.101	344,605
	205.251.203.109	342,929
	205.251.203.105	341,622
	205.251.203.129	340,657
	205.251.203.117	337,946
list_08	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	62.116.181.25	1,692,380
	74.63.153.63	879,834
	1.1.1.1	837,060
	62.149.128.72	727,412
list_04	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798
list_13	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798
list_15	173.249.151.14	219,905
	67.216.200.209	71,915
	208.76.84.141	39,418
	173.225.187.22	34,027
	130.185.157.3	18,697
list_02	204.236.147.150	38,216,842
	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
list_07	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798
list_09	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	62.116.181.25	1,692,380
	74.63.153.63	879,834
	1.1.1.1	837,060
	62.149.128.72	727,412
list_03	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	1.1.1.1	837,060
	205.251.203.101	344,605
	205.251.203.109	342,929
	205.251.203.105	341,622
list_12	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798

Table G.27: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2013 ID – DNSBL (Continued)

G.4 Initial Analysis – 2013 ID – Feeds

Table G.28: Counts – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_02	173,358,513
feed_04	9,095,268
feed_10	4,920,784
feed_07	1,063,122
feed_03	983,323
feed_09	40,453

Table G.29: Reverse Counts – 2013 ID – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	169,409,682	94.4235%
2	9,965,453	5.5544%
3	37,712	0.0210%
4	1,736	0.0010%
5	159	0.0001%

Table G.30: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Count
feed_03	feed_02	196,983
feed_03	feed_04	3,363
feed_03	feed_07	2,713
feed_03	feed_09	1,184
feed_03	feed_10	2,183
feed_02	feed_04	7,310,582
feed_02	feed_07	86,794
feed_02	feed_09	31,287
feed_02	feed_10	2,418,420
feed_04	feed_07	595
feed_04	feed_09	56
feed_04	feed_10	4,277
feed_07	feed_09	27,994
feed_07	feed_10	3,417
feed_09	feed_10	747

Table G.30: Pairwise Intersection by Count – 2013 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Table G.31: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
feed_03	feed_02	20.0324%
feed_03	feed_04	0.3420%
feed_03	feed_07	0.2759%
feed_03	feed_09	2.9269%
feed_03	feed_10	0.2220%
feed_02	feed_04	80.3779%

Table G.31: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Blacklist 1	Blacklist 2	Intersection Percent
feed_02	feed_07	8.1641%
feed_02	feed_09	77.3416%
feed_02	feed_10	49.1470%
feed_04	feed_07	0.0560%
feed_04	feed_09	0.1384%
feed_04	feed_10	0.0869%
feed_07	feed_09	69.2013%
feed_07	feed_10	0.3214%
feed_09	feed_10	1.8466%

Table G.31: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Table G.32: Google Safe Browsing – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Count	Percentage
feed_02	2,822,785	1.6283%
feed_03	18,742	1.9060%
feed_07	5,771	0.5428%
feed_10	2,316	0.0471%
feed_09	537	1.3275%

Table G.33: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	TLD	Count
feed_06	com	2,009
	ru	428
	net	290
	kr	228
	cn	193
feed_03	ag	105,136
	pe	104,656
	tw	104,544
	bo	104,487
	hn	104,431
feed_01	com	48
	ru	37
	in	15
	net	15
	eu	9
feed_04	com	648
	ru	176
	br	175
	net	160
	tk	85
feed_05	com	7,461
	ru	3,559
	net	1,927
	info	1,846
	org	1,779

Table G.33: Top 5 TLDs – 2013 ID – Feeds (Continued)

Table G.34: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Hostname	
feed_07	www	32,940
	ns2	10,308
	mail	10,196
	ns1	10,173
	ns3	3,795
feed_09	www	5,354
	a	2,885
	ns2	2,878
	mail	1,469
	ns1	1,096
feed_02	www	20,812,747
	0	3,518,886
	pc	1,045,914
	mail	896,155
	mx	356,486
feed_03	www	83,563
	mail	15,962
	triband-mum-120	10,322
	triband-mum-59	7,084
	2	4,124
feed_04	www	1,626,959
	pc	1,022,322
	mx	302,180
	mail	22,654
	zzzzz	19,676
feed_10	www	111,006
	ns1	31,656
	ns2	26,068
	mail	7,831
	a	7,304

Table G.34: Top 5 Hostnames – 2013 ID – Feeds (Continued)**Table G.35:** Average Number of Domains – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	Average
feed_04	8959.9472
feed_02	729.8087
feed_07	69.6587
feed_10	50.3450
feed_09	17.5668
feed_03	2.1680

Table G.36: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2013 ID – Feeds

Blacklist	IP Addresses	
feed_07	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798
feed_09	221.207.50.84	6,865
	24.43.123.80	3,550
	174.143.169.191	3,203
	210.211.101.112	1,584
	66.90.104.87	1,155
feed_02	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798
feed_03	213.171.219.5	15,381
	31.170.161.216	15,112
	87.229.26.138	9,829
	70.182.49.195	8,421
	79.170.44.147	7,840
feed_04	68.178.232.99	4,189,302
	62.116.181.25	1,692,380
	74.63.153.63	879,834
	1.1.1.1	837,060
	62.149.128.72	727,412
feed_10	208.93.0.128	12,146,626
	174.139.43.13	11,798,811
	68.178.232.100	7,720,980
	216.178.46.224	7,294,678
	63.135.90.224	4,745,798

Table G.36: Top 5 IP Addresses – 2013 ID – Feeds (Continued)

H Domains to IP (DI)

H.1 Initial Analysis – 2012 DI – DNSBL

Table H.1: Counts – 2012 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_16	1,373,060
list_03	324,468
list_05	323,054
list_12	270,969
list_13	254,036
list_04	30,668

Table H.2: Reverse Counts – 2012 DI – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1,056,125	72.3943%
2	218,574	14.9826%
3	111,863	7.6679%
4	58,111	3.9833%
5	12,860	0.8815%
6	1,318	0.0903%

Table H.3: Intersection by Count – 2012 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_16 list_03	294,595
list_16 list_03 list_05	166,569
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03	61,177
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	12,833
list_04 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	2,127

Table H.4: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_04 list_03	98.6207%
list_04 list_16 list_03	97.4599%
list_04 list_16 list_03 list_05	95.9208%
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	41.8449%
list_04 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	6.9356%

Table H.5: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_16	1,480
list_13	404
list_12	294
list_03	222
list_05	72
list_04	10

Table H.6: Average IPs per Domain – 2012 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_04	11.1717
list_05	3.9371
list_12	3.7637
list_03	3.2849
list_13	2.8573
list_16	2.0158

Table H.7: Top 5 Domains – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Domains	Count
list_04	tiffavo.com	17,073
	fox.com	15,548
	vidsforeveryone472.com	13,441
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	alabamahaveidea.com	7,622
list_13	fox.com	15,548
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	alabamahaveidea.com	7,622
	exmotof.ru	7,514
	google.com	6,200
list_05	tiffavo.com	17,073
	facial-time.com	15,720
	fox.com	15,548
	vidsforeveryone472.com	13,441
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
list_03	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	alabamahaveidea.com	7,622
	exmotof.ru	7,514
	google.com	6,200
	vysatyv.ru	5,986
list_12	tiffavo.com	17,073
	facial-time.com	15,720
	fox.com	15,548
	vidsforeveryone472.com	13,441
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
list_16	fox.com	15,548
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	alabamahaveidea.com	7,622
	exmotof.ru	7,514
	google.com	6,200

Table H.7: Top 5 Domains – 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist	Domains
------------------	----------------

Table H.7: Top 5 Domains – 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

H.2 Initial Analysis – 2012 DI – Feeds

Table H.8: Counts – 2012 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	179,153
feed_05	134,704
feed_04	36,523
feed_01	390

Table H.9: Reverse Counts – 2012 DI – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	166,365	69.0707%
2	57,434	23.8452%
3	17,063	7.0841%

Table H.10: Intersection by Count – 2012 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 feed_05	62,839
feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	17,471
feed_01 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	123

Table H.11: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
feed_01 feed_05	78.4615%
feed_01 feed_03 feed_05	64.1026%
feed_01 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	31.5385%

Table H.12: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2012 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_05	29
feed_03	15
feed_04	6
feed_01	2

Table H.13: Average IPs per Domain – 2012 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_04	23.4109
feed_05	16.6242
feed_01	3.4704
feed_03	2.6780

Table H.14: Top 5 Domains – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Domains	
feed_03	tiffavo.com	17,073
	fox.com	15,548
	vidsforeveryone472.com	13,441
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	alabamahaveidea.com	7,622
feed_01	tiffavo.com	17,073
	fox.com	15,548
	vidsforeveryone472.com	13,441
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	alabamahaveidea.com	7,622
feed_04	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	exmotof.ru	7,514
	vysatyv.ru	5,986
	bogquse.ru	4,646
	lojseuv.ru	3,893
feed_05	tiffavo.com	17,073
	fox.com	15,548
	vidsforeveryone472.com	13,441
	zylhomu.ru	12,169
	alabamahaveidea.com	7,622

Table H.14: Top 5 Domains – 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

H.3 Initial Analysis – 2012 DI – All Sets

Table H.15: Intersection by Count – 2012 DI – All Sets

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_16 list_03	294,595
list_16 list_03 list_05	166,569
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03	61,177
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	12,833
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_05 list_05	7,305
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05 list_05	2,740
list_04 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05 list_05	1,045

Table H.16: Intersection by Percentage – 2012 DI – All Sets

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_04 list_03	98.6207%
list_04 list_16 list_03	97.4599%
list_04 list_16 list_03 list_05	95.9208%
feed_01 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05	45.3846%
feed_01 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05 list_05	43.8462%
feed_01 list_12 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05 list_05	40.7692%
feed_01 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05 list_05	37.9487%

H.4 Initial Analysis – 2013 DI – DNSBL

Table H.17: Counts – 2013 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_16	406,022
list_03	381,704
list_12	54,056
list_13	52,689
list_05	35,090
list_04	1,610

Table H.18: Reverse Counts – 2013 DI – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	362,363	64.8556%
2	145,608	26.0609%
3	32,918	5.8916%
4	16,753	2.9984%
5	1,048	0.1876%
6	33	0.0059%

Table H.19: Intersection by Count – 2013 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_16 list_03	215,907
list_13 list_16 list_03	45,646
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03	26,203
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	2,039
list_04 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	72

Table H.20: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_04 list_03	98.8820%
list_04 list_16 list_03	93.6646%
list_04 list_16 list_03 list_05	84.7205%
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	25.5280%
list_04 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	4.4720%

Table H.21: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_03	449
list_16	352
list_13	70
list_05	47
list_12	44
list_04	1

Table H.22: Average IPs per Domain – 2013 DI – DNSBL

Blacklist	Count
list_12	2.8904
list_13	2.4847
list_05	2.2416
list_04	1.6084
list_03	1.4260
list_16	1.3724

Table H.23: Top 5 Domains – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklist	Domains	
list_04	flowsre.com	7,651
	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	oparle.com	2,636
list_13	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	goo.gl	2,605
	g.co	1,887
list_05	flowsre.com	7,651
	wearenationoftrust.com	3,974
	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
list_03	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	goo.gl	2,605
	g.co	1,887
list_16	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	goo.gl	2,605
	g.co	1,887
list_12	flowsre.com	7,651
	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	oparle.com	2,636

Table H.23: Top 5 Domains – 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklist

Domains

Table H.23: Top 5 Domains – 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

H.5 Initial Analysis – 2013 DI – Feeds

Table H.24: Counts – 2013 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	33,193
feed_05	17,933
feed_06	4,378
feed_04	533
feed_01	55

Table H.25: Reverse Counts – 2013 DI – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	25,575	66.3958%
2	9,351	24.2763%
3	3,577	9.2863%
4	16	0.0415%

Table H.26: Intersection by Count – 2013 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Count
feed_03 feed_05	12,850
feed_03 feed_05 feed_06	3,509
feed_03 feed_04 feed_05 feed_06	19
feed_01 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05 feed_06	0

Table H.27: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
feed_03 feed_06	82.0694%
feed_03 feed_05 feed_06	80.1508%
feed_01 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	7.2727%
feed_01 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05 feed_06	0%

Table H.28: Intersections with Non-Routable – 2013 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_03	7
feed_05	5
feed_04	1
feed_06	0
feed_01	0

Table H.29: Average IPs per Domain – 2013 DI – Feeds

Blacklist	Count
feed_06	7.1265
feed_05	4.8363
feed_03	2.9725
feed_04	1.4092
feed_01	1.3636

Table H.30: Top 5 Domains – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklist	Domains	
feed_06	butlesuh.ru	1,519
	xujxiwli.ru	563
	sigkeqvi.ru	471
	ahfapjux.ru	268
	ymvuchyq.ru	252
feed_03	flowsre.com	7,651
	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	oparle.com	2,636
feed_01	flowsre.com	7,651
	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	oparle.com	2,636
feed_04	rapidshare.com	15
	ourbestsearch.info	12
	ifikangloo.ru	9
	eliteman.ru	8
	goodsite.in	8
feed_05	flowsre.com	7,651
	americanidol.com	3,902
	fox.com	3,694
	google.com	3,402
	oparle.com	2,636

Table H.30: Top 5 Domains – 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

H.6 Initial Analysis – 2013 DI – All Sets

Table H.31: Intersection by Count – 2013 DI – All Sets

Blacklist	Intersection Count
list_16 list_03	215,907
list_13 list_16 list_03	45,646
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03	26,203
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 list_05	2,039
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 list_05	298
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05 list_05	189
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05 list_05	58
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05 feed_06 list_05	17

Table H.32: Intersection by Percentage – 2013 DI – All Sets

Blacklist	Intersection Percent
list_04 list_03	98.8820%
list_04 list_16 list_03	93.6646%
list_04 list_16 list_03 list_05	84.7205%
feed_01 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05	34.5455%
feed_01 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_05 list_05	23.6364%
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	12.9456%
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05 list_05	10.8818%
feed_01 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_03 feed_04 feed_05 list_05	5.4545%

Part IV

Time Series

I Time Series – IP-Based Lists – DNSBLs

I.1 Results for January 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.1: Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	5,529,495
list_06	2,154,035
list_08	997,786
list_09	563,655
list_07	557,468
list_15	395,716
list_04	161,568
list_10	99,154
white_04	4,414
list_12	2,505
list_01	2,071
list_03	199
list_05	162
feed_10	138
list_13	128

Table I.2: Reverse Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	3542291	58.1138%
2	1579615	25.9147%
3	515455	8.4564%
4	234170	3.8417%
5	119678	1.9634%
6	59247	0.9720%
7	30307	0.4972%
8	14178	0.2326%
9	497	0.0082%
10	1	0.0000%

Table I.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	1,793,038
list_08 list_02	924,185
list_07 list_02	538,981
list_06 list_08	520,988
list_09 list_02	466,061
list_06 list_07	361,369
list_07 list_08	347,779
list_15 list_02	339,282
list_06 list_09	306,906

Table I.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_08 list_09	218,431
list_15 list_08	211,783
list_15 list_06	199,349
list_07 list_09	183,758
list_15 list_07	171,917
list_04 list_02	146,785
list_04 list_06	110,663
list_04 list_08	107,587
list_15 list_09	106,273
list_04 list_07	85,921
list_10 list_02	77,359
list_04 list_09	76,773
list_10 list_06	67,279
list_10 list_08	59,590
list_04 list_15	56,400
list_10 list_07	53,875
list_10 list_09	52,707
list_10 list_15	37,059
list_10 list_04	33,447
white_04 list_06	1,954
list_01 list_06	1,849
list_01 list_02	1,182
list_01 list_07	1,121
list_01 list_08	1,053
list_01 list_09	981
list_01 list_04	917
list_01 list_15	870
list_10 white_04	763
list_10 list_01	746
list_01 white_04	240
white_04 list_07	208
list_03 list_05	50
white_04 list_02	48
white_04 list_04	42
list_03 list_09	30
list_02 list_05	27
list_03 list_06	26
list_04 list_05	23
list_06 list_05	20
list_04 list_03	19
list_09 list_05	19
list_03 list_02	18
white_04 list_15	15
list_10 list_03	13
list_03 list_07	10
list_10 list_05	8
list_12 list_13	7
list_12 feed_10	5
list_15 list_03	5
list_03 feed_10	5
white_04 list_08	5
list_07 list_05	4
list_08 list_05	4
list_13 feed_10	3

Table I.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
feed_10 list_05	3
list_03 list_08	3
list_15 list_05	2
feed_10 list_02	2
list_15 feed_10	1
white_04 list_05	1
list_04 feed_10	1
list_09 feed_10	1
list_07 feed_10	1
list_13 list_05	1
list_08 feed_10	1
list_06 feed_10	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 feed_10	0
white_04 list_09	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_08	512,935
list_02	
list_06 list_07	248,443
list_08 list_02	

Table I.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.4: Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	34.8551%
list_07 list_09	32.6011%
list_06 list_02	32.4268%
list_15 list_07	30.8389%
list_03 list_05	25.1256%
list_06 list_08	24.1866%
list_08 list_09	21.8916%
list_15 list_08	21.2253%
list_10 list_04	20.7015%
list_15 list_09	18.8543%
list_06 list_07	16.7764%
list_08 list_02	16.7137%
list_04 list_07	15.4127%
list_04 list_15	14.2526%
list_06 list_09	14.2480%
list_04 list_09	13.6206%
list_04 list_08	10.7826%
list_07 list_02	9.7474%
list_10 list_07	9.6642%
list_10 list_15	9.3650%
list_10 list_09	9.3509%
list_15 list_06	9.2547%
list_09 list_02	8.4286%
list_15 list_02	6.1359%
list_10 list_08	5.9722%
list_01 white_04	5.4372%
list_04 list_06	5.1375%
list_10 list_06	3.1234%
list_04 list_02	2.6546%
list_03 feed_10	2.5126%
list_13 feed_10	2.1739%
feed_10 list_05	1.8519%
list_10 list_02	1.3990%
list_10 white_04	0.7695%
list_10 list_01	0.7524%
list_13 list_05	0.6173%
list_01 list_04	0.5676%
list_12 list_13	0.2794%
list_01 list_15	0.2199%
list_01 list_07	0.2011%
list_12 feed_10	0.1996%
list_01 list_09	0.1740%
list_01 list_08	0.1055%
white_04 list_06	0.0907%
list_01 list_06	0.0858%
white_04 list_07	0.0373%
white_04 list_04	0.0260%
white_04 list_05	0.0227%
list_01 list_02	0.0214%
list_04 list_05	0.0142%
list_10 list_03	0.0131%
list_04 list_03	0.0118%

Table I.4: Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_10 list_05	0.0081%
list_03 list_09	0.0053%
white_04 list_15	0.0038%
list_09 list_05	0.0034%
list_03 list_07	0.0018%
list_15 list_03	0.0013%
list_03 list_06	0.0012%
white_04 list_02	0.0009%
list_06 list_05	0.0009%
list_07 list_05	0.0007%
list_04 feed_10	0.0006%
white_04 list_08	0.0005%
list_02 list_05	0.0005%
list_15 list_05	0.0005%
list_08 list_05	0.0004%
list_03 list_08	0.0003%
list_15 feed_10	0.0003%
list_03 list_02	0.0003%
list_09 feed_10	0.0002%
list_07 feed_10	0.0002%
list_08 feed_10	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_09	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%

Table I.4: Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists		Percentage
list_15	list_07	14.7718%
list_09		
list_15	list_07	7.5331%
list_08	list_09	

Table I.4: Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.2 Results for February 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.5: Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	5,555,146
list_06	1,933,976
list_08	779,232
list_09	633,303
list_07	530,888
list_15	385,522
list_04	157,362
list_10	121,297
white_04	2,646
list_01	1,982
list_12	1,575
list_05	337
feed_10	197
list_03	162
list_13	149

Table I.6: Reverse Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	4380904	65.9400%
2	1546429	23.2764%
3	427669	6.4371%
4	166287	2.5029%
5	74147	1.1160%
6	31850	0.4794%
7	11924	0.1795%
8	4534	0.0682%
9	28	0.0004%
10	3	0.0000%

Table I.7: Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	1,368,710
list_08 list_02	585,196
list_09 list_02	409,120
list_07 list_02	407,241
list_06 list_08	281,329
list_15 list_02	245,806
list_07 list_08	241,746
list_06 list_09	234,554
list_06 list_07	222,410
list_08 list_09	163,664
list_07 list_09	157,808
list_15 list_08	140,059
list_15 list_07	121,830
list_15 list_06	119,060
list_04 list_02	94,641

Table I.7: Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_09	86,662
list_04 list_08	68,924
list_04 list_07	62,099
list_04 list_06	60,969
list_04 list_09	59,439
list_10 list_02	43,386
list_04 list_15	42,534
list_10 list_09	40,062
list_10 list_07	35,557
list_10 list_08	33,932
list_10 list_06	32,905
list_10 list_04	31,128
list_10 list_15	28,991
list_10 list_01	687
list_01 list_04	584
list_01 list_09	524
list_01 list_02	490
list_01 list_07	462
list_01 list_06	462
list_10 white_04	453
list_01 list_08	390
list_01 list_15	295
list_03 list_05	105
list_04 list_05	89
list_04 list_03	76
white_04 list_07	71
white_04 list_06	68
list_01 white_04	53
white_04 list_02	28
list_02 list_05	26
white_04 list_04	22
feed_10 list_05	21
list_09 list_05	18
white_04 list_08	16
list_03 list_02	15
list_06 list_05	13
white_04 list_09	13
list_08 list_05	13
list_15 list_05	11
list_07 list_05	11
list_03 list_09	10
list_10 list_05	10
list_03 list_06	9
list_13 feed_10	7
list_10 list_03	7
list_12 list_02	7
list_04 feed_10	6
white_04 list_15	6
list_03 feed_10	6
list_03 list_07	6
list_15 list_03	5
list_03 list_08	5
list_13 list_05	4
list_12 list_08	2

Table I.7: Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_12 list_13	2
feed_10 list_02	2
list_12 feed_10	1
list_12 list_06	1
list_12 list_07	1
list_01 list_05	1
list_06 feed_10	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_09 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 feed_10	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_08	246,596
list_02	
list_06 list_07	109,924
list_08 list_02	

Table I.7: Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.8: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	31.1573%
list_07 list_08	31.0236%
list_07 list_09	24.9182%
list_06 list_02	24.6386%
list_15 list_07	22.9483%

Table I.8: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_08 list_09	21.0032%
list_10 list_04	19.7811%
list_15 list_08	17.9740%
list_06 list_08	14.5467%
list_15 list_09	13.6841%
list_06 list_09	12.1281%
list_04 list_07	11.6972%
list_06 list_07	11.5001%
list_04 list_15	11.0328%
list_08 list_02	10.5343%
list_04 list_09	9.3856%
list_04 list_08	8.8451%
list_10 list_15	7.5199%
list_09 list_02	7.3647%
list_07 list_02	7.3309%
list_10 list_07	6.6976%
list_10 list_09	6.3259%
feed_10 list_05	6.2315%
list_15 list_06	6.1562%
list_15 list_02	4.4248%
list_10 list_08	4.3545%
list_13 feed_10	3.5533%
list_04 list_06	3.1525%
list_03 feed_10	3.0457%
list_01 white_04	2.0030%
list_04 list_02	1.7037%
list_10 list_06	1.7014%
list_13 list_05	1.1869%
list_10 list_02	0.7810%
list_10 list_01	0.5664%
list_10 white_04	0.3735%
list_01 list_04	0.3711%
list_12 list_13	0.1270%
list_01 list_07	0.0870%
list_01 list_09	0.0827%
list_01 list_15	0.0765%
list_12 feed_10	0.0635%
list_04 list_05	0.0566%
list_01 list_05	0.0505%
list_01 list_08	0.0500%
list_04 list_03	0.0483%
list_01 list_06	0.0239%
white_04 list_04	0.0140%
white_04 list_07	0.0134%
list_01 list_02	0.0088%
list_10 list_05	0.0082%
list_10 list_03	0.0058%
list_04 feed_10	0.0038%
white_04 list_06	0.0035%
list_15 list_05	0.0029%
list_09 list_05	0.0028%
white_04 list_09	0.0021%
white_04 list_08	0.0021%
list_07 list_05	0.0021%

Table I.8: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_08 list_05	0.0017%
white_04 list_15	0.0016%
list_03 list_09	0.0016%
list_15 list_03	0.0013%
list_03 list_07	0.0011%
list_06 list_05	0.0007%
list_03 list_08	0.0006%
list_03 list_06	0.0005%
white_04 list_02	0.0005%
list_02 list_05	0.0005%
list_03 list_02	0.0003%
list_12 list_08	0.0003%
list_12 list_07	0.0002%
list_12 list_02	0.0001%
list_06 feed_10	0.0001%
list_12 list_06	0.0001%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_09 feed_10	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_07 list_08	12.4820%
list_09	
list_15 list_07	5.4898%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.8: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.3 Results for March 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.9: Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	2,767,462
list_06	790,427
list_08	334,593
list_07	325,567
list_09	282,033
list_15	206,534
list_04	85,278
list_10	72,917
list_01	733
white_04	618
list_12	439
list_05	250
list_03	117
list_13	71
feed_10	51

Table I.10: Reverse Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2763954	76.4236%
2	597721	16.5270%
3	162731	4.4995%
4	58332	1.6129%
5	21897	0.6055%
6	8099	0.2239%
7	3043	0.0841%
8	848	0.0234%
9	1	0.0000%

Table I.11: Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	391,463
list_07 list_02	217,343
list_08 list_02	198,326
list_09 list_02	137,594
list_15 list_02	94,066
list_07 list_08	94,036
list_06 list_07	87,572
list_06 list_08	69,926
list_07 list_09	61,501
list_06 list_09	58,504
list_08 list_09	46,178
list_04 list_02	46,112
list_15 list_07	46,070
list_15 list_08	41,107
list_15 list_06	32,385
list_04 list_07	29,051

Table I.11: Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_09	25,022
list_10 list_02	24,543
list_04 list_08	24,308
list_04 list_09	21,406
list_04 list_06	20,985
list_10 list_07	18,277
list_10 list_09	15,478
list_04 list_15	14,719
list_10 list_08	13,826
list_10 list_04	11,880
list_10 list_06	11,607
list_10 list_15	9,732
list_10 list_01	157
list_01 list_07	106
list_10 white_04	96
list_01 list_02	94
list_01 list_06	89
list_01 list_04	87
list_01 list_09	84
list_01 list_08	59
list_03 list_05	56
list_01 list_15	53
list_02 list_05	30
list_03 list_02	15
list_10 list_03	13
list_09 list_05	11
white_04 list_07	9
list_04 list_05	8
list_03 list_09	6
white_04 list_09	6
list_04 list_03	5
list_03 list_07	4
white_04 list_06	4
list_10 list_05	4
list_03 list_08	4
white_04 list_02	4
list_06 list_05	3
list_15 list_03	3
list_03 feed_10	3
white_04 list_15	2
list_15 list_05	2
list_07 list_05	2
list_08 list_05	2
white_04 list_04	2
list_12 list_13	1
list_10 feed_10	1
feed_10 list_05	1
feed_10 list_02	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_04 feed_10	0
list_03 list_06	0

Table I.11: Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_01 white_04	0
list_13 feed_10	0
list_09 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
white_04 list_08	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 feed_10	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	75,065
list_02	
list_06 list_07	28,125
list_08 list_02	

Table I.11: Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)**Table I.12:** Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	28.1046%
list_03 list_05	22.4000%
list_07 list_09	18.8904%
list_15 list_07	14.1507%
list_06 list_02	14.1452%
list_10 list_04	13.9309%

Table I.12: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_08 list_09	13.8012%
list_15 list_08	12.2857%
list_06 list_07	11.0791%
list_04 list_07	8.9232%
list_15 list_09	8.8720%
list_06 list_08	8.8466%
list_07 list_02	7.8535%
list_04 list_09	7.5899%
list_06 list_09	7.4016%
list_04 list_08	7.2649%
list_08 list_02	7.1663%
list_04 list_15	7.1267%
list_10 list_07	5.6139%
list_10 list_09	5.4880%
list_09 list_02	4.9718%
list_10 list_15	4.7121%
list_10 list_08	4.1322%
list_15 list_06	4.0972%
list_15 list_02	3.3990%
list_04 list_06	2.6549%
list_03 feed_10	2.5641%
list_04 list_02	1.6662%
list_10 list_06	1.4684%
list_10 list_02	0.8868%
feed_10 list_05	0.4000%
list_12 list_13	0.2278%
list_10 list_01	0.2153%
list_10 white_04	0.1317%
list_01 list_04	0.1020%
list_01 list_07	0.0326%
list_01 list_09	0.0298%
list_01 list_15	0.0257%
list_10 list_03	0.0178%
list_01 list_08	0.0176%
list_01 list_06	0.0113%
list_04 list_05	0.0094%
list_04 list_03	0.0059%
list_10 list_05	0.0055%
list_09 list_05	0.0039%
list_01 list_02	0.0034%
white_04 list_07	0.0028%
white_04 list_04	0.0023%
white_04 list_09	0.0021%
list_03 list_09	0.0021%
list_15 list_03	0.0015%
list_10 feed_10	0.0014%
list_03 list_08	0.0012%
list_03 list_07	0.0012%
list_02 list_05	0.0011%
white_04 list_15	0.0010%
list_15 list_05	0.0010%
list_08 list_05	0.0006%
list_07 list_05	0.0006%
list_03 list_02	0.0005%

Table I.12: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
white_04 list_06	0.0005%
list_06 list_05	0.0004%
white_04 list_02	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 white_04	0.0000%
list_13 feed_10	0.0000%
list_09 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_07 list_08	8.4273%
list_09	
list_15 list_07	3.1133%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.12: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.4 Results for April 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.13: Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	3,014,110
list_06	867,185
list_07	409,837
list_08	401,414
list_09	282,272
list_15	228,669
list_04	80,778
list_10	66,100
list_01	654
list_12	577
white_04	407
list_05	115
list_03	94
list_13	72
feed_10	55

Table I.14: Reverse Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2945508	75.3377%
2	661148	16.9103%
3	190461	4.8714%
4	70286	1.7977%
5	27469	0.7026%
6	10290	0.2632%
7	3729	0.0954%
8	839	0.0215%
9	12	0.0003%

Table I.15: Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	432,339
list_07 list_02	283,559
list_08 list_02	247,458
list_09 list_02	139,616
list_07 list_08	129,557
list_15 list_02	115,190
list_06 list_07	109,189
list_06 list_08	83,621
list_07 list_09	69,633
list_15 list_07	65,594
list_15 list_08	56,842
list_08 list_09	56,482
list_06 list_09	55,050
list_04 list_02	47,110
list_15 list_06	39,339
list_04 list_07	33,693

Table I.15: Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_09	31,699
list_04 list_08	28,611
list_10 list_02	23,096
list_04 list_09	20,495
list_04 list_06	19,772
list_10 list_07	18,587
list_04 list_15	17,133
list_10 list_08	15,585
list_10 list_09	14,153
list_10 list_15	11,203
list_10 list_04	10,168
list_10 list_06	9,943
list_10 list_01	131
list_01 list_07	85
list_01 list_02	68
list_01 list_09	66
list_10 white_04	64
list_01 list_04	62
list_01 list_06	60
list_01 list_15	57
list_01 list_08	55
list_02 list_05	22
list_03 list_05	21
list_01 white_04	11
list_10 list_03	9
list_03 list_02	8
list_03 list_09	7
white_04 list_06	7
white_04 list_09	6
list_03 list_07	5
white_04 list_07	5
list_09 list_05	5
list_04 list_03	4
white_04 list_02	4
list_04 list_05	4
list_15 list_05	3
list_13 feed_10	3
list_09 feed_10	3
list_07 list_05	3
list_03 list_08	3
list_08 list_05	3
list_15 list_03	2
list_03 feed_10	2
list_10 feed_10	2
list_10 list_05	2
white_04 list_04	2
list_06 list_05	1
list_04 feed_10	1
white_04 list_15	1
list_12 feed_10	1
list_07 feed_10	1
white_04 list_08	1
feed_10 list_05	1
list_08 feed_10	1

Table I.15: Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
feed_10 list_02	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 feed_10	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	103,982
list_02	
list_06 list_07	35,825
list_08 list_02	

Table I.15: Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.16: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	31.6118%
list_03 list_05	18.2609%
list_07 list_09	16.9904%
list_15 list_07	16.0049%
list_06 list_02	14.3438%
list_15 list_08	14.1604%

Table I.16: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_08 list_09	14.0708%
list_06 list_07	12.5912%
list_10 list_04	12.5876%
list_15 list_09	11.2299%
list_06 list_08	9.6428%
list_07 list_02	9.4077%
list_04 list_07	8.2211%
list_08 list_02	8.2100%
list_04 list_15	7.4925%
list_04 list_09	7.2607%
list_04 list_08	7.1276%
list_06 list_09	6.3481%
list_10 list_09	5.0140%
list_10 list_15	4.8992%
list_09 list_02	4.6321%
list_15 list_06	4.5364%
list_10 list_07	4.5352%
list_13 feed_10	4.1667%
list_10 list_08	3.8825%
list_15 list_02	3.8217%
list_04 list_06	2.2800%
list_03 feed_10	2.1277%
list_01 white_04	1.6820%
list_04 list_02	1.5630%
list_10 list_06	1.1466%
feed_10 list_05	0.8696%
list_10 list_02	0.7663%
list_10 list_01	0.1982%
list_12 feed_10	0.1733%
list_10 white_04	0.0968%
list_01 list_04	0.0768%
list_01 list_15	0.0249%
list_01 list_09	0.0234%
list_01 list_07	0.0207%
list_01 list_08	0.0137%
list_10 list_03	0.0136%
list_01 list_06	0.0069%
list_04 list_03	0.0050%
list_04 list_05	0.0050%
list_10 list_05	0.0030%
list_10 feed_10	0.0030%
list_03 list_09	0.0025%
white_04 list_04	0.0025%
list_01 list_02	0.0023%
white_04 list_09	0.0021%
list_09 list_05	0.0018%
list_15 list_05	0.0013%
white_04 list_07	0.0012%
list_03 list_07	0.0012%
list_04 feed_10	0.0012%
list_09 feed_10	0.0011%
list_15 list_03	0.0009%
white_04 list_06	0.0008%
list_03 list_08	0.0007%

Table I.16: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_08 list_05	0.0007%
list_02 list_05	0.0007%
list_07 list_05	0.0007%
white_04 list_15	0.0004%
list_03 list_02	0.0003%
list_08 feed_10	0.0002%
white_04 list_08	0.0002%
list_07 feed_10	0.0002%
white_04 list_02	0.0001%
list_06 list_05	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_07 list_08	8.8904%
list_09	
list_15 list_07	3.7207%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.16: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.5 Results for May 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.17: Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	3,296,858
list_06	908,182
list_08	528,078
list_07	426,937
list_15	304,589
list_09	252,340
list_04	98,587
list_10	61,809
list_12	518
list_01	444
white_04	341
list_05	148
list_03	96
list_13	54
feed_10	38

Table I.18: Reverse Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	3253963	75.2271%
2	755974	17.4771%
3	204867	4.7362%
4	71760	1.6590%
5	26267	0.6073%
6	9215	0.2130%
7	2951	0.0682%
8	522	0.0121%
9	1	0.0000%

Table I.19: Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	446,790
list_08 list_02	307,952
list_07 list_02	277,376
list_15 list_02	148,477
list_07 list_08	136,632
list_09 list_02	114,760
list_06 list_07	98,564
list_06 list_08	91,708
list_15 list_07	75,971
list_15 list_08	71,228
list_07 list_09	57,604
list_04 list_02	54,648
list_08 list_09	50,920
list_15 list_06	46,353
list_06 list_09	45,499
list_04 list_08	35,243

Table I.19: Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_07	35,221
list_15 list_09	32,396
list_04 list_15	20,455
list_04 list_06	20,398
list_04 list_09	20,320
list_10 list_02	18,813
list_10 list_07	15,286
list_10 list_08	13,699
list_10 list_09	12,050
list_10 list_15	11,252
list_10 list_04	10,300
list_10 list_06	8,120
list_10 list_01	115
list_10 white_04	72
list_01 list_07	51
list_01 list_04	45
list_01 list_09	41
list_03 list_05	38
list_01 list_08	33
list_01 list_02	29
list_01 list_06	29
list_01 list_15	29
list_03 list_02	17
list_02 list_05	13
list_03 list_09	12
list_10 list_03	12
list_03 list_08	12
list_03 list_07	10
list_15 list_03	9
list_04 list_03	7
list_10 list_05	7
list_09 list_05	7
list_04 list_05	6
white_04 list_06	4
list_03 list_06	3
list_01 white_04	3
white_04 list_07	3
list_06 list_05	2
list_15 list_05	2
list_07 list_05	2
list_08 list_05	2
white_04 list_09	1
white_04 list_04	1
white_04 list_02	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_04 feed_10	0
white_04 list_15	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0

Table I.19: Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_13	0
list_13 feed_10	0
list_09 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_03 feed_10	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
white_04 list_08	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 feed_10	0
feed_10 list_05	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_12 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	103,941
list_02	
list_06 list_07	32,898
list_08 list_02	

Table I.19: Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.20: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	25.8735%
list_03 list_05	25.6757%
list_15 list_07	17.7944%
list_06 list_02	13.5520%
list_07 list_09	13.4924%
list_15 list_08	13.4882%

Table I.20: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_06 list_07	10.8529%
list_15 list_09	10.6360%
list_10 list_04	10.4476%
list_06 list_08	10.0980%
list_08 list_09	9.6425%
list_08 list_02	9.3408%
list_07 list_02	8.4133%
list_04 list_07	8.2497%
list_04 list_09	8.0526%
list_04 list_15	6.7156%
list_04 list_08	6.6738%
list_15 list_06	5.1039%
list_06 list_09	5.0099%
list_10 list_09	4.7753%
list_15 list_02	4.5036%
list_10 list_15	3.6942%
list_10 list_07	3.5804%
list_09 list_02	3.4809%
list_10 list_08	2.5941%
list_04 list_06	2.2460%
list_04 list_02	1.6576%
list_10 list_06	0.8941%
list_01 white_04	0.6757%
list_10 list_02	0.5706%
list_10 list_01	0.1861%
list_10 white_04	0.1165%
list_01 list_04	0.0456%
list_10 list_03	0.0194%
list_01 list_09	0.0162%
list_01 list_07	0.0119%
list_10 list_05	0.0113%
list_01 list_15	0.0095%
list_04 list_03	0.0071%
list_01 list_08	0.0062%
list_04 list_05	0.0061%
list_03 list_09	0.0048%
list_01 list_06	0.0032%
list_15 list_03	0.0030%
list_09 list_05	0.0028%
list_03 list_08	0.0023%
list_03 list_07	0.0023%
white_04 list_04	0.0010%
list_01 list_02	0.0009%
white_04 list_07	0.0007%
list_15 list_05	0.0007%
list_03 list_02	0.0005%
list_07 list_05	0.0005%
white_04 list_09	0.0004%
list_08 list_05	0.0004%
list_02 list_05	0.0004%
white_04 list_06	0.0004%
list_03 list_06	0.0003%
list_06 list_05	0.0002%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%

Table I.20: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
white_04 list_15	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
feed_10 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 feed_10	0.0000%
list_09 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
white_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	7.5421%
list_08	
list_15 list_07	2.5720%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.20: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.6 Results for June 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.21: Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	2,972,236
list_06	741,258
list_08	536,942
list_07	424,773
list_09	284,214
list_15	273,524
list_04	104,259
list_10	59,387
feed_10	852
list_01	428
list_12	425
white_04	313
list_05	150
list_03	53
list_13	36

Table I.22: Reverse Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2980703	75.4115%
2	664005	16.7993%
3	198060	5.0109%
4	70893	1.7936%
5	25736	0.6511%
6	9156	0.2316%
7	3486	0.0882%
8	538	0.0136%
9	7	0.0002%

Table I.23: Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	344,284
list_08 list_02	309,244
list_07 list_02	266,386
list_07 list_08	144,308
list_15 list_02	133,825
list_09 list_02	126,901
list_06 list_08	85,804
list_06 list_07	82,871
list_15 list_07	71,803
list_15 list_08	70,399
list_07 list_09	66,550
list_08 list_09	59,856
list_04 list_02	55,345
list_06 list_09	46,439
list_04 list_07	37,995
list_15 list_06	37,936

Table I.23: Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_08	36,595
list_15 list_09	34,427
list_04 list_09	23,364
list_04 list_15	20,759
list_10 list_02	19,357
list_04 list_06	19,133
list_10 list_07	15,420
list_10 list_08	14,488
list_10 list_09	12,861
list_10 list_15	11,321
list_10 list_04	11,005
list_10 list_06	6,743
list_10 feed_10	200
feed_10 list_02	148
list_04 feed_10	129
list_10 list_01	121
list_10 white_04	80
list_09 feed_10	65
list_07 feed_10	64
list_01 list_04	64
list_01 list_15	63
list_01 list_02	56
list_01 list_07	48
list_01 list_08	47
list_01 list_06	45
list_08 feed_10	45
list_01 list_09	39
list_15 feed_10	29
list_03 list_05	19
list_02 list_05	14
list_04 list_05	12
list_09 list_05	9
list_10 list_05	6
list_04 list_03	5
white_04 list_07	4
white_04 list_02	4
list_03 list_02	3
list_03 list_09	3
list_07 list_05	3
white_04 feed_10	3
list_15 list_05	2
list_01 white_04	2
list_10 list_03	2
white_04 list_09	2
white_04 list_04	2
list_06 list_05	1
white_04 list_15	1
list_12 list_13	1
white_04 list_08	1
list_03 list_07	1
white_04 list_06	1
list_08 list_05	1
list_06 feed_10	1
list_13 list_08	0

Table I.23: Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_13 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_15 list_03	0
list_03 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
feed_10 list_05	0
list_03 list_08	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	107,826
list_02	
list_15 list_07	31,238
list_08 list_02	

Table I.23: Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.24: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	26.8759%
list_15 list_07	16.9039%
list_07 list_09	15.6672%
list_15 list_08	13.1111%
list_03 list_05	12.6667%
list_15 list_09	12.1131%

Table I.24: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_06 list_02	11.5833%
list_06 list_08	11.5755%
list_06 list_07	11.1798%
list_08 list_09	11.1476%
list_10 list_04	10.5554%
list_08 list_02	10.4044%
list_07 list_02	8.9625%
list_04 list_07	8.9448%
list_04 list_09	8.2206%
list_04 list_15	7.5895%
list_04 list_08	6.8154%
list_06 list_09	6.2649%
list_15 list_06	5.1178%
list_10 list_09	4.5251%
list_15 list_02	4.5025%
list_09 list_02	4.2695%
list_10 list_15	4.1389%
list_10 list_07	3.6302%
list_10 list_08	2.6982%
list_04 list_06	2.5812%
list_04 list_02	1.8621%
list_10 list_06	0.9097%
list_10 list_02	0.6513%
list_01 white_04	0.4673%
white_04 feed_10	0.3521%
list_10 feed_10	0.3368%
list_12 list_13	0.2353%
list_10 list_01	0.2037%
list_10 white_04	0.1347%
list_04 feed_10	0.1237%
list_01 list_04	0.0614%
list_01 list_15	0.0230%
list_09 feed_10	0.0229%
list_07 feed_10	0.0151%
list_01 list_09	0.0137%
list_04 list_05	0.0115%
list_01 list_07	0.0113%
list_15 feed_10	0.0106%
list_10 list_05	0.0101%
list_01 list_08	0.0088%
list_08 feed_10	0.0084%
list_01 list_06	0.0061%
feed_10 list_02	0.0050%
list_04 list_03	0.0048%
list_10 list_03	0.0034%
list_09 list_05	0.0032%
list_01 list_02	0.0019%
white_04 list_04	0.0019%
list_03 list_09	0.0011%
white_04 list_07	0.0009%
white_04 list_09	0.0007%
list_15 list_05	0.0007%
list_07 list_05	0.0007%
list_02 list_05	0.0005%

Table I.24: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
white_04 list_15	0.0004%
white_04 list_08	0.0002%
list_08 list_05	0.0002%
list_03 list_07	0.0002%
list_06 feed_10	0.0001%
white_04 list_02	0.0001%
list_03 list_02	0.0001%
list_06 list_05	0.0001%
white_04 list_06	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
feed_10 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 feed_10	0.0000%
list_03 list_08	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_15 list_03	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	7.2056%
list_08	
list_15 list_07	2.7601%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.24: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.7 Results for July 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.25: Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	3,513,892
list_06	966,511
list_08	664,802
list_07	504,630
list_09	377,760
list_15	357,853
list_04	118,437
list_10	79,240
list_12	391
white_04	331
list_01	242
list_05	183
feed_10	181
list_03	41
list_13	18

Table I.26: Reverse Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	3318252	72.2544%
2	825290	17.9706%
3	273149	5.9478%
4	110995	2.4169%
5	43096	0.9384%
6	15747	0.3429%
7	5110	0.1113%
8	814	0.0177%
9	1	0.0000%

Table I.27: Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	494,874
list_08 list_02	427,777
list_07 list_02	342,453
list_07 list_08	209,896
list_15 list_02	208,339
list_09 list_02	181,452
list_06 list_08	130,182
list_15 list_08	123,630
list_15 list_07	122,180
list_06 list_07	105,027
list_08 list_09	89,003
list_07 list_09	87,604
list_04 list_02	69,406
list_06 list_09	67,865
list_15 list_06	66,356
list_15 list_09	56,629

Table I.27: Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_08	47,084
list_04 list_07	43,300
list_10 list_02	31,519
list_04 list_15	31,413
list_04 list_09	30,916
list_10 list_07	26,124
list_04 list_06	25,694
list_10 list_08	24,874
list_10 list_15	19,506
list_10 list_09	19,009
list_10 list_04	13,510
list_10 list_06	11,820
list_10 white_04	97
list_10 list_01	77
feed_10 list_02	36
list_10 feed_10	35
list_01 list_15	30
list_01 list_07	28
list_01 list_02	27
list_01 list_08	25
list_01 list_04	22
list_01 list_06	20
list_04 feed_10	18
list_03 list_05	18
list_01 list_09	18
list_02 list_05	17
list_09 feed_10	15
list_08 feed_10	11
list_04 list_05	10
list_09 list_05	10
list_15 feed_10	8
list_07 feed_10	8
list_03 list_09	5
white_04 feed_10	5
list_07 list_05	4
list_10 list_05	4
list_04 list_03	3
list_08 list_05	3
list_03 list_02	2
list_15 list_05	2
list_06 list_05	1
list_03 feed_10	1
list_10 list_03	1
list_03 list_07	1
white_04 list_06	1
white_04 list_07	1
feed_10 list_05	1
white_04 list_09	1
white_04 list_02	1
list_12 list_02	1
list_13 list_08	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_03 list_06	0

Table I.27: Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
white_04 list_15	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_01 white_04	0
list_13 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_15 list_03	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
white_04 list_08	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
list_03 list_08	0
list_13 list_07	0
white_04 list_04	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	164,339
list_02	
list_15 list_07	62,221
list_08 list_02	

Table I.27: Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.28: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	31.5727%
list_15 list_07	24.2118%
list_15 list_08	18.5965%
list_07 list_09	17.3600%
list_15 list_09	14.9907%
list_06 list_02	14.0834%

Table I.28: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_06 list_08	13.4693%
list_08 list_09	13.3879%
list_08 list_02	12.1739%
list_10 list_04	11.4069%
list_06 list_07	10.8666%
list_03 list_05	9.8361%
list_07 list_02	9.7457%
list_04 list_15	8.7782%
list_04 list_07	8.5805%
list_04 list_09	8.1840%
list_04 list_08	7.0824%
list_06 list_09	7.0216%
list_15 list_06	6.8655%
list_15 list_02	5.9290%
list_10 list_15	5.4508%
list_10 list_07	5.1769%
list_09 list_02	5.1638%
list_10 list_09	5.0320%
list_10 list_08	3.7416%
list_04 list_06	2.6584%
list_04 list_02	1.9752%
white_04 feed_10	1.5106%
list_10 list_06	1.2230%
list_10 list_02	0.8970%
list_03 feed_10	0.5525%
feed_10 list_05	0.5464%
list_10 white_04	0.1224%
list_10 list_01	0.0972%
list_10 feed_10	0.0442%
list_01 list_04	0.0186%
list_04 feed_10	0.0152%
list_04 list_05	0.0084%
list_01 list_15	0.0084%
list_01 list_07	0.0055%
list_10 list_05	0.0050%
list_01 list_09	0.0048%
list_09 feed_10	0.0040%
list_01 list_08	0.0038%
list_09 list_05	0.0026%
list_04 list_03	0.0025%
list_15 feed_10	0.0022%
list_01 list_06	0.0021%
list_08 feed_10	0.0017%
list_07 feed_10	0.0016%
list_03 list_09	0.0013%
list_10 list_03	0.0013%
feed_10 list_02	0.0010%
list_01 list_02	0.0008%
list_07 list_05	0.0008%
list_15 list_05	0.0006%
list_08 list_05	0.0005%
list_02 list_05	0.0005%
white_04 list_09	0.0003%
white_04 list_07	0.0002%

Table I.28: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_07	0.0002%
list_03 list_02	0.0001%
list_06 list_05	0.0001%
white_04 list_06	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
white_04 list_15	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 white_04	0.0000%
list_13 feed_10	0.0000%
list_03 list_08	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_04	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_15 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_02	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	11.3118%
list_08	
list_15 list_07	3.8924%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.28: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.8 Results for August 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.29: Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	3,136,296
list_06	833,690
list_08	683,594
list_07	563,021
list_15	449,208
list_09	373,161
list_04	118,404
list_10	76,830
list_01	580
list_12	539
white_04	251
list_05	169
list_03	62
feed_10	45
list_13	21

Table I.30: Reverse Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	3080757	71.6042%
2	774465	18.0004%
3	269942	6.2741%
4	114161	2.6534%
5	44513	1.0346%
6	13953	0.3243%
7	4086	0.0950%
8	598	0.0139%
9	5	0.0001%

Table I.31: Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	402,254
list_08 list_02	398,821
list_07 list_02	335,043
list_07 list_08	228,618
list_15 list_02	222,725
list_09 list_02	172,667
list_15 list_07	152,495
list_15 list_08	141,067
list_06 list_08	115,679
list_07 list_09	102,058
list_06 list_07	100,240
list_08 list_09	99,049
list_15 list_09	66,502
list_15 list_06	66,425
list_04 list_02	64,379
list_06 list_09	58,915

Table I.31: Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_08	44,269
list_04 list_07	40,829
list_04 list_09	33,333
list_04 list_15	30,667
list_10 list_02	24,904
list_10 list_07	22,511
list_10 list_08	21,437
list_04 list_06	21,376
list_10 list_09	19,732
list_10 list_15	18,299
list_10 list_04	12,973
list_10 list_06	8,453
list_10 list_01	175
list_01 list_07	62
list_01 list_09	61
list_01 list_15	61
list_01 list_02	60
list_01 list_04	53
list_01 list_08	52
list_10 white_04	47
list_01 list_06	26
list_03 list_05	22
list_02 list_05	19
list_09 list_05	9
white_04 list_09	6
list_04 list_05	5
list_03 list_02	4
list_03 feed_10	4
list_07 list_05	4
list_10 list_05	4
list_03 list_09	3
list_04 list_03	3
white_04 list_15	2
white_04 list_06	2
white_04 list_07	2
feed_10 list_05	2
list_01 white_04	1
list_13 list_05	1
white_04 list_04	1
white_04 list_02	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_04 feed_10	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_15 list_05	0
list_13 feed_10	0

Table I.31: Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_09 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_15 list_03	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
white_04 list_08	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
list_10 list_03	0
list_03 list_07	0
white_04 feed_10	0
list_03 list_08	0
list_08 list_05	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_12 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	159,586
list_02	
list_15 list_07	66,169
list_08 list_02	

Table I.31: Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)**Table I.32:** Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	33.4435%
list_15 list_07	27.0851%
list_15 list_08	20.6361%
list_07 list_09	18.1269%
list_15 list_09	14.8043%
list_08 list_09	14.4894%

Table I.32: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_06 list_08	13.8755%
list_03 list_05	13.0178%
list_06 list_02	12.8258%
list_08 list_02	12.7163%
list_06 list_07	12.0237%
list_10 list_04	10.9566%
list_07 list_02	10.6828%
list_04 list_09	8.9326%
list_15 list_06	7.9676%
list_04 list_07	7.2518%
list_15 list_02	7.1015%
list_06 list_09	7.0668%
list_04 list_15	6.8269%
list_04 list_08	6.4759%
list_03 feed_10	6.4516%
list_09 list_02	5.5054%
list_10 list_09	5.2878%
list_10 list_15	4.0736%
list_10 list_07	3.9983%
list_10 list_08	3.1359%
list_04 list_06	2.5640%
list_04 list_02	2.0527%
feed_10 list_05	1.1834%
list_10 list_06	1.0139%
list_10 list_02	0.7941%
list_13 list_05	0.5917%
list_10 list_01	0.2278%
list_01 white_04	0.1724%
list_10 white_04	0.0612%
list_01 list_04	0.0448%
list_01 list_09	0.0163%
list_01 list_15	0.0136%
list_01 list_07	0.0110%
list_01 list_08	0.0076%
list_10 list_05	0.0052%
list_04 list_05	0.0042%
list_01 list_06	0.0031%
list_04 list_03	0.0025%
list_09 list_05	0.0024%
list_01 list_02	0.0019%
white_04 list_09	0.0016%
list_03 list_09	0.0008%
white_04 list_04	0.0008%
list_07 list_05	0.0007%
list_02 list_05	0.0006%
white_04 list_15	0.0004%
white_04 list_07	0.0004%
white_04 list_06	0.0002%
list_03 list_02	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%

Table I.32: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_10 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 list_07	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_15 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 feed_10	0.0000%
list_03 list_08	0.0000%
list_09 feed_10	0.0000%
list_08 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_15 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
white_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	12.9596%
list_08	
list_15 list_07	4.2685%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.32: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.9 Results for September 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.33: Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	2,200,909
list_06	619,654
list_07	521,150
list_08	451,798
list_15	296,524
list_09	267,112
list_04	75,689
list_10	48,072
list_01	447
white_04	324
list_12	292
list_05	202
feed_10	90
list_03	83
list_13	41

Table I.34: Reverse Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2179568	71.4123%
2	527463	17.2820%
3	199094	6.5232%
4	95786	3.1384%
5	37391	1.2251%
6	9294	0.3045%
7	3214	0.1053%
8	279	0.0091%
9	2	0.0001%

Table I.35: Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_07 list_02	343,847
list_06 list_02	292,887
list_08 list_02	275,122
list_07 list_08	194,236
list_15 list_02	163,789
list_15 list_07	129,905
list_06 list_07	114,752
list_09 list_02	112,050
list_15 list_08	98,287
list_06 list_08	83,762
list_07 list_09	77,841
list_08 list_09	61,397
list_15 list_06	51,807
list_15 list_09	40,302
list_04 list_02	37,651
list_06 list_09	34,886

Table I.35: Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_07	28,324
list_04 list_08	25,902
list_04 list_09	23,968
list_04 list_15	17,772
list_10 list_02	13,493
list_10 list_09	12,470
list_10 list_07	11,698
list_10 list_08	10,759
list_10 list_04	9,280
list_04 list_06	9,277
list_10 list_15	9,249
list_10 list_06	2,765
list_10 list_01	136
list_01 list_07	65
list_03 list_05	58
list_01 list_15	58
list_01 list_02	57
list_01 list_08	48
list_10 white_04	48
list_01 list_04	47
list_01 list_09	47
feed_10 list_05	29
list_01 list_06	19
list_02 list_05	10
list_03 list_02	6
list_13 feed_10	4
list_13 list_05	4
list_09 list_05	4
list_07 list_05	3
list_10 list_05	3
white_04 list_07	3
white_04 list_09	3
white_04 list_02	3
list_04 list_05	3
white_04 list_15	2
list_15 list_05	2
list_03 feed_10	2
list_03 list_09	2
list_10 list_03	2
list_08 list_05	2
feed_10 list_02	2
list_06 list_05	1
list_03 list_06	1
list_15 list_03	1
white_04 list_08	1
list_04 list_03	1
list_03 list_07	1
white_04 list_06	1
list_03 list_08	1
list_08 feed_10	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0

Table I.35: Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 feed_10	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_01 white_04	0
list_09 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 feed_10	0
list_13 list_07	0
white_04 list_04	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	152,217
list_02	
list_15 list_07	63,876
list_08 list_02	

Table I.35: Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.36: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	37.2707%
list_03 list_05	28.7129%
list_15 list_07	24.9266%
list_15 list_08	21.7546%
list_06 list_07	18.5187%
list_07 list_02	15.6230%

Table I.36: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_09	14.9364%
feed_10 list_05	14.3564%
list_15 list_09	13.5915%
list_08 list_09	13.5895%
list_06 list_08	13.5175%
list_06 list_02	13.3075%
list_08 list_02	12.5004%
list_10 list_04	12.2607%
list_04 list_09	8.9730%
list_15 list_06	8.3606%
list_15 list_02	7.4419%
list_04 list_15	5.9934%
list_04 list_08	5.7331%
list_06 list_09	5.6299%
list_04 list_07	5.4349%
list_09 list_02	5.0911%
list_10 list_09	4.6685%
list_13 feed_10	4.4444%
list_10 list_15	3.1191%
list_10 list_08	2.3814%
list_10 list_07	2.2447%
list_03 feed_10	2.2222%
list_13 list_05	1.9802%
list_04 list_02	1.7107%
list_04 list_06	1.4971%
list_10 list_02	0.6131%
list_10 list_06	0.4462%
list_10 list_01	0.2829%
list_10 white_04	0.0999%
list_01 list_04	0.0621%
list_01 list_15	0.0196%
list_01 list_09	0.0176%
list_01 list_07	0.0125%
list_01 list_08	0.0106%
list_10 list_05	0.0062%
list_10 list_03	0.0042%
list_04 list_05	0.0040%
list_01 list_06	0.0031%
list_01 list_02	0.0026%
list_09 list_05	0.0015%
list_04 list_03	0.0013%
white_04 list_09	0.0011%
white_04 list_15	0.0007%
list_03 list_09	0.0007%
list_15 list_05	0.0007%
white_04 list_07	0.0006%
list_07 list_05	0.0006%
list_02 list_05	0.0005%
list_08 list_05	0.0004%
list_15 list_03	0.0003%
list_03 list_02	0.0003%
list_03 list_08	0.0002%
list_03 list_06	0.0002%
list_08 feed_10	0.0002%

Table I.36: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
white_04 list_08	0.0002%
list_03 list_07	0.0002%
list_06 list_05	0.0002%
white_04 list_06	0.0002%
feed_10 list_02	0.0001%
white_04 list_02	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 white_04	0.0000%
list_09 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_04	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	14.3068%
list_08	
list_15 list_06	3.7732%
list_07 list_08	

Table I.36: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.10 Results for October 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.37: Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	2,085,953
list_06	555,386
list_07	364,657
list_08	320,089
list_09	260,128
list_15	211,598
list_04	75,359
list_10	73,352
list_01	637
list_12	254
list_05	216
white_04	197
feed_10	146
list_03	130
list_13	49

Table I.38: Reverse Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2106827	74.7345%
2	457794	16.2391%
3	151526	5.3750%
4	63851	2.2650%
5	25160	0.8925%
6	8690	0.3083%
7	4057	0.1439%
8	1169	0.0415%
9	7	0.0002%

Table I.39: Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	254,427
list_07 list_02	237,082
list_08 list_02	191,622
list_15 list_02	115,499
list_09 list_02	113,148
list_07 list_08	109,626
list_06 list_07	80,848
list_15 list_07	78,367
list_07 list_09	68,026
list_06 list_08	61,250
list_15 list_08	57,247
list_08 list_09	50,917
list_06 list_09	43,386
list_04 list_02	39,111
list_15 list_06	38,999
list_15 list_09	32,611

Table I.39: Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_07	27,530
list_04 list_09	25,125
list_04 list_08	23,519
list_10 list_02	23,041
list_10 list_07	18,729
list_10 list_09	18,674
list_04 list_15	16,276
list_10 list_08	16,002
list_04 list_06	15,485
list_10 list_15	13,227
list_10 list_04	12,799
list_10 list_06	11,974
list_10 list_01	251
list_01 list_02	110
list_01 list_04	95
list_01 list_06	88
list_01 list_07	85
list_01 list_08	84
list_03 list_05	72
list_01 list_15	71
list_01 list_09	49
feed_10 list_05	38
list_10 white_04	26
list_03 feed_10	21
list_02 list_05	13
list_03 list_02	5
list_15 list_05	4
list_09 feed_10	4
list_10 feed_10	4
list_10 list_05	4
list_04 list_05	4
list_09 list_05	4
list_06 list_05	3
list_07 list_05	3
list_08 list_05	3
white_04 list_02	3
feed_10 list_02	3
list_04 feed_10	2
list_01 white_04	2
list_03 list_09	2
list_04 list_03	2
list_10 list_03	2
list_15 feed_10	1
list_03 list_06	1
white_04 list_15	1
list_13 feed_10	1
list_03 list_07	1
list_13 list_08	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0

Table I.39: Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_13	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_15 list_03	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
white_04 list_08	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 list_06	0
white_04 feed_10	0
white_04 list_07	0
list_03 list_08	0
white_04 list_09	0
list_13 list_07	0
white_04 list_04	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	85,368
list_02	
list_15 list_07	32,374
list_08 list_02	

Table I.39: Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.40: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	33.3333%
list_07 list_08	30.0628%
list_15 list_07	21.4906%
list_07 list_09	18.6548%
list_15 list_08	17.8847%
feed_10 list_05	17.5926%

Table I.40: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_10 list_04	16.9840%
list_08 list_09	15.9071%
list_06 list_07	14.5571%
list_03 feed_10	14.3836%
list_15 list_09	12.5365%
list_06 list_02	12.1972%
list_07 list_02	11.3656%
list_06 list_08	11.0284%
list_04 list_09	9.6587%
list_08 list_02	9.1863%
list_06 list_09	7.8119%
list_04 list_15	7.6919%
list_04 list_07	7.5496%
list_04 list_08	7.3476%
list_10 list_09	7.1788%
list_15 list_06	7.0220%
list_10 list_15	6.2510%
list_15 list_02	5.5370%
list_09 list_02	5.4243%
list_10 list_07	5.1361%
list_10 list_08	4.9992%
list_04 list_06	2.7882%
list_10 list_06	2.1560%
list_04 list_02	1.8750%
list_10 list_02	1.1046%
list_13 feed_10	0.6849%
list_10 list_01	0.3422%
list_01 white_04	0.3140%
list_01 list_04	0.1261%
list_10 white_04	0.0354%
list_01 list_15	0.0336%
list_01 list_08	0.0262%
list_01 list_07	0.0233%
list_01 list_09	0.0188%
list_01 list_06	0.0158%
list_10 list_05	0.0055%
list_10 feed_10	0.0055%
list_01 list_02	0.0053%
list_04 list_05	0.0053%
list_04 list_03	0.0027%
list_10 list_03	0.0027%
list_04 feed_10	0.0027%
list_15 list_05	0.0019%
list_09 feed_10	0.0015%
list_09 list_05	0.0015%
list_08 list_05	0.0009%
list_03 list_09	0.0008%
list_07 list_05	0.0008%
list_02 list_05	0.0006%
white_04 list_15	0.0005%
list_15 feed_10	0.0005%
list_06 list_05	0.0005%
list_03 list_07	0.0003%
list_03 list_06	0.0002%

Table I.40: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_02	0.0002%
feed_10 list_02	0.0001%
white_04 list_02	0.0001%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_07	0.0000%
list_03 list_08	0.0000%
white_04 list_09	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_04	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_15 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	10.5214%
list_08	
list_15 list_07	3.7871%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.40: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.11 Results for November 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.41: Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	2,161,058
list_06	544,338
list_08	378,927
list_07	332,993
list_15	271,958
list_09	255,764
list_10	73,865
list_04	72,048
list_01	513
list_12	501
white_04	197
list_05	128
feed_10	79
list_03	49
list_13	38

Table I.42: Reverse Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2160495	74.1289%
2	488656	16.7663%
3	158837	5.4499%
4	69218	2.3749%
5	26755	0.9180%
6	7054	0.2420%
7	2820	0.0968%
8	675	0.0232%
9	3	0.0001%

Table I.43: Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	257,529
list_08 list_02	227,854
list_07 list_02	215,934
list_15 list_02	150,442
list_07 list_08	117,552
list_09 list_02	103,740
list_15 list_07	85,274
list_15 list_08	81,127
list_06 list_07	71,059
list_06 list_08	68,253
list_07 list_09	58,208
list_08 list_09	49,862
list_15 list_06	47,737
list_06 list_09	36,645
list_04 list_02	34,230
list_15 list_09	31,290

Table I.43: Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_09	22,230
list_04 list_07	22,019
list_04 list_08	21,072
list_10 list_02	20,292
list_10 list_09	17,807
list_10 list_08	15,277
list_10 list_07	15,263
list_04 list_15	14,753
list_10 list_15	12,398
list_04 list_06	12,042
list_10 list_04	11,890
list_10 list_06	9,494
list_10 list_01	209
list_01 list_02	93
list_01 list_15	70
list_01 list_04	62
list_01 list_08	58
list_01 list_09	57
list_10 white_04	47
list_01 list_07	47
list_01 list_06	47
list_03 list_05	20
list_02 list_05	13
list_09 list_05	9
feed_10 list_05	7
list_10 list_05	5
white_04 list_02	5
list_04 list_05	5
list_03 list_02	4
list_03 feed_10	4
list_03 list_09	4
list_01 white_04	3
list_08 list_05	3
list_15 list_05	2
list_15 list_03	2
white_04 list_08	2
list_04 list_03	2
white_04 list_09	2
list_06 list_05	1
list_13 feed_10	1
list_07 list_05	1
list_10 list_03	1
list_03 list_07	1
white_04 list_06	1
white_04 list_07	1
list_03 list_08	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_04 feed_10	0
list_03 list_06	0
white_04 list_15	0
list_12 list_13	0

Table I.43: Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_09 feed_10	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
white_04 feed_10	0
list_13 list_07	0
white_04 list_04	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_12 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	90,529
list_02	
list_15 list_07	41,789
list_08 list_02	

Table I.43: Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.44: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	31.0223%
list_15 list_07	25.6083%
list_15 list_08	21.4097%
list_07 list_09	17.4802%
list_10 list_04	16.0969%
list_03 list_05	15.6250%

Table I.44: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_08 list_09	13.1587%
list_06 list_07	13.0542%
list_06 list_08	12.5387%
list_06 list_02	11.9168%
list_15 list_09	11.5055%
list_08 list_02	10.5436%
list_07 list_02	9.9921%
list_15 list_06	8.7697%
list_04 list_09	8.6916%
list_10 list_09	6.9623%
list_15 list_02	6.9615%
list_06 list_09	6.7320%
list_04 list_07	6.6125%
list_04 list_08	5.5610%
feed_10 list_05	5.4688%
list_04 list_15	5.4247%
list_03 feed_10	5.0633%
list_09 list_02	4.8004%
list_10 list_07	4.5836%
list_10 list_15	4.5588%
list_10 list_08	4.0316%
list_04 list_06	2.2122%
list_10 list_06	1.7441%
list_04 list_02	1.5839%
list_13 feed_10	1.2658%
list_10 list_02	0.9390%
list_01 white_04	0.5848%
list_10 list_01	0.2829%
list_01 list_04	0.0861%
list_10 white_04	0.0636%
list_01 list_15	0.0257%
list_01 list_09	0.0223%
list_01 list_08	0.0153%
list_01 list_07	0.0141%
list_01 list_06	0.0086%
list_04 list_05	0.0069%
list_10 list_05	0.0068%
list_01 list_02	0.0043%
list_09 list_05	0.0035%
list_04 list_03	0.0028%
list_03 list_09	0.0016%
list_10 list_03	0.0014%
white_04 list_09	0.0008%
list_08 list_05	0.0008%
list_15 list_03	0.0007%
list_15 list_05	0.0007%
list_02 list_05	0.0006%
white_04 list_08	0.0005%
list_03 list_08	0.0003%
white_04 list_07	0.0003%
list_07 list_05	0.0003%
list_03 list_07	0.0003%
white_04 list_02	0.0002%
list_03 list_02	0.0002%

Table I.44: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_06 list_05	0.0002%
white_04 list_06	0.0002%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
white_04 list_15	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_09 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_04	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	13.0204%
list_08	
list_15 list_07	3.2072%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.44: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.12 Results for December 2012 (DNSBL)

Table I.45: Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	1,999,871
list_06	529,598
list_08	376,367
list_07	302,826
list_09	239,631
list_15	229,971
list_10	72,459
list_04	62,509
list_01	803
list_03	479
list_12	361
list_05	229
feed_10	148
white_04	145
list_13	41

Table I.46: Reverse Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1938844	72.9176%
2	451529	16.9815%
3	157267	5.9146%
4	71146	2.6757%
5	29188	1.0977%
6	7017	0.2639%
7	2613	0.0983%
8	1316	0.0495%
9	31	0.0012%
11	1	0.0000%

Table I.47: Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	267,648
list_08 list_02	242,615
list_07 list_02	217,444
list_15 list_02	134,842
list_07 list_08	121,545
list_09 list_02	99,436
list_06 list_08	83,127
list_15 list_07	80,342
list_06 list_07	79,076
list_15 list_08	78,434
list_07 list_09	50,104
list_15 list_06	49,745
list_08 list_09	47,036
list_06 list_09	38,505
list_04 list_02	32,781

Table I.47: Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_09	26,353
list_10 list_02	20,949
list_04 list_08	20,590
list_04 list_09	19,416
list_04 list_07	18,108
list_10 list_09	17,465
list_10 list_08	15,776
list_10 list_07	13,914
list_04 list_06	13,386
list_10 list_06	13,341
list_04 list_15	13,250
list_10 list_15	11,951
list_10 list_04	11,424
list_10 list_01	297
list_01 list_06	131
list_01 list_09	112
list_01 list_02	107
list_01 list_04	106
list_01 list_15	94
list_10 list_03	88
list_03 list_05	88
list_01 list_08	74
list_01 list_07	64
list_03 list_09	45
list_03 list_02	43
feed_10 list_05	39
list_04 list_03	36
list_03 list_06	34
list_10 white_04	32
list_03 list_07	31
list_03 list_08	30
list_15 list_03	29
list_02 list_05	20
list_10 list_05	16
list_06 list_05	15
list_09 list_05	14
list_03 feed_10	13
list_07 list_05	7
list_04 list_05	7
list_15 list_05	5
white_04 list_06	5
feed_10 list_02	5
white_04 list_15	3
list_10 feed_10	3
white_04 list_07	3
white_04 list_09	3
list_08 list_05	3
list_15 feed_10	2
list_01 list_03	2
list_01 white_04	2
list_13 feed_10	2
list_07 feed_10	2
white_04 list_08	2
white_04 list_02	2

Table I.47: Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_01 list_05	2
list_06 feed_10	2
list_12 list_08	1
list_04 feed_10	1
list_09 feed_10	1
list_15 list_12	1
white_04 feed_10	1
white_04 list_04	1
list_12 list_06	1
list_12 list_07	1
list_08 feed_10	1
list_12 list_02	1
list_13 list_08	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_04 list_13	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	99,918
list_02	
list_15 list_07	43,835
list_08 list_02	

Table I.47: Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.48: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	32.2943%
list_15 list_07	26.5307%
list_15 list_08	20.8398%
list_03 list_05	18.3716%
feed_10 list_05	17.0306%

Table I.48: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_09	16.5455%
list_10 list_04	15.7662%
list_06 list_08	15.6962%
list_06 list_07	14.9313%
list_06 list_02	13.3833%
list_08 list_09	12.4974%
list_08 list_02	12.1315%
list_15 list_09	10.9973%
list_07 list_02	10.8729%
list_15 list_06	9.3930%
list_04 list_09	8.1025%
list_10 list_09	7.2883%
list_06 list_09	7.2706%
list_15 list_02	6.7425%
list_04 list_07	5.9797%
list_04 list_15	5.7616%
list_04 list_08	5.4707%
list_10 list_15	5.1967%
list_09 list_02	4.9721%
list_10 list_07	4.5947%
list_10 list_08	4.1917%
list_03 feed_10	2.7140%
list_04 list_06	2.5276%
list_10 list_06	2.5191%
list_04 list_02	1.6392%
list_13 feed_10	1.3514%
list_10 list_02	1.0475%
white_04 feed_10	0.6757%
list_10 list_01	0.4099%
list_01 list_03	0.2491%
list_01 list_05	0.2491%
list_01 white_04	0.2491%
list_01 list_04	0.1696%
list_10 list_03	0.1214%
list_04 list_03	0.0576%
list_01 list_09	0.0467%
list_10 white_04	0.0442%
list_01 list_15	0.0409%
list_01 list_06	0.0247%
list_10 list_05	0.0221%
list_01 list_07	0.0211%
list_01 list_08	0.0197%
list_03 list_09	0.0188%
list_15 list_03	0.0126%
list_04 list_05	0.0112%
list_03 list_07	0.0102%
list_03 list_08	0.0080%
list_03 list_06	0.0064%
list_09 list_05	0.0058%
list_01 list_02	0.0054%
list_10 feed_10	0.0041%
list_06 list_05	0.0028%
list_07 list_05	0.0023%
list_15 list_05	0.0022%

Table I.48: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_02	0.0022%
white_04 list_04	0.0016%
list_04 feed_10	0.0016%
white_04 list_15	0.0013%
white_04 list_09	0.0013%
list_02 list_05	0.0010%
white_04 list_07	0.0010%
list_15 feed_10	0.0009%
white_04 list_06	0.0009%
list_08 list_05	0.0008%
list_07 feed_10	0.0007%
white_04 list_08	0.0005%
list_09 feed_10	0.0004%
list_06 feed_10	0.0004%
list_15 list_12	0.0004%
list_08 feed_10	0.0003%
list_12 list_07	0.0003%
feed_10 list_02	0.0003%
list_12 list_08	0.0003%
list_12 list_06	0.0002%
list_12 list_02	0.0001%
white_04 list_02	0.0001%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	13.3359%
list_08	
list_15 list_06	3.8935%
list_07 list_08	

Table I.48: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.13 Results for January 2013 (DNSBL)

Table I.49: Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	3,436,032
list_06	913,954
list_08	514,925
list_09	436,262
list_07	396,581
list_15	327,528
list_04	135,508
list_10	101,796
list_01	2,846
white_04	2,170
list_12	1,224
list_03	391
feed_10	254
list_05	221
list_13	54

Table I.50: Reverse Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2839341	69.7633%
2	731899	17.9829%
3	251206	6.1722%
4	121194	2.9778%
5	66508	1.6341%
6	32904	0.8085%
7	17230	0.4233%
8	9501	0.2334%
9	179	0.0044%
10	2	0.0000%

Table I.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	562,151
list_08 list_02	432,422
list_07 list_02	366,022
list_09 list_02	304,549
list_15 list_02	268,004
list_07 list_08	178,508
list_06 list_08	166,386
list_06 list_07	159,095
list_06 list_09	136,156
list_15 list_07	132,030
list_15 list_08	131,624
list_08 list_09	118,971
list_04 list_02	117,639
list_07 list_09	115,694
list_15 list_06	106,380

Table I.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_09	76,535
list_10 list_02	72,582
list_04 list_08	72,363
list_04 list_07	68,007
list_04 list_09	60,472
list_04 list_06	56,797
list_04 list_15	53,848
list_10 list_09	51,490
list_10 list_08	47,525
list_10 list_06	44,077
list_10 list_07	36,196
list_10 list_15	30,941
list_10 list_04	29,947
list_01 list_06	1,691
white_04 list_06	959
list_01 list_09	872
list_10 list_01	857
list_01 list_02	842
list_10 white_04	732
list_01 list_04	666
list_01 list_07	619
list_01 list_08	577
list_01 list_15	457
list_01 white_04	302
white_04 list_07	105
list_03 list_05	77
list_03 list_02	50
list_02 list_05	44
feed_10 list_05	44
white_04 list_02	36
list_03 feed_10	28
list_09 list_05	25
list_03 list_09	24
list_06 feed_10	19
list_06 list_05	18
list_10 feed_10	18
list_04 list_05	18
feed_10 list_02	18
list_03 list_06	16
white_04 feed_10	16
white_04 list_09	16
list_04 list_03	14
white_04 list_15	11
list_10 list_03	10
list_03 list_08	10
list_09 feed_10	9
white_04 list_08	9
list_10 list_05	9
list_08 list_05	9
white_04 list_04	8
list_15 list_05	7
list_13 feed_10	7
list_03 list_07	7
list_15 list_03	6

Table I.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_01 feed_10	6
list_04 feed_10	5
list_07 list_05	5
list_15 feed_10	3
list_12 list_13	3
list_13 list_05	3
list_08 feed_10	3
list_12 list_02	3
list_01 list_05	3
list_12 feed_10	2
list_01 list_03	1
list_07 feed_10	1
list_12 list_09	1
list_12 list_06	1
list_13 list_08	0
white_04 list_05	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_04 list_13	0
white_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0
list_12 list_03	0
white_04 list_12	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
white_04 list_03	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	175,297
list_02	
list_06 list_07	92,031
list_08 list_02	

Table I.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.52: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	34.6668%
list_15 list_07	33.2921%
list_07 list_09	26.5194%
list_15 list_08	25.5618%
list_08 list_09	23.1045%

Table I.52: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_10 list_04	22.0998%
list_03 list_05	19.6931%
list_06 list_08	18.2051%
list_15 list_09	17.5434%
list_06 list_07	17.4073%
feed_10 list_05	17.3228%
list_04 list_07	17.1483%
list_04 list_15	16.4407%
list_06 list_02	16.3605%
list_06 list_09	14.8975%
list_04 list_08	14.0531%
list_04 list_09	13.8614%
list_08 list_02	12.5849%
list_10 list_09	11.8025%
list_15 list_06	11.6395%
list_07 list_02	10.6525%
list_01 white_04	10.6114%
list_10 list_15	9.4468%
list_10 list_08	9.2295%
list_10 list_07	9.1270%
list_09 list_02	8.8634%
list_15 list_02	7.7998%
list_03 feed_10	7.1611%
list_04 list_06	6.2144%
list_10 list_06	4.8227%
list_04 list_02	3.4237%
list_13 feed_10	2.7559%
list_10 list_02	2.1124%
list_13 list_05	1.3575%
list_10 list_01	0.8419%
white_04 feed_10	0.7373%
list_10 white_04	0.7191%
list_01 list_04	0.4915%
list_12 list_13	0.2451%
list_01 feed_10	0.2108%
list_01 list_09	0.1999%
list_01 list_06	0.1850%
list_12 feed_10	0.1634%
list_01 list_07	0.1561%
list_01 list_15	0.1395%
list_01 list_08	0.1121%
list_01 list_05	0.1054%
white_04 list_06	0.1049%
list_01 list_03	0.0351%
white_04 list_07	0.0265%
list_01 list_02	0.0245%
list_10 feed_10	0.0177%
list_04 list_05	0.0133%
list_04 list_03	0.0103%
list_10 list_03	0.0098%
list_10 list_05	0.0088%
white_04 list_04	0.0059%
list_09 list_05	0.0057%
list_03 list_09	0.0055%

Table I.52: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
white_04 list_09	0.0037%
list_04 feed_10	0.0037%
white_04 list_15	0.0034%
list_09 feed_10	0.0021%
list_06 feed_10	0.0021%
list_15 list_05	0.0021%
list_06 list_05	0.0020%
list_03 list_08	0.0019%
list_03 list_06	0.0018%
list_15 list_03	0.0018%
list_03 list_07	0.0018%
white_04 list_08	0.0017%
list_08 list_05	0.0017%
list_03 list_02	0.0015%
list_02 list_05	0.0013%
list_07 list_05	0.0013%
white_04 list_02	0.0010%
list_15 feed_10	0.0009%
list_08 feed_10	0.0006%
feed_10 list_02	0.0005%
list_07 feed_10	0.0003%
list_12 list_09	0.0002%
list_12 list_02	0.0001%
list_12 list_06	0.0001%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_05	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
white_04 list_03	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
white_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
white_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_15 list_07	16.9652%
list_08	
list_15 list_07	7.8891%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.52: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.14 Results for February 2013 (DNSBL)

Table I.53: Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	2,902,751
list_06	781,922
list_08	466,340
list_09	404,836
list_07	328,932
list_15	242,794
list_10	184,182
list_04	73,794
feed_10	2,117
list_03	1,702
list_01	1,240
list_12	595
list_05	72
list_13	21

Table I.54: Reverse Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2543558	70.7673%
2	642190	17.8671%
3	222725	6.1967%
4	97672	2.7174%
5	46502	1.2938%
6	24012	0.6681%
7	12876	0.3582%
8	4697	0.1307%
9	23	0.0006%

Table I.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	440,008
list_08 list_02	336,498
list_07 list_02	274,006
list_09 list_02	254,289
list_15 list_02	179,054
list_06 list_08	125,191
list_07 list_08	124,654
list_06 list_07	121,600
list_06 list_09	119,847
list_07 list_09	112,305
list_08 list_09	101,356
list_10 list_02	96,694
list_15 list_07	89,563
list_15 list_08	89,201
list_15 list_06	78,378
list_15 list_09	71,588
list_10 list_08	66,938

Table I.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_10 list_09	65,607
list_10 list_06	60,884
list_10 list_07	58,040
list_10 list_15	51,305
list_04 list_02	46,692
list_04 list_09	30,384
list_04 list_08	27,550
list_10 list_04	26,133
list_04 list_06	25,935
list_04 list_07	25,542
list_04 list_15	21,909
list_10 list_01	726
list_01 list_02	322
list_01 list_15	318
list_01 list_04	291
list_01 list_09	283
list_01 list_08	199
list_03 list_02	158
list_01 list_06	131
list_01 list_07	119
list_10 list_03	91
list_03 list_09	87
list_03 list_06	81
list_03 list_07	70
list_03 list_08	68
list_15 list_03	65
list_04 list_03	43
list_03 list_05	38
list_03 feed_10	31
list_02 list_05	13
feed_10 list_05	11
feed_10 list_02	7
list_09 list_05	7
list_06 list_05	5
list_13 feed_10	3
list_10 list_05	3
list_08 list_05	3
list_04 list_05	3
list_15 list_05	2
list_09 feed_10	2
list_15 feed_10	1
list_12 feed_10	1
list_07 list_05	1
list_13 list_03	1
list_08 feed_10	1
list_06 feed_10	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_04 feed_10	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_01 list_03	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_01 list_12	0

Table I.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_09	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_01 list_05	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_07 list_08	112,860
list_02	
list_06 list_07	55,277
list_08 list_02	

Table I.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.56: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_09	27.7409%
list_15 list_07	27.2284%
list_07 list_08	26.7303%
list_08 list_09	21.7344%
list_10 list_15	21.1311%
list_15 list_08	19.1279%
list_15 list_09	17.6832%
list_10 list_07	17.6450%
list_10 list_09	16.2058%
list_06 list_08	16.0107%
list_06 list_07	15.5514%
list_06 list_09	15.3272%
list_06 list_02	15.1583%
list_10 list_08	14.3539%
list_10 list_04	14.1887%
list_08 list_02	11.5924%
list_15 list_06	10.0238%
list_07 list_02	9.4395%
list_04 list_15	9.0237%
list_09 list_02	8.7603%
list_10 list_06	7.7865%

Table I.56: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_04 list_07	7.7651%
list_04 list_09	7.5053%
list_15 list_02	6.1684%
list_04 list_08	5.9077%
list_10 list_02	3.3311%
list_04 list_06	3.3168%
list_03 list_05	2.2327%
list_04 list_02	1.6085%
list_03 feed_10	1.4643%
feed_10 list_05	0.5196%
list_01 list_04	0.3943%
list_10 list_01	0.3942%
list_13 feed_10	0.1417%
list_01 list_15	0.1310%
list_01 list_09	0.0699%
list_13 list_03	0.0588%
list_04 list_03	0.0583%
list_10 list_03	0.0494%
list_12 feed_10	0.0472%
list_01 list_08	0.0427%
list_01 list_07	0.0362%
list_15 list_03	0.0268%
list_03 list_09	0.0215%
list_03 list_07	0.0213%
list_01 list_06	0.0168%
list_03 list_08	0.0146%
list_01 list_02	0.0111%
list_03 list_06	0.0104%
list_03 list_02	0.0054%
list_04 list_05	0.0041%
list_09 list_05	0.0017%
list_10 list_05	0.0016%
list_15 list_05	0.0008%
list_08 list_05	0.0006%
list_06 list_05	0.0006%
list_09 feed_10	0.0005%
list_15 feed_10	0.0004%
list_02 list_05	0.0004%
list_07 list_05	0.0003%
list_08 feed_10	0.0002%
feed_10 list_02	0.0002%
list_06 feed_10	0.0001%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%

Table I.56: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_12 list_09	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_01 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_01 list_05	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_07 list_08	12.6929%
list_09	
list_15 list_07	7.0159%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.56: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

I.15 Results for March 2013 (DNSBL)

Table I.57: Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_02	2,371,378
list_06	753,246
list_09	404,444
list_07	341,829
list_08	312,994
list_10	226,240
list_15	190,299
list_04	72,786
list_03	1,385
list_01	772
list_12	463
feed_10	89
list_05	55
list_13	13

Table I.58: Reverse Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2145982	69.7823%
2	553594	18.0016%
3	203735	6.6250%
4	94700	3.0794%
5	44919	1.4607%
6	20613	0.6703%
7	9130	0.2969%
8	2567	0.0835%
9	11	0.0004%

Table I.59: Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_06 list_02	410,567
list_07 list_02	255,184
list_09 list_02	243,004
list_08 list_02	216,868
list_06 list_07	146,816
list_06 list_09	131,018
list_15 list_02	126,026
list_07 list_09	122,060
list_07 list_08	105,264
list_06 list_08	102,289
list_10 list_02	91,589
list_08 list_09	81,998
list_15 list_07	77,120
list_15 list_06	72,278
list_10 list_06	64,975
list_15 list_09	60,963
list_10 list_07	60,545

Table I.59: Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_15 list_08	58,575
list_10 list_09	57,796
list_10 list_08	50,613
list_10 list_15	39,984
list_04 list_02	39,586
list_04 list_09	25,526
list_04 list_06	25,514
list_04 list_07	25,257
list_10 list_04	23,233
list_04 list_08	20,932
list_04 list_15	17,351
list_10 list_01	449
list_01 list_02	270
list_01 list_04	255
list_01 list_09	238
list_01 list_15	208
list_01 list_08	163
list_03 list_02	134
list_10 list_03	114
list_01 list_07	111
list_01 list_06	83
list_03 list_06	77
list_03 list_09	70
list_03 list_07	59
list_03 list_08	53
list_15 list_03	50
list_04 list_03	37
list_03 list_05	29
list_02 list_05	13
list_03 feed_10	11
list_10 list_05	6
list_09 list_05	5
list_04 list_05	4
list_15 list_05	3
list_07 list_05	2
list_01 list_05	2
list_06 list_05	1
list_01 list_03	1
list_13 feed_10	1
list_12 list_09	1
feed_10 list_05	1
list_08 list_05	1
list_12 list_06	1
list_12 list_07	1
list_12 list_02	1
list_13 list_08	0
list_15 feed_10	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_04 feed_10	0
list_12 list_13	0
list_15 list_13	0
list_12 feed_10	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_09 feed_10	0

Table I.59: Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_01 list_12	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_12 list_03	0
list_01 feed_10	0
list_13 list_05	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_13 list_09	0
list_10 list_12	0
list_10 feed_10	0
list_15 list_12	0
list_13 list_03	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_10 list_13	0
list_12 list_05	0
list_01 list_13	0
list_08 feed_10	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_07	118,665
list_02	
list_06 list_07	56,362
list_09 list_02	

Table I.59: Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Table I.60: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_07 list_08	30.7943%
list_07 list_09	30.1797%
list_15 list_07	22.5610%
list_08 list_09	20.2743%
list_06 list_07	19.4911%
list_15 list_08	18.7144%
list_10 list_07	17.7121%
list_10 list_15	17.6733%
list_06 list_09	17.3938%
list_06 list_02	17.3134%
list_10 list_08	16.1706%
list_15 list_09	15.0733%
list_10 list_09	14.2902%
list_06 list_08	13.5798%
list_07 list_02	10.7610%
list_10 list_04	10.2692%
list_09 list_02	10.2474%
list_15 list_06	9.5955%
list_08 list_02	9.1452%
list_04 list_15	9.1178%
list_10 list_06	8.6260%

Table I.60: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_04 list_07	7.3888%
list_04 list_08	6.6877%
list_04 list_09	6.3114%
list_15 list_02	5.3145%
list_10 list_02	3.8623%
list_04 list_06	3.3872%
list_03 list_05	2.0939%
list_04 list_02	1.6693%
feed_10 list_05	1.1236%
list_13 feed_10	1.1236%
list_03 feed_10	0.7942%
list_01 list_04	0.3503%
list_01 list_05	0.2591%
list_10 list_01	0.1985%
list_01 list_15	0.1093%
list_01 list_03	0.0722%
list_01 list_09	0.0588%
list_01 list_08	0.0521%
list_04 list_03	0.0508%
list_10 list_03	0.0504%
list_01 list_07	0.0325%
list_15 list_03	0.0263%
list_03 list_09	0.0173%
list_03 list_07	0.0173%
list_03 list_08	0.0169%
list_01 list_02	0.0114%
list_01 list_06	0.0110%
list_03 list_06	0.0102%
list_03 list_02	0.0057%
list_04 list_05	0.0055%
list_10 list_05	0.0027%
list_15 list_05	0.0016%
list_09 list_05	0.0012%
list_07 list_05	0.0006%
list_02 list_05	0.0005%
list_12 list_07	0.0003%
list_08 list_05	0.0003%
list_12 list_09	0.0002%
list_12 list_06	0.0001%
list_06 list_05	0.0001%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_15 feed_10	0.0000%
list_10 list_13	0.0000%
list_10 list_12	0.0000%
list_10 feed_10	0.0000%
list_15 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_03	0.0000%
list_04 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_03	0.0000%
list_01 feed_10	0.0000%

Table I.60: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_15 list_13	0.0000%
list_12 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_01 list_13	0.0000%
list_09 feed_10	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
list_13 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_13 list_09	0.0000%
list_01 list_12	0.0000%
list_07 list_08	12.6665%
list_09	
list_15 list_07	5.8406%
list_08 list_09	

Table I.60: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – DNSBL (Continued)

J Time Series – IP-Based Lists – Feeds

J.1 Results for February 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.1: Count – February 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_07	24,067
feed_09	2,254

Table J.2: Reverse Count – February 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	24255	95.9151%
2	1033	4.0849%

Table J.3: Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_07 feed_09	1,033

Table J.3: Intersection by Count – February 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.4: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	4.2922%

Table J.4: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.2 Results for March 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.5: Count – March 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_09	1,235
feed_07	912

Table J.6: Reverse Count – March 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1379	78.2189%
2	384	21.7811%

Table J.7: Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_07 feed_09	384

Table J.7: Intersection by Count – March 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.8: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	31.0931%

Table J.8: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.3 Results for April 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.9: Count – April 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,034,293
feed_09	1,047
feed_07	807
feed_10	1

Table J.10: Reverse Count – April 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1035518	99.9696%
2	315	0.0304%

Table J.11: Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_07 feed_09	313
feed_03 feed_09	2
feed_03 feed_07	0
feed_09 feed_10	0
feed_07 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_10	0

Table J.11: Intersection by Count – April 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.12: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	29.8949%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0002%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0000%
feed_07 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_09 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%

Table J.12: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.4 Results for May 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.13: Count – May 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	4,712,250
feed_02	39,966
feed_09	909
feed_07	694
feed_10	1

Table J.14: Reverse Count – May 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	4751511	99.9786%
2	740	0.0156%
3	275	0.0058%
4	1	0.0000%

Table J.15: Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_07	693
feed_02 feed_09	385
feed_07 feed_09	272
feed_02 feed_03	213
feed_03 feed_07	5
feed_03 feed_09	2
feed_02 feed_10	1
feed_07 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_09 feed_10	0
feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	272

Table J.15: Intersection by Count – May 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.16: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	29.9230%
feed_02 feed_07	1.7340%
feed_02 feed_09	0.9633%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0045%
feed_02 feed_10	0.0025%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0001%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0000%
feed_09 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_07 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%

Table J.16: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_02 feed_07 feed_09	0.6806%

Table J.16: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.5 Results for June 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.17: Count – June 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	11,418,587
feed_02	305,668
feed_09	847
feed_07	771

Table J.18: Reverse Count – June 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	11719080	99.9720%
2	3043	0.0260%
3	229	0.0020%
4	5	0.0000%

Table J.19: Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_03	2,474
feed_02 feed_07	748
feed_02 feed_09	279
feed_07 feed_09	228
feed_03 feed_07	20
feed_03 feed_09	11

Table J.19: Intersection by Count – June 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.20: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	26.9185%
feed_02 feed_07	0.2447%
feed_02 feed_09	0.0913%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0217%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0002%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0001%

Table J.20: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.6 Results for July 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.21: Count – July 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	3,356,895
feed_02	397,508
feed_09	881
feed_07	836

Table J.22: Reverse Count – July 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	3751124	99.9370%
2	2102	0.0560%
3	264	0.0070%

Table J.23: Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_03	1,475
feed_02 feed_07	790
feed_02 feed_09	349
feed_07 feed_09	276
feed_03 feed_07	3
feed_03 feed_09	1

Table J.23: Intersection by Count – July 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.24: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	31.3280%
feed_02 feed_07	0.1987%
feed_02 feed_09	0.0878%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0439%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0001%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0000%

Table J.24: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.7 Results for August 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.25: Count – August 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	2,507,672
feed_02	361,748
feed_07	902
feed_09	805

Table J.26: Reverse Count – August 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2867009	99.9325%
2	1695	0.0591%
3	240	0.0084%
4	2	0.0001%

Table J.27: Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_03	1,043
feed_02 feed_07	839
feed_02 feed_09	278
feed_07 feed_09	248
feed_03 feed_07	14
feed_03 feed_09	5

Table J.27: Intersection by Count – August 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.28: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	27.4945%
feed_02 feed_07	0.2319%
feed_02 feed_09	0.0768%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0416%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0006%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0002%

Table J.28: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.8 Results for September 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.29: Count – September 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	937,259
feed_02	327,621
feed_09	963
feed_07	919

Table J.30: Reverse Count – September 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1263663	99.8878%
2	1159	0.0916%
3	259	0.0205%
4	1	0.0001%

Table J.31: Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_07	843
feed_02 feed_03	473
feed_02 feed_09	336
feed_07 feed_09	283
feed_03 feed_07	6
feed_03 feed_09	1

Table J.31: Intersection by Count – September 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.32: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	29.3873%
feed_02 feed_07	0.2573%
feed_02 feed_09	0.1026%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0505%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0006%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0001%

Table J.32: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.9 Results for October 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.33: Count – October 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,787,145
feed_02	314,251
feed_07	1,175
feed_09	911

Table J.34: Reverse Count – October 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2099271	99.9061%
2	1711	0.0814%
3	263	0.0125%

Table J.35: Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_07	1,001
feed_02 feed_03	866
feed_02 feed_09	323
feed_07 feed_09	293
feed_03 feed_07	13
feed_03 feed_09	4

Table J.35: Intersection by Count – October 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.36: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	24.9362%
feed_02 feed_07	0.3185%
feed_02 feed_09	0.1028%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0485%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0007%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0002%

Table J.36: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.10 Results for November 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.37: Count – November 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	2,423,811
feed_02	280,326
feed_09	928
feed_07	897

Table J.38: Reverse Count – November 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2702336	99.9383%
2	1383	0.0511%
3	284	0.0105%
4	2	0.0001%

Table J.39: Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_07	797
feed_02 feed_03	790
feed_02 feed_09	343
feed_07 feed_09	312
feed_03 feed_07	3
feed_03 feed_09	2

Table J.39: Intersection by Count – November 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.40: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	33.6207%
feed_02 feed_07	0.2843%
feed_02 feed_09	0.1224%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0326%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0001%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0001%

Table J.40: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.11 Results for December 2012 (Feeds)

Table J.41: Count – December 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	2,602,347
feed_02	288,028
feed_09	1,082
feed_07	951

Table J.42: Reverse Count – December 2012 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2888861	99.9441%
2	1298	0.0449%
3	317	0.0110%

Table J.43: Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_07	827
feed_02 feed_03	663
feed_02 feed_09	386
feed_07 feed_09	364
feed_03 feed_09	6
feed_03 feed_07	3

Table J.43: Intersection by Count – December 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.44: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	33.6414%
feed_02 feed_07	0.2871%
feed_02 feed_09	0.1340%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0255%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0002%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0001%

Table J.44: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.12 Results for January 2013 (Feeds)

Table J.45: Count – January 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	3,978,341
feed_02	639,990
feed_07	34,029
feed_09	2,869

Table J.46: Reverse Count – January 2013 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	4635389	99.8017%
2	7799	0.1679%
3	1406	0.0303%
4	6	0.0001%

Table J.47: Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_07	5,269
feed_02 feed_03	3,588
feed_02 feed_09	1,529
feed_07 feed_09	1,449
feed_03 feed_07	200
feed_03 feed_09	18

Table J.47: Intersection by Count – January 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.48: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	4.2581%
feed_02 feed_07	0.8233%
feed_02 feed_09	0.2389%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0902%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0050%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0005%

Table J.48: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.13 Results for February 2013 (Feeds)

Table J.49: Count – February 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	2,962,609
feed_02	308,492
feed_09	1,257
feed_07	1,178

Table J.50: Reverse Count – February 2013 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	3268643	99.9310%
2	1881	0.0575%
3	377	0.0115%

Table J.51: Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_03	1,073
feed_02 feed_07	1,061
feed_02 feed_09	455
feed_07 feed_09	404
feed_03 feed_07	18
feed_03 feed_09	1

Table J.51: Intersection by Count – February 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.52: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	32.1400%
feed_02 feed_07	0.3439%
feed_02 feed_09	0.1475%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0362%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0006%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0000%

Table J.52: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

J.14 Results for March 2013 (Feeds)

Table J.53: Count – March 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	2,805,833
feed_02	312,555
feed_07	1,540
feed_09	1,255

Table J.54: Reverse Count – March 2013 IPs – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	3115703	99.9189%
2	2104	0.0675%
3	424	0.0136%

Table J.55: Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_02 feed_07	1,436
feed_02 feed_03	1,004
feed_02 feed_09	476
feed_07 feed_09	431
feed_03 feed_07	27
feed_03 feed_09	2

Table J.55: Intersection by Count – March 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

Table J.56: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_07 feed_09	27.9870%
feed_02 feed_07	0.4594%
feed_02 feed_09	0.1523%
feed_02 feed_03	0.0358%
feed_03 feed_07	0.0010%
feed_03 feed_09	0.0001%

Table J.56: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 IPs – Feeds (Continued)

K Time Series – Domain-Based Lists – DNSBLs

K.1 Results for January 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.1: Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	656,262
list_06	145,744
feed_10	104,602
list_12	67,535
list_13	52,944
list_03	50,247
list_05	24,599
list_17	5,651
list_04	2,214
list_08	7
list_02	5
list_07	1

Table K.2: Reverse Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	889166	90.6047%
2	62781	6.3973%
3	17707	1.8043%
4	6581	0.6706%
5	2921	0.2976%
6	1192	0.1215%
7	589	0.0600%
8	290	0.0296%
9	107	0.0109%
10	21	0.0021%
11	8	0.0008%
12	4	0.0004%
13	1	0.0001%

Table K.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_13 list_16	38,598
list_16 list_03	24,800
list_12 list_16	20,476
list_16 feed_10	19,408
feed_10 list_05	15,265
list_16 list_05	13,576
list_03 feed_10	13,393
list_03 list_05	10,835
list_12 list_13	7,379
list_13 list_03	5,272
list_13 feed_10	2,514
list_04 list_03	1,955
list_04 list_05	1,914

Table K.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_13 list_05	1,847
list_04 list_16	1,703
list_04 feed_10	1,700
list_12 list_03	1,641
list_04 list_13	375
list_12 feed_10	154
list_12 list_05	99
list_04 list_12	13
list_04 list_02	1
list_08 list_02	1
list_17 list_06	1
list_07 list_02	1
list_17 list_08	1
list_06 list_08	1
list_04 list_08	0
list_16 list_08	0
list_17 list_07	0
list_03 list_08	0
list_07 list_05	0
list_08 list_05	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_04 list_07	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_03 list_07	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_13 list_08	0
list_03 list_02	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_16 list_07	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_07 list_08	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_06 list_07	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_08 feed_10	0

Table K.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	11,140
feed_10 list_03	
list_16 list_03	6,585
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	1,351
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	330
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	1
list_03 feed_10	
list_05	
list_17 list_04	
list_16 list_03	0
list_06 list_07	
list_08 list_05	

Table K.3: Intersection by Count – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.4: Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	21.5635%
list_07 list_02	20.0000%
feed_10 list_05	14.5934%
list_08 list_02	14.2857%
list_03 feed_10	12.8038%
list_12 list_13	10.9262%
list_13 list_03	9.9577%
list_04 list_05	7.7808%
list_13 list_16	5.8815%
list_04 list_03	3.8908%
list_16 list_03	3.7790%
list_13 list_05	3.4886%
list_12 list_16	3.1201%
list_16 feed_10	2.9574%
list_12 list_03	2.4299%
list_13 feed_10	2.4034%
list_16 list_05	2.0687%
list_04 feed_10	1.6252%
list_04 list_13	0.7083%
list_04 list_16	0.2595%
list_12 feed_10	0.1472%
list_12 list_05	0.1466%
list_04 list_02	0.0452%
list_04 list_12	0.0192%
list_17 list_08	0.0177%
list_17 list_06	0.0007%
list_06 list_08	0.0007%

Table K.4: Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_17 list_07	0.0000%
list_16 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_08	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_16 list_07	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_07 list_08	0.0000%
list_07 list_05	0.0000%
list_08 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_06 list_07	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_04 list_07	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_03 list_07	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	7.8077%
list_05	
list_04 list_03	1.5181%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_03 feed_10	0.3241%
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0503%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.0002%
list_05	

Table K.4: Intersection by Percentage – January 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.2 Results for February 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.5: Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	474,165
list_06	133,972
feed_10	111,769
list_12	54,624
list_13	42,994
list_05	27,409
list_03	25,557
list_04	3,663
list_17	2,199
list_02	9
list_18	1

Table K.6: Reverse Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	741463	93.5301%
2	27745	3.4998%
3	9648	1.2170%
4	6208	0.7831%
5	4077	0.5143%
6	2014	0.2541%
7	942	0.1188%
8	416	0.0525%
9	158	0.0199%
10	59	0.0074%
11	15	0.0019%
12	7	0.0009%
13	1	0.0001%

Table K.7: Intersection by Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 feed_10	21,757
list_16 list_03	18,364
list_03 feed_10	15,374
feed_10 list_05	15,081
list_16 list_05	14,466
list_03 list_05	12,514
list_13 list_16	11,447
list_13 list_03	3,734
list_13 feed_10	3,685
list_12 list_16	3,352
list_04 list_05	3,114
list_04 list_03	3,033
list_13 list_05	2,748
list_04 list_16	2,615
list_04 feed_10	2,108
list_12 list_13	1,582

Table K.7: Intersection by Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_13	606
list_12 feed_10	123
list_12 list_05	115
list_12 list_03	108
list_04 list_12	9
list_03 list_02	0
list_18 list_05	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_18 list_13	0
list_18 list_06	0
list_17 list_18	0
list_18 feed_10	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_18 list_16	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_18 list_02	0
list_04 list_18	0
list_18 list_12	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_18 list_03	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	12,694
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	7,504
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	1,666
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	451
list_17 list_18 list_12 list_03 feed_10 list_02 list_05	0

Table K.7: Intersection by Count – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.8: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	45.6565%
list_03 feed_10	13.7552%
feed_10 list_05	13.4930%
list_04 list_03	11.8676%
list_04 list_05	11.3612%
list_13 list_03	8.6849%
list_13 list_05	6.3916%
list_16 feed_10	4.5885%
list_16 list_03	3.8729%
list_13 feed_10	3.2970%
list_16 list_05	3.0508%
list_12 list_13	2.8962%
list_13 list_16	2.4141%
list_04 feed_10	1.8860%
list_04 list_13	1.4095%
list_12 list_16	0.7069%
list_04 list_16	0.5515%
list_12 list_05	0.2105%
list_12 list_03	0.1977%
list_12 feed_10	0.1100%
list_04 list_12	0.0165%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_18 list_05	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_18 list_13	0.0000%
list_18 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_18	0.0000%
list_18 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_18 list_16	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%

Table K.8: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_18 list_02	0.0000%
list_04 list_18	0.0000%
list_18 list_12	0.0000%
list_18 list_03	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
list_04 list_03 list_05	10.1062%
list_04 list_03 feed_10 list_05	1.7509%
list_04 list_13 list_03 feed_10 list_05	0.4232%
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	0.0951%

Table K.8: Intersection by Percentage – February 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.3 Results for March 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.9: Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	215,748
feed_10	54,732
list_06	46,769
list_05	29,720
list_03	25,620
list_12	16,741
list_13	15,371
list_04	1,534
list_17	1,228
list_02	5

Table K.10: Reverse Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	308013	89.5717%
2	15146	4.4045%
3	8885	2.5838%
4	6306	1.8338%
5	3398	0.9882%
6	1390	0.4042%
7	564	0.1640%
8	123	0.0358%
9	41	0.0119%
10	5	0.0015%
11	1	0.0003%
12	1	0.0003%

Table K.11: Intersection by Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	17,910
list_16 feed_10	16,894
list_03 feed_10	14,976
list_03 list_05	13,690
feed_10 list_05	13,449
list_16 list_05	13,367
list_13 list_16	3,987
list_13 list_03	1,790
list_13 feed_10	1,500
list_13 list_05	1,312
list_04 list_05	1,274
list_04 list_03	1,075
list_04 feed_10	859
list_04 list_16	832
list_12 list_16	431
list_12 list_13	145
list_04 list_13	63
list_12 list_05	31

Table K.11: Intersection by Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_12 feed_10	30
list_12 list_03	22
list_16 list_02	1
list_03 list_02	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	12,152
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	7,463
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	734
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05 list_17 list_04	34
list_13 list_16 list_03 list_02 list_05	0

Table K.11: Intersection by Count – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.12: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	46.0633%
list_03 feed_10	27.3624%
feed_10 list_05	24.5725%
list_16 list_03	8.3014%

Table K.12: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_16 feed_10	7.8304%
list_13 list_03	6.9867%
list_16 list_05	6.1957%
list_13 list_05	4.4145%
list_04 list_05	4.2867%
list_04 list_03	4.1959%
list_13 feed_10	2.7406%
list_13 list_16	1.8480%
list_04 feed_10	1.5695%
list_12 list_13	0.8661%
list_04 list_13	0.4099%
list_04 list_16	0.3856%
list_12 list_16	0.1998%
list_12 list_05	0.1043%
list_12 list_03	0.0859%
list_12 feed_10	0.0548%
list_16 list_02	0.0005%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	17.2623%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	3.4591%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.3402%
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0158%
feed_10 list_05	

Table K.12: Intersection by Percentage – March 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.4 Results for April 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.13: Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	216,593
list_06	57,195
feed_10	55,787
list_05	26,605
list_03	25,374
list_12	16,834
list_13	16,244
list_04	1,918
list_17	1,129
list_02	15

Table K.14: Reverse Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	317304	89.9245%
2	14647	4.1510%
3	8933	2.5316%
4	5531	1.5675%
5	3271	0.9270%
6	1843	0.5223%
7	881	0.2497%
8	322	0.0913%
9	96	0.0272%
10	27	0.0077%
11	1	0.0003%

Table K.15: Intersection by Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 feed_10	18,205
list_16 list_03	17,939
list_03 feed_10	15,195
list_16 list_05	13,417
feed_10 list_05	13,235
list_03 list_05	12,856
list_13 list_16	4,783
list_13 list_03	2,599
list_13 feed_10	2,431
list_13 list_05	1,942
list_04 list_05	1,633
list_04 list_03	1,474
list_04 list_16	1,250
list_04 feed_10	1,023
list_12 list_16	409
list_04 list_13	189
list_12 list_13	184
list_12 list_05	39
list_12 list_03	25

Table K.15: Intersection by Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_12 feed_10	19
list_04 list_12	2
list_06 list_02	1
list_03 list_02	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	13,093
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	7,583
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	1,402
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05 list_17 list_04	131
list_13 list_16 list_03 list_02 list_05	0

Table K.15: Intersection by Count – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.16: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	48.3217%
list_03 feed_10	27.2375%
feed_10 list_05	23.7242%
list_13 list_03	10.2428%
list_16 feed_10	8.4052%

Table K.16: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_16 list_03	8.2824%
list_13 list_05	7.2994%
list_16 list_05	6.1946%
list_04 list_05	6.1379%
list_04 list_03	5.8091%
list_13 feed_10	4.3576%
list_13 list_16	2.2083%
list_04 feed_10	1.8338%
list_04 list_13	1.1635%
list_12 list_13	1.0930%
list_04 list_16	0.5771%
list_12 list_16	0.1888%
list_12 list_05	0.1466%
list_12 list_03	0.0985%
list_12 feed_10	0.0341%
list_04 list_12	0.0119%
list_06 list_02	0.0017%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	15.7868%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	3.5010%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.6473%
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0605%
feed_10 list_05	

Table K.16: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.5 Results for May 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.17: Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	204,575
feed_10	75,184
list_06	56,037
list_05	25,392
list_03	23,162
list_12	16,365
list_13	15,347
list_04	1,534
list_17	265
list_02	1
list_07	1

Table K.18: Reverse Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	317954	90.2473%
2	13327	3.7827%
3	8462	2.4018%
4	5530	1.5696%
5	3411	0.9682%
6	2049	0.5816%
7	1017	0.2887%
8	405	0.1150%
9	116	0.0329%
10	32	0.0091%
11	9	0.0026%
12	2	0.0006%

Table K.19: Intersection by Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 feed_10	19,820
list_16 list_03	17,275
list_03 feed_10	16,080
list_16 list_05	14,437
feed_10 list_05	14,291
list_03 list_05	12,583
list_13 list_16	4,986
list_13 feed_10	2,773
list_13 list_03	2,707
list_13 list_05	2,281
list_04 list_05	1,310
list_04 list_03	1,111
list_04 list_16	996
list_04 feed_10	926
list_12 list_16	592
list_12 list_13	221
list_04 list_13	194

Table K.19: Intersection by Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_12 feed_10	154
list_12 list_05	144
list_12 list_03	136
list_04 list_12	2
list_03 list_02	0
list_17 list_07	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_16 list_07	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_07 list_05	0
list_12 list_07	0
list_06 list_07	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_07 feed_10	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_07 list_02	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_04 list_07	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_03 list_07	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_13 list_07	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_16 list_03	14,186
feed_10	
list_16 list_03	8,750
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	1,733
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	158
feed_10 list_05	
list_12 list_16	
list_03 list_07	
feed_10 list_02	0
list_05	

Table K.19: Intersection by Count – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.20: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	49.5550%
list_03 feed_10	21.3875%
feed_10 list_05	19.0080%
list_13 list_03	11.6872%
list_16 feed_10	9.6884%
list_13 list_05	8.9831%
list_16 list_03	8.4443%
list_16 list_05	7.0571%
list_04 list_05	5.1591%
list_04 list_03	4.7966%
list_13 feed_10	3.6883%
list_13 list_16	2.4372%
list_12 list_13	1.3504%
list_04 list_13	1.2641%
list_04 feed_10	1.2316%
list_12 list_03	0.5872%
list_12 list_05	0.5671%
list_04 list_16	0.4869%
list_12 list_16	0.2894%
list_12 feed_10	0.2048%
list_04 list_12	0.0122%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_07	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_16 list_07	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_07 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_07	0.0000%
list_06 list_07	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_07 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_07 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_04 list_07	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_03 list_07	0.0000%

Table K.20: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_07	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10 list_05	13.0639%
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	4.2772%
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	0.8471%
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	0.0772%

Table K.20: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.6 Results for June 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.21: Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	137,863
feed_10	76,582
list_06	43,355
list_05	26,300
list_03	23,681
list_12	16,537
list_13	11,542
list_04	2,096
list_17	64
list_02	2

Table K.22: Reverse Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	243616	88.2695%
2	12127	4.3940%
3	8391	3.0403%
4	5367	1.9446%
5	3151	1.1417%
6	1873	0.6786%
7	899	0.3257%
8	370	0.1341%
9	140	0.0507%
10	44	0.0159%
11	9	0.0033%
12	2	0.0007%
13	2	0.0007%

Table K.23: Intersection by Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 feed_10	17,999
list_03 feed_10	16,411
list_16 list_03	16,228
feed_10 list_05	14,298
list_16 list_05	13,461
list_03 list_05	12,475
list_13 list_16	3,058
list_13 feed_10	1,682
list_13 list_03	1,632
list_04 list_05	1,629
list_04 list_03	1,405
list_13 list_05	1,357
list_04 list_16	1,243
list_04 feed_10	1,160
list_12 list_16	843
list_12 feed_10	364
list_12 list_05	343

Table K.23: Intersection by Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_12 list_03	335
list_12 list_13	294
list_04 list_13	140
list_04 list_12	11
list_03 list_02	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_16 list_03	13,655
feed_10	
list_16 list_03	8,416
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	933
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	101
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	2
list_05	
list_17 list_04	
list_16 list_03	
list_06 feed_10	0
list_02 list_05	

Table K.23: Intersection by Count – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.24: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	47.4335%
list_03 feed_10	21.4293%
feed_10 list_05	18.6702%
list_16 feed_10	13.0557%
list_16 list_03	11.7711%
list_16 list_05	9.7640%
list_13 list_03	6.8916%
list_04 list_05	6.1939%
list_04 list_03	5.9330%
list_13 list_05	5.1597%
list_13 list_16	2.2181%
list_13 feed_10	2.1963%
list_12 list_13	1.7778%
list_04 feed_10	1.5147%
list_12 list_03	1.4146%
list_12 list_05	1.3042%
list_04 list_13	1.2130%
list_04 list_16	0.9016%
list_12 list_16	0.6115%
list_12 feed_10	0.4753%
list_04 list_12	0.0665%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	12.9547%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	6.1046%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.6768%
list_05	

Table K.24: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0733%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	0.0015%
list_03 feed_10	
list_05	

Table K.24: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.7 Results for July 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.25: Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	112,913
list_06	64,122
feed_10	57,265
list_05	23,753
list_03	20,355
list_12	15,453
list_13	9,272
list_04	1,035
list_17	62

Table K.26: Reverse Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	228020	89.2066%
2	11913	4.6606%
3	7020	2.7464%
4	3979	1.5567%
5	2437	0.9534%
6	1390	0.5438%
7	584	0.2285%
8	189	0.0739%
9	58	0.0227%
10	13	0.0051%
11	3	0.0012%
12	1	0.0004%
13	1	0.0004%
14	1	0.0004%

Table K.27: Intersection by Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 feed_10	13,379
list_03 feed_10	12,673
list_16 list_03	12,482
feed_10 list_05	11,448
list_16 list_05	10,151
list_03 list_05	9,940
list_13 list_16	2,552
list_13 feed_10	1,459
list_13 list_03	1,395
list_13 list_05	1,237
list_12 list_16	665
list_04 list_05	557
list_04 list_16	473
list_04 feed_10	385
list_04 list_03	382
list_12 feed_10	262
list_12 list_05	260

Table K.27: Intersection by Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_12 list_13	236
list_12 list_03	213
list_04 list_13	113
list_04 list_12	38
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	9,775
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	6,099
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	812
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	61
list_04 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	7

Table K.27: Intersection by Count – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.28: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	41.8473%
list_03 feed_10	22.1304%
feed_10 list_05	19.9913%
list_16 feed_10	11.8489%
list_16 list_03	11.0545%
list_16 list_05	8.9901%
list_13 list_03	6.8534%
list_13 list_05	5.2078%
list_13 feed_10	2.5478%
list_04 list_05	2.3450%
list_13 list_16	2.2601%
list_04 list_03	1.8767%

Table K.28: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_12 list_13	1.5272%
list_04 list_13	1.2187%
list_12 list_05	1.0946%
list_12 list_03	1.0464%
list_04 feed_10	0.6723%
list_12 list_16	0.5889%
list_12 feed_10	0.4575%
list_04 list_16	0.4189%
list_04 list_12	0.2459%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	13.3310%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	5.4015%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.7191%
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0540%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.0062%
list_05	

Table K.28: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.8 Results for August 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.29: Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	121,316
feed_10	63,705
list_06	59,066
list_05	27,598
list_03	25,245
list_12	13,494
list_13	8,627
list_04	697
list_17	293
list_02	1

Table K.30: Reverse Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	229887	87.9543%
2	12055	4.6122%
3	7737	2.9602%
4	5700	2.1808%
5	3427	1.3112%
6	1709	0.6539%
7	629	0.2407%
8	192	0.0735%
9	26	0.0099%
10	7	0.0027%
11	2	0.0008%

Table K.31: Intersection by Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 feed_10	16,042
list_03 feed_10	15,374
list_16 list_03	15,181
feed_10 list_05	14,491
list_16 list_05	14,294
list_03 list_05	13,464
list_13 list_16	2,427
list_13 list_03	1,304
list_13 feed_10	1,290
list_13 list_05	1,290
list_12 list_16	801
list_04 list_05	473
list_04 list_16	425
list_04 feed_10	392
list_12 feed_10	391
list_12 list_05	387
list_04 list_03	366
list_12 list_03	346
list_12 list_13	255

Table K.31: Intersection by Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_13	76
list_04 list_12	48
list_03 list_02	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	12,059
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	8,622
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	789
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	55
list_04 list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	10
list_17 list_04 list_16 list_03 list_06 feed_10 list_02 list_05	0

Table K.31: Intersection by Count – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.32: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	48.7861%
list_03 feed_10	24.1331%
feed_10 list_05	22.7470%
list_16 feed_10	13.2233%
list_16 list_03	12.5136%
list_16 list_05	11.7825%
list_13 list_03	5.1654%
list_13 list_05	4.6743%
list_13 feed_10	2.0250%
list_13 list_16	2.0006%
list_12 list_13	1.8897%
list_04 list_05	1.7139%
list_04 list_03	1.4498%
list_12 list_05	1.4023%
list_12 list_03	1.3706%
list_04 list_13	0.8810%
list_12 list_16	0.6603%
list_04 feed_10	0.6153%
list_12 feed_10	0.6138%
list_04 list_12	0.3557%
list_04 list_16	0.3503%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	16.7899%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	7.1071%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.6504%
list_05	

Table K.32: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_12 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0453%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.0082%
list_05	

Table K.32: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.9 Results for September 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.33: Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	142,900
feed_10	58,416
list_06	47,825
list_05	28,294
list_03	23,446
list_12	11,020
list_13	10,812
list_04	340
list_17	156
list_02	29

Table K.34: Reverse Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	233700	88.5003%
2	10665	4.0387%
3	5914	2.2396%
4	6009	2.2756%
5	4165	1.5773%
6	2258	0.8551%
7	997	0.3776%
8	269	0.1019%
9	69	0.0261%
10	20	0.0076%
11	1	0.0004%

Table K.35: Intersection by Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	16,029
list_16 list_05	15,734
list_03 list_05	15,391
list_16 feed_10	15,083
feed_10 list_05	14,529
list_03 feed_10	13,929
list_13 list_16	3,418
list_13 list_05	2,277
list_13 list_03	2,164
list_13 feed_10	2,134
list_12 list_16	650
list_12 list_05	303
list_12 feed_10	288
list_12 list_03	266
list_12 list_13	262
list_04 list_05	168
list_04 list_16	156
list_04 list_03	123
list_04 feed_10	118

Table K.35: Intersection by Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_13	73
list_04 list_12	23
list_06 list_02	5
list_03 list_02	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_16 list_03 list_05	12,218
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	9,495
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	1,654
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05 list_04 list_12	96
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	14
list_17 list_04 list_16 list_03 list_06 feed_10 list_02 list_05	0

Table K.35: Intersection by Count – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.36: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	54.3967%
feed_10 list_05	24.8716%
list_03 feed_10	23.8445%
list_16 list_03	11.2169%
list_16 list_05	11.0105%
list_16 feed_10	10.5549%
list_13 list_03	9.2297%
list_13 list_05	8.0476%
list_13 feed_10	3.6531%
list_13 list_16	2.3919%
list_12 list_13	2.3775%
list_12 list_03	1.1345%
list_12 list_05	1.0709%
list_04 list_13	0.6752%
list_04 list_05	0.5938%
list_04 list_03	0.5246%
list_12 feed_10	0.4930%
list_12 list_16	0.4549%
list_04 list_12	0.2087%
list_04 feed_10	0.2020%
list_04 list_16	0.1092%
list_06 list_02	0.0105%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	18.7859%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	6.6445%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	1.1575%
list_05	

Table K.36: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_12 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0672%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	0.0098%
list_03 feed_10	
list_05	

Table K.36: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.10 Results for October 2012 (DNSBL)**Table K.37:** Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	162,632
feed_10	60,714
list_06	43,341
list_03	29,255
list_05	28,341
list_13	11,727
list_12	9,548
list_17	116
list_04	81
list_18	38

Table K.38: Reverse Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	253512	88.6217%
2	12378	4.3270%
3	7039	2.4607%
4	5711	1.9964%
5	3895	1.3616%
6	2175	0.7603%
7	984	0.3440%
8	309	0.1080%
9	50	0.0175%
10	6	0.0021%
11	2	0.0007%

Table K.39: Intersection by Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	18,104
list_16 list_05	15,542
list_16 feed_10	14,780
list_03 list_05	14,548
list_03 feed_10	13,151
feed_10 list_05	13,057
list_13 list_16	3,859
list_13 list_03	2,501
list_13 list_05	2,418
list_13 feed_10	2,234
list_12 list_16	261
list_12 list_13	100
list_12 list_05	59
list_12 list_03	52
list_12 feed_10	46
list_04 list_05	23
list_04 feed_10	23
list_04 list_16	16
list_04 list_03	14

Table K.39: Intersection by Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_18 list_13	1
list_04 list_13	1
list_18 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_18 list_06	0
list_17 list_18	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_18 feed_10	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_18 list_16	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_04 list_18	0
list_18 list_12	0
list_18 list_03	0
list_16 list_03	11,904
list_05	
list_16 list_03	8,451
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	1,564
list_05	
list_12 list_13	
list_16 list_03	11
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_18	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 list_06	0
list_05	

Table K.39: Intersection by Count – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.40: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	49.7283%
list_03 feed_10	21.6606%
feed_10 list_05	21.5057%
list_16 list_03	11.1319%
list_16 list_05	9.5565%

Table K.40: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_16 feed_10	9.0880%
list_13 list_03	8.5490%
list_13 list_05	8.5318%
list_13 feed_10	3.6795%
list_13 list_16	2.3728%
list_12 list_13	0.8527%
list_12 list_05	0.2082%
list_12 list_03	0.1777%
list_12 list_16	0.1605%
list_04 list_05	0.0812%
list_12 feed_10	0.0758%
list_04 list_03	0.0479%
list_04 feed_10	0.0379%
list_04 list_16	0.0098%
list_18 list_13	0.0085%
list_04 list_13	0.0085%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_18 list_16	0.0000%
list_18 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_18 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_17 list_18	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_18 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_18	0.0000%
list_18 feed_10	0.0000%
list_18 list_03	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	15.8464%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	5.1964%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.9617%
list_05	
list_12 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0068%
feed_10 list_05	

Table K.40: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.11 Results for November 2012 (DNSBL)

Table K.41: Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	132,185
feed_10	69,604
list_06	38,866
list_05	25,164
list_03	23,027
list_13	8,608
list_12	7,884
list_18	527
list_17	185
list_04	68
list_02	1

Table K.42: Reverse Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	223715	88.3634%
2	11956	4.7224%
3	6745	2.6642%
4	5477	2.1633%
5	3244	1.2813%
6	1485	0.5865%
7	449	0.1773%
8	81	0.0320%
9	22	0.0087%
10	2	0.0008%

Table K.43: Intersection by Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	15,316
list_16 feed_10	14,450
list_03 feed_10	14,023
feed_10 list_05	12,804
list_16 list_05	12,751
list_03 list_05	11,579
list_13 list_16	2,221
list_13 list_03	1,133
list_13 feed_10	1,070
list_13 list_05	1,056
list_12 list_16	272
list_12 list_13	111
list_12 feed_10	57
list_12 list_05	45
list_12 list_03	43
list_04 list_05	17
list_04 list_16	10
list_04 list_03	9
list_04 feed_10	9

Table K.43: Intersection by Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_18 list_16	2
list_18 list_12	2
list_04 list_13	2
list_18 list_13	1
list_18 feed_10	1
list_03 list_02	0
list_18 list_05	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_18 list_06	0
list_17 list_18	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_02	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_18 list_02	0
list_04 list_18	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_18 list_03	0
list_16 list_03	11,018
feed_10	
list_16 list_03	7,598
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	658
list_05	
list_12 list_13	
list_16 list_03	8
feed_10 list_05	
list_17 list_18	
list_12 list_03	
feed_10 list_02	0
list_05	

Table K.43: Intersection by Count – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.44: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	46.0141%
list_03 feed_10	20.1468%
feed_10 list_05	18.3955%
list_16 list_03	11.5868%
list_16 feed_10	10.9316%
list_16 list_05	9.6463%
list_13 list_03	4.9203%
list_13 list_05	4.1965%
list_13 list_16	1.6802%
list_13 feed_10	1.5373%
list_12 list_13	1.2895%
list_12 list_16	0.2058%
list_12 list_03	0.1867%
list_12 list_05	0.1788%
list_12 feed_10	0.0819%
list_04 list_05	0.0676%
list_04 list_03	0.0391%
list_18 list_12	0.0254%
list_04 list_13	0.0232%
list_04 feed_10	0.0129%
list_18 list_13	0.0116%
list_04 list_16	0.0076%
list_18 list_16	0.0015%
list_18 feed_10	0.0014%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_18 list_05	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_18 list_06	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_17 list_18	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_18 list_02	0.0000%
list_04 list_18	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_18 list_03	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%

Table K.44: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10 list_05	13.1084%
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	5.7480%
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	0.4978%
list_12 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	0.0061%

Table K.44: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.12 Results for December 2012 (DNSBL)**Table K.45:** Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16	115,095
feed_10	64,378
list_03	53,479
list_06	32,308
list_05	25,512
list_13	9,011
list_12	7,340
list_17	639
list_18	416
list_04	44

Table K.46: Reverse Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	223053	87.7812%
2	12988	5.1114%
3	6920	2.7233%
4	5846	2.3007%
5	3275	1.2889%
6	1329	0.5230%
7	446	0.1755%
8	176	0.0693%
9	51	0.0201%
10	16	0.0063%
11	1	0.0004%

Table K.47: Intersection by Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	16,356
list_03 feed_10	13,663
list_16 list_05	13,253
list_16 feed_10	12,972
list_03 list_05	12,895
feed_10 list_05	11,951
list_13 list_16	2,181
list_13 list_03	1,414
list_13 list_05	1,081
list_13 feed_10	876
list_12 list_16	196
list_12 list_03	180
list_12 list_13	78
list_18 list_03	35
list_12 feed_10	27
list_12 list_05	25
list_04 list_05	7
list_04 list_16	5
list_04 list_03	5

Table K.47: Intersection by Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 feed_10	4
list_18 list_13	1
list_18 list_16	1
list_18 list_12	1
list_18 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_17 list_13	0
list_18 list_06	0
list_17 list_18	0
list_04 list_12	0
list_18 feed_10	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_17 list_04	0
list_17 list_03	0
list_17 list_05	0
list_17 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_17 list_06	0
list_17 list_16	0
list_17 feed_10	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_04 list_18	0
list_04 list_13	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	10,260
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	7,317
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	501
list_17 list_04 list_18 list_12 list_03 feed_10	0

Table K.47: Intersection by Count – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.48: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
list_03 list_05	24.1123%
list_03 feed_10	21.2231%
feed_10 list_05	18.5638%
list_16 list_03	14.2109%
list_16 list_05	11.5148%
list_16 feed_10	11.2707%
list_13 list_05	4.2372%
list_13 list_03	2.6440%
list_13 list_16	1.8950%

Table K.48: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_13 feed_10	1.3607%
list_12 list_13	0.8656%
list_12 list_03	0.3366%
list_12 list_16	0.1703%
list_12 list_05	0.0980%
list_18 list_03	0.0654%
list_12 feed_10	0.0419%
list_04 list_05	0.0274%
list_18 list_12	0.0136%
list_18 list_13	0.0111%
list_04 list_03	0.0093%
list_04 feed_10	0.0062%
list_04 list_16	0.0043%
list_18 list_16	0.0009%
list_17 list_05	0.0000%
list_18 list_05	0.0000%
list_17 list_12	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_06	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_13	0.0000%
list_18 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_16	0.0000%
list_17 list_18	0.0000%
list_04 list_12	0.0000%
list_17 feed_10	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_18	0.0000%
list_18 feed_10	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_04 list_13	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_17 list_04	0.0000%
list_17 list_03	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	13.8401%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	6.3574%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.4353%
list_05	

Table K.48: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.13 Results for January 2013 (DNSBL)**Table K.49:** Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_14	25,917,539
list_16	494,113
list_03	123,038
feed_10	84,971
list_06	53,532
list_05	42,268
list_12	27,209
list_13	26,678
list_04	649
list_02	7
list_08	5

Table K.50: Reverse Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	26504982	99.6122%
2	60126	0.2260%
3	19550	0.0735%
4	12969	0.0487%
5	6568	0.0247%
6	2669	0.0100%
7	836	0.0031%
8	276	0.0010%
9	100	0.0004%
10	45	0.0002%
11	19	0.0001%
12	7	0.0000%
13	7	0.0000%
14	1	0.0000%
15	1	0.0000%

Table K.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	62,801
list_03 feed_10	27,924
feed_10 list_05	25,942
list_16 feed_10	25,823
list_03 list_05	24,063
list_16 list_05	22,936
list_13 list_16	19,666
list_13 list_03	10,611
list_12 list_16	10,542
list_12 list_03	5,031
list_12 list_13	3,908
list_13 feed_10	2,119
list_13 list_05	1,913
list_04 list_05	552

Table K.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_16	525
list_04 feed_10	502
list_04 list_03	500
list_04 list_13	115
list_12 feed_10	103
list_12 list_05	91
list_04 list_12	8
list_14 list_16	0
list_03 list_02	0
list_13 list_08	0
list_14 list_08	0
list_04 list_08	0
list_16 list_08	0
list_14 list_02	0
list_03 list_08	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_14 feed_10	0
list_08 list_05	0
list_14 list_05	0
list_14 list_06	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_04 list_14	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_08 list_02	0
list_14 list_03	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_14 list_13	0
list_14 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_06 list_08	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	19,725
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	15,054
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	1,347
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	97

Table K.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_14	0
list_16 list_03	
list_08 feed_10	
list_05	

Table K.51: Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.52: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_10 list_05	30.5304%
list_03 feed_10	22.6954%
list_03 list_05	19.5574%
list_12 list_13	14.3629%
list_16 list_03	12.7098%
list_13 list_03	8.6242%
list_16 feed_10	5.2261%
list_16 list_05	4.6419%
list_13 list_05	4.5259%
list_12 list_03	4.0890%
list_13 list_16	3.9801%
list_13 feed_10	2.4938%
list_12 list_16	2.1335%
list_04 list_05	1.3060%
list_04 feed_10	0.5908%
list_04 list_13	0.4311%
list_04 list_03	0.4064%
list_12 list_05	0.2153%
list_12 feed_10	0.1212%
list_04 list_16	0.1063%
list_04 list_12	0.0294%
list_14 list_16	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_08	0.0000%
list_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_16 list_08	0.0000%
list_14 list_02	0.0000%
list_03 list_08	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_14 feed_10	0.0000%
list_08 list_05	0.0000%
list_14 list_05	0.0000%
list_14 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_04 list_14	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_08 list_02	0.0000%

Table K.52: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_14 list_03	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_13	0.0000%
list_14 list_12	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 list_08	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_03 feed_10	15.8163%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	3.0467%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.2726%
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0196%
feed_10 list_05	

Table K.52: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.14 Results for February 2013 (DNSBL)**Table K.53:** Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_14	42,365,673
list_03	506,577
list_16	247,783
feed_10	71,399
list_05	39,131
list_06	17,305
list_13	14,060
list_12	13,511
list_04	1,880
list_02	2
list_08	1

Table K.54: Reverse Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	41412938	95.9458%
2	1722672	3.9911%
3	9507	0.0220%
4	6069	0.0141%
5	6050	0.0140%
6	3463	0.0080%
7	1451	0.0034%
8	470	0.0011%
9	130	0.0003%
10	53	0.0001%
11	25	0.0001%
12	14	0.0000%
13	2	0.0000%
15	2	0.0000%
16	1	0.0000%

Table K.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	52,106
list_03 feed_10	26,618
list_03 list_05	19,928
list_16 feed_10	16,101
feed_10 list_05	15,041
list_16 list_05	14,340
list_13 list_03	6,024
list_13 list_16	3,876
list_12 list_03	1,980
list_04 list_03	1,721
list_13 list_05	1,680
list_13 feed_10	1,599
list_04 list_05	1,490
list_04 list_16	1,377

Table K.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 feed_10	1,198
list_12 list_16	754
list_12 list_13	409
list_04 list_13	197
list_12 list_05	59
list_12 feed_10	38
list_04 list_12	9
list_03 list_08	1
list_14 list_16	0
list_03 list_02	0
list_13 list_08	0
list_14 list_08	0
list_04 list_08	0
list_16 list_08	0
list_14 list_02	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_14 feed_10	0
list_08 list_05	0
list_14 list_05	0
list_14 list_06	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_04 list_14	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_08 list_02	0
list_14 list_03	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_14 list_13	0
list_14 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_06 list_08	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	14,925
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	10,622
list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	1,115
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	151

Table K.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_04 list_12	1
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	
list_05	0
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 list_08	
feed_10 list_02	

Table K.55: Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.56: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_10 list_05	21.0661%
list_16 list_03	10.2859%
list_16 feed_10	6.4980%
list_16 list_05	5.7873%
list_03 feed_10	5.2545%
list_13 list_05	4.2933%
list_03 list_05	3.9339%
list_04 list_05	3.8077%
list_12 list_13	2.9090%
list_13 feed_10	2.2395%
list_04 feed_10	1.6779%
list_13 list_16	1.5643%
list_04 list_13	1.4011%
list_13 list_03	1.1892%
list_04 list_16	0.5557%
list_12 list_03	0.3909%
list_04 list_03	0.3397%
list_12 list_16	0.3043%
list_12 list_05	0.1508%
list_04 list_12	0.0666%
list_12 feed_10	0.0532%
list_03 list_08	0.0002%
list_14 list_16	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_08	0.0000%
list_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_16 list_08	0.0000%
list_14 list_02	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_14 feed_10	0.0000%
list_08 list_05	0.0000%
list_14 list_05	0.0000%
list_14 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%

Table K.56: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_04 list_14	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_08 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_03	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_13	0.0000%
list_14 list_12	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 list_08	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 feed_10	4.4228%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	2.0968%
feed_10 list_05	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.2201%
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0298%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_12	
list_13 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.0002%
list_05	

Table K.56: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

K.15 Results for March 2013 (DNSBL)**Table K.57:** Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_14	33,518,790
list_03	406,781
list_16	146,433
feed_10	53,057
list_05	23,685
list_06	17,241
list_12	9,090
list_13	8,456
list_04	1,940
list_08	2
list_02	1

Table K.58: Reverse Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	32975691	96.6864%
2	1108680	3.2507%
3	6817	0.0200%
4	5180	0.0152%
5	4824	0.0141%
6	2696	0.0079%
7	1223	0.0036%
8	506	0.0015%
9	148	0.0004%
10	38	0.0001%
11	4	0.0000%
12	4	0.0000%
14	1	0.0000%

Table K.59: Intersection by Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Count
list_16 list_03	31,991
list_03 feed_10	23,752
list_03 list_05	15,900
list_16 feed_10	12,705
feed_10 list_05	12,055
list_16 list_05	11,155
list_13 list_03	2,265
list_13 list_16	2,113
list_04 list_03	1,636
list_04 list_05	1,515
list_04 list_16	1,451
list_04 feed_10	1,394
list_13 feed_10	1,021
list_13 list_05	980
list_12 list_03	500
list_12 list_16	354

Table K.59: Intersection by Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Count
list_12 list_13	198
list_04 list_13	153
list_12 list_05	86
list_12 feed_10	58
list_04 list_12	3
list_14 list_16	0
list_03 list_02	0
list_13 list_08	0
list_14 list_08	0
list_04 list_08	0
list_16 list_08	0
list_14 list_02	0
list_03 list_08	0
list_02 list_05	0
list_03 list_06	0
list_14 feed_10	0
list_08 list_05	0
list_14 list_05	0
list_14 list_06	0
list_04 list_02	0
feed_10 list_02	0
list_04 list_14	0
list_06 feed_10	0
list_16 list_06	0
list_08 list_02	0
list_14 list_03	0
list_16 list_02	0
list_14 list_13	0
list_14 list_12	0
list_06 list_05	0
list_04 list_06	0
list_12 list_06	0
list_12 list_08	0
list_13 list_02	0
list_12 list_02	0
list_13 list_06	0
list_06 list_02	0
list_06 list_08	0
list_08 feed_10	0
list_16 list_03 feed_10	12,041
list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	8,280
list_04 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	1,205
list_04 list_13 list_16 list_03 feed_10 list_05	122
list_04 list_14 list_16 list_03 list_08 feed_10 list_05	0

Table K.59: Intersection by Count – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table K.60: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_10 list_05	22.7208%
list_16 feed_10	8.6763%
list_16 list_03	7.8644%
list_16 list_05	7.6178%
list_04 list_05	6.3965%
list_03 feed_10	5.8390%
list_13 list_05	4.1376%
list_03 list_05	3.9087%
list_04 feed_10	2.6274%
list_12 list_13	2.1782%
list_13 feed_10	1.9243%
list_04 list_13	1.8094%
list_13 list_16	1.4430%
list_04 list_16	0.9909%
list_13 list_03	0.5568%
list_04 list_03	0.4022%
list_12 list_05	0.3631%
list_12 list_16	0.2417%
list_12 list_03	0.1229%
list_12 feed_10	0.1093%
list_04 list_12	0.0330%
list_14 list_16	0.0000%
list_13 list_08	0.0000%
list_03 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_08	0.0000%
list_04 list_08	0.0000%
list_16 list_08	0.0000%
list_14 list_02	0.0000%
list_03 list_08	0.0000%
list_02 list_05	0.0000%
list_03 list_06	0.0000%
list_14 feed_10	0.0000%
list_08 list_05	0.0000%
list_14 list_05	0.0000%
list_14 list_06	0.0000%
list_04 list_02	0.0000%
list_04 list_14	0.0000%
feed_10 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 list_06	0.0000%
list_08 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_03	0.0000%
list_16 list_02	0.0000%
list_14 list_13	0.0000%
list_14 list_12	0.0000%
list_06 list_05	0.0000%
list_04 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_06	0.0000%
list_12 list_08	0.0000%

Table K.60: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
list_13 list_02	0.0000%
list_12 list_02	0.0000%
list_13 list_06	0.0000%
list_06 list_02	0.0000%
list_06 list_08	0.0000%
list_08 feed_10	0.0000%
list_16 feed_10	5.7842%
list_05	
list_16 list_03	2.0355%
feed_10 list_05	
list_04 list_16	
list_03 feed_10	0.2962%
list_05	
list_04 list_13	
list_16 list_03	0.0300%
feed_10 list_05	

Table K.60: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 Domains – DNSBL-DOMAINS (Continued)

L Time Series – Domain-Based Lists – Feeds

L.1 Results for February 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.1: Count – February 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_05	16,367
feed_01	666
feed_10	448

Table L.2: Reverse Count – February 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	17135	99.0005%
2	173	0.9995%

L.2 Results for March 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.3: Count – March 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_05	2,091
feed_01	145
feed_10	16

Table L.4: Reverse Count – March 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	2216	99.1943%
2	18	0.8057%

L.3 Results for April 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.5: Count – April 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	468,443
feed_05	1,411
feed_01	135
feed_10	17

Table L.6: Reverse Count – April 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	469670	99.9649%
2	159	0.0338%
3	6	0.0013%

Table L.7: Intersection by Count – April 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_01 feed_03	97
feed_03 feed_05	72
feed_01 feed_05	8
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0

Table L.7: Intersection by Count – April 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.8: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_01 feed_05	0.5670%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0207%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0154%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%

Table L.8: Intersection by Percentage – April 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.4 Results for May 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.9: Count – May 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,518,244
feed_04	1,454
feed_05	917
feed_01	166
feed_10	3

Table L.10: Reverse Count – May 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1520096	99.9788%
2	278	0.0183%
3	44	0.0029%

Table L.11: Intersection by Count – May 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_01 feed_03	160
feed_04 feed_05	133
feed_03 feed_05	54
feed_03 feed_04	38
feed_01 feed_05	22
feed_01 feed_04	3
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_03 feed_05	22

Table L.11: Intersection by Count – May 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.12: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	9.1472%
feed_01 feed_05	2.3991%
feed_01 feed_04	0.2063%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0105%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0036%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0025%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_03 feed_05	0.0014%

Table L.12: Intersection by Percentage – May 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.5 Results for June 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.13: Count – June 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,517,562
feed_05	284
feed_04	214
feed_01	143
feed_10	9

Table L.14: Reverse Count – June 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1517730	99.9847%
2	217	0.0143%
3	16	0.0011%

Table L.15: Intersection by Count – June 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_01 feed_03	135
feed_03 feed_04	76
feed_03 feed_05	31
feed_04 feed_05	9
feed_01 feed_04	8
feed_01 feed_05	6
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_03	8
feed_04	

Table L.15: Intersection by Count – June 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.16: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_01 feed_04	3.7383%
feed_04 feed_05	3.1690%
feed_01 feed_05	2.1127%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0089%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0050%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0020%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0005%
feed_04	

Table L.16: Intersection by Percentage – June 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.6 Results for July 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.17: Count – July 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,160,293
feed_05	1,724
feed_04	458
feed_01	144
feed_10	27

Table L.18: Reverse Count – July 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1161993	99.9728%
2	295	0.0254%
3	21	0.0018%

Table L.19: Intersection by Count – July 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_04 feed_05	133
feed_01 feed_03	96
feed_03 feed_05	73
feed_03 feed_04	47
feed_01 feed_05	8
feed_01 feed_04	1
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	15

Table L.19: Intersection by Count – July 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.20: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	7.7146%
feed_01 feed_05	0.4640%
feed_01 feed_04	0.2183%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0083%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0063%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0041%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_04 feed_05	0.0580%

Table L.20: Intersection by Percentage – July 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.7 Results for August 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.21: Count – August 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,265,289
feed_05	940
feed_04	612
feed_01	121
feed_10	13

Table L.22: Reverse Count – August 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1265952	99.9612%
2	451	0.0356%
3	39	0.0031%
4	1	0.0001%

Table L.23: Intersection by Count – August 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03 feed_04	346
feed_01 feed_03	114
feed_03 feed_05	64
feed_04 feed_05	39
feed_01 feed_04	6
feed_01 feed_05	5
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	31

Table L.23: Intersection by Count – August 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.24: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	4.1489%
feed_01 feed_04	0.9804%
feed_01 feed_05	0.5319%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0273%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0090%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0051%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%

Table L.24: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_01 feed_04 feed_05	0.1064%

Table L.24: Intersection by Percentage – August 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.8 Results for September 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.25: Count – September 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	655,804
feed_05	949
feed_01	211
feed_04	182
feed_10	32

Table L.26: Reverse Count – September 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	656289	99.9409%
2	280	0.0426%
3	103	0.0157%
4	5	0.0008%

Table L.27: Intersection by Count – September 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_01 feed_03	210
feed_03 feed_04	131
feed_04 feed_05	129
feed_03 feed_05	125
feed_01 feed_05	18
feed_01 feed_04	6
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_04	95
feed_05	

Table L.27: Intersection by Count – September 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.28: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	13.5933%
feed_01 feed_04	2.8436%
feed_01 feed_05	1.8967%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0320%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0200%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0191%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%

Table L.28: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_01 feed_04 feed_05	0.5269%

Table L.28: Intersection by Percentage – September 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.9 Results for October 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.29: Count – October 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,560,242
feed_05	1,188
feed_01	156
feed_04	129
feed_10	9

Table L.30: Reverse Count – October 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1560729	99.9710%
2	366	0.0234%
3	81	0.0052%
4	5	0.0003%

Table L.31: Intersection by Count – October 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03 feed_05	271
feed_01 feed_03	147
feed_03 feed_04	115
feed_04 feed_05	91
feed_01 feed_05	10
feed_01 feed_04	5
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_04	81
feed_05	

Table L.31: Intersection by Count – October 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.32: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	7.6599%
feed_01 feed_04	3.2051%
feed_01 feed_05	0.8418%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0174%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0094%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0074%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%

Table L.32: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_01 feed_04 feed_05	0.4209%

Table L.32: Intersection by Percentage – October 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.10 Results for November 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.33: Count – November 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,509,576
feed_05	1,684
feed_04	424
feed_01	148
feed_10	8

Table L.34: Reverse Count – November 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1510963	99.9725%
2	368	0.0243%
3	47	0.0031%

Table L.35: Intersection by Count – November 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03 feed_04	192
feed_01 feed_03	147
feed_03 feed_05	82
feed_04 feed_05	66
feed_01 feed_05	21
feed_01 feed_04	1
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_04	25
feed_05	

Table L.35: Intersection by Count – November 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.36: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	3.9192%
feed_01 feed_05	1.2470%
feed_01 feed_04	0.2358%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0127%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0097%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0054%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0017%
feed_05	

Table L.36: Intersection by Percentage – November 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.11 Results for December 2012 (Feeds)

Table L.37: Count – December 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,564,404
feed_05	2,933
feed_04	192
feed_01	122
feed_10	8

Table L.38: Reverse Count – December 2012 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1566510	99.9648%
2	508	0.0324%
3	43	0.0027%
4	1	0.0001%

Table L.39: Intersection by Count – December 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03 feed_05	376
feed_01 feed_03	119
feed_04 feed_05	89
feed_03 feed_04	49
feed_01 feed_05	9
feed_01 feed_04	1
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_04	37
feed_05	

Table L.39: Intersection by Count – December 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.40: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	3.0344%
feed_01 feed_04	0.5208%
feed_01 feed_05	0.3069%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0240%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0076%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0031%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%

Table L.40: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_01 feed_04 feed_05	0.0341%

Table L.40: Intersection by Percentage – December 2012 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.12 Results for January 2013 (Feeds)

Table L.41: Count – January 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,687,539
feed_05	13,044
feed_04	1,597
feed_10	484
feed_06	0
feed_01	0

Table L.42: Reverse Count – January 2013 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1699063	99.8966%
2	1676	0.0985%
3	83	0.0049%

Table L.43: Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03 feed_05	1,177
feed_04 feed_05	609
feed_03 feed_04	139
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_05	0
feed_04 feed_06	0
feed_06 feed_10	0
feed_03 feed_06	0
feed_01 feed_06	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_03	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_04	0
feed_05 feed_06	0
feed_03 feed_04	83
feed_05	
feed_01 feed_05	0
feed_06 feed_10	

Table L.43: Intersection by Count – January 2013 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.44: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	4.6688%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0697%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0082%
feed_01 feed_05	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_04 feed_06	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_06	0.0000%
feed_06 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_04	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_06	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_04 feed_05	0.0049%

Table L.44: Intersection by Percentage – January 2013 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.13 Results for February 2013 (Feeds)

Table L.45: Count – February 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,427,938
feed_05	1,841
feed_06	1,704
feed_04	29
feed_10	10
feed_01	0

Table L.46: Reverse Count – February 2013 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1430645	99.9697%
2	425	0.0297%
3	9	0.0006%

Table L.47: Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03 feed_05	404
feed_04 feed_05	17
feed_03 feed_04	15
feed_03 feed_06	9
feed_05 feed_06	7
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_05	0
feed_04 feed_06	0
feed_06 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_06	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_03	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_04	0
feed_03 feed_04	9
feed_05	
feed_01 feed_05	0
feed_06 feed_10	0

Table L.47: Intersection by Count – February 2013 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.48: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	0.9234%
feed_05 feed_06	0.3802%
feed_03 feed_05	0.0283%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0011%
feed_03 feed_06	0.0006%
feed_01 feed_05	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_04 feed_06	0.0000%
feed_06 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_06	0.0000%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_04	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0006%
feed_05	

Table L.48: Intersection by Percentage – February 2013 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

L.14 Results for March 2013 (Feeds)

Table L.49: Count – March 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03	1,564,257
feed_05	5,261
feed_06	1,470
feed_01	610
feed_04	53
feed_10	21

Table L.50: Reverse Count – March 2013 Domains – Feeds

Number of Times	Count	Percentage
1	1564756	99.7806%
2	3405	0.2171%
3	34	0.0022%
4	1	0.0001%

Table L.51: Intersection by Count – March 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Count
feed_03 feed_05	3,380
feed_04 feed_05	44
feed_03 feed_04	34
feed_03 feed_06	27
feed_05 feed_06	27
feed_04 feed_06	1
feed_03 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_05	0
feed_06 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_06	0
feed_04 feed_10	0
feed_05 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_03	0
feed_01 feed_10	0
feed_01 feed_04	0
feed_03 feed_04	31
feed_05	1
feed_03 feed_04	1
feed_05 feed_06	1

Table L.51: Intersection by Count – March 2013 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Table L.52: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 Domains – Feeds

Blacklists	Percentage
feed_04 feed_05	0.8363%
feed_05 feed_06	0.5132%
feed_03 feed_05	0.2161%
feed_04 feed_06	0.0680%
feed_03 feed_04	0.0022%
feed_03 feed_06	0.0017%
feed_01 feed_05	0.0000%
feed_03 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_06 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_06	0.0000%
feed_04 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_05 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_03	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_10	0.0000%
feed_01 feed_04	0.0000%
feed_04 feed_05	0.0190%
feed_06	
feed_03 feed_04	
feed_05 feed_06	0.0001%

Table L.52: Intersection by Percentage – March 2013 Domains – Feeds-DOMAINS (Continued)

Part V

Time-Series Analysis

The pairwise blacklists that have non-empty intersections are examined to determine if a precedence between the two sets can be found.

M DNSBL – IPs

The DNSBL IP blacklists are examined for 2012, and the results are in Table M.1.

Table M.1: Precedence Analysis – 2012 IPs – DNSBL

Intersection by Count	Intersection by Percent	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Same Day Counts
5130	53.8074%	list_01 853	list_04 3585	692
4335	45.4688%	list_01 956	list_15 3102	277
26	1.7117%	list_01 21	list_03 5	0
7407	77.6904%	list_01 1953	list_06 4865	589
6083	63.8032%	list_01 914	list_07 4764	405
5094	53.4298%	list_01 647	list_08 4018	429
5840	61.2545%	list_01 839	list_09 4623	378
6170	64.7158%	list_01 660	list_02 5016	494
12	0.5639%	list_01 9	list_05 3	0
461176	38.1050%	list_04 154158	list_15 209109	97909

2	0.0239%	list_04 0	list_12 2	0
277	18.2357%	list_04 125	list_03 100	52
553915	45.7676%	list_04 130685	list_06 259624	163606
671724	55.5016%	list_04 127073	list_07 346010	198641
704950	58.2469%	list_04 131888	list_08 361997	211065
578649	47.8112%	list_04 161737	list_09 271319	145593
1094936	90.4698%	list_04 79632	list_02 679829	335475
283	13.2989%	list_04 150	list_05 91	42
6	0.0716%	list_15 0	list_12 6	0
124	8.1633%	list_15 74	list_03 40	10
1340833	37.1696%	list_15 309387	list_06 672209	359237
1631790	45.2353%	list_15 374315	list_07 669341	588134
1678710	46.5360%	list_15 428952	list_08 710739	539019
943216	26.1471%	list_15 344516	list_09 373979	224721
3198109	88.6557%	list_15 318032	list_02 1810908	1069169
108	5.0752%	list_15 64	list_05 43	1
41	5.7183%	list_12 41	list_13 0	0

21	0.2507%	list_12 21	list_06 0	0
12	0.1433%	list_12 12	list_07 0	0
15	0.1791%	list_12 15	list_08 0	0
13	0.1552%	list_12 13	list_09 0	0
74	0.8836%	list_12 74	list_02 0	0
2	0.2789%	list_13 1	list_06 1	0
2	0.2789%	list_13 1	list_09 1	0
5	0.6974%	list_13 2	list_02 3	0
17	2.3710%	list_13 12	list_05 4	1
191	12.5741%	list_03 40	list_06 135	16
161	10.5991%	list_03 39	list_07 106	16
125	8.2291%	list_03 38	list_08 75	12
295	19.4207%	list_03 71	list_09 200	24
295	19.4207%	list_03 92	list_02 167	36
612	40.2897%	list_03 227	list_05 116	269
2250695	42.7505%	list_06 984863	list_07 447707	818125
2528614	39.1813%	list_06 1047520	list_08 590598	890496

1622883	39.8608%	list_06 681445	list_09 352568	588870
8622450	75.7924%	list_06 1749825	list_02 2356902	4515723
152	7.1429%	list_06 89	list_05 54	9
2700540	51.2951%	list_07 755568	list_08 765178	1179794
1531769	37.6229%	list_07 594267	list_09 423266	514236
5016488	95.2851%	list_07 256959	list_02 2532179	2227350
134	6.2970%	list_07 80	list_05 49	5
1567309	38.4958%	list_08 664014	list_09 440384	462911
5956034	92.2898%	list_08 521008	list_02 2798383	2636643
122	5.7331%	list_08 76	list_05 41	5
3408328	83.7145%	list_09 426525	list_02 1754634	1227169
292	13.7218%	list_09 179	list_05 97	16
456	21.4286%	list_02 215	list_05 151	90

The DNSBL IP blacklists are examined for 2013, and the results are in Table M.2.

Table M.2: Precedence Analysis – 2013 IPs – DNSBL

Intersection by Count	Intersection by Percent	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Same Day Counts
--------------------------	----------------------------	------------------------------------	------------------------------------	--------------------

1892	38.9461%	list_01 181	list_04 1546	165
1458	30.0124%	list_01 352	list_15 980	126
4	0.1160%	list_01 4	list_03 0	0
2797	57.5751%	list_01 790	list_06 1880	127
1317	27.1099%	list_01 289	list_07 944	84
1503	30.9387%	list_01 254	list_08 1144	105
2146	44.1746%	list_01 222	list_09 1750	174
2045	42.0955%	list_01 257	list_02 1629	159
5	1.4793%	list_01 1	list_05 3	1
117286	41.5778%	list_04 33759	list_15 57249	26278
203	5.8858%	list_04 128	list_03 52	23
132805	47.0793%	list_04 38846	list_06 61312	32647
142414	50.4857%	list_04 21840	list_07 79289	41285
148763	52.7364%	list_04 30938	list_08 80730	37095
148595	52.6768%	list_04 40897	list_09 70677	37021
247054	87.5805%	list_04 13447	list_02 157047	76560
36	10.6509%	list_04 12	list_05 16	8

2	0.0877%	list_15 0	list_12 2	0
219	6.3497%	list_15 147	list_03 38	34
308482	40.5798%	list_15 96931	list_06 111034	100517
340473	44.7881%	list_15 69646	list_07 136000	134827
329354	43.3254%	list_15 89934	list_08 127790	111630
264569	34.8031%	list_15 90504	list_09 95738	78327
671319	88.3097%	list_15 47273	list_02 340232	283814
16	4.7337%	list_15 4	list_05 9	3
6	6.8182%	list_12 6	list_13 0	0
1	0.0438%	list_12 1	list_03 0	0
5	0.2192%	list_12 5	list_06 0	0
2	0.0877%	list_12 2	list_07 0	0
1	0.0438%	list_12 1	list_08 0	0
3	0.1315%	list_12 3	list_09 0	0
6	0.2630%	list_12 6	list_02 0	0
1	1.1364%	list_13 0	list_03 0	1
3	3.4091%	list_13 0	list_05 3	0

308	8.9301%	list_03 94	list_06 182	32
248	7.1905%	list_03 26	list_07 172	50
256	7.4224%	list_03 44	list_08 176	36
356	10.3218%	list_03 70	list_09 244	42
572	16.5845%	list_03 77	list_02 360	135
162	47.9290%	list_03 66	list_05 43	53
480217	44.9919%	list_06 131506	list_07 137616	211095
459682	35.5170%	list_06 149988	list_08 137529	172165
454797	36.5140%	list_06 139911	list_09 129024	185862
1605545	66.4622%	list_06 204599	list_02 507327	893619
36	10.6509%	list_06 16	list_05 18	2
456891	42.8064%	list_07 143005	list_08 111841	202045
408973	38.3170%	list_07 138747	list_09 99763	170463
999477	93.6417%	list_07 40208	list_02 444146	515123
15	4.4379%	list_07 6	list_05 6	3
372234	29.8853%	list_08 140908	list_09 108109	123217
1116124	86.2365%	list_08 80350	list_02 486527	549247

20	5.9172%	list_08 9	list_05 7	4
963695	77.3715%	list_09 86118	list_02 433893	443684
54	15.9763%	list_09 27	list_05 14	13
96	28.4024%	list_02 30	list_05 52	14

N Feeds – IPs

The Feeds IP blacklists are examined for 2012, and the results are in Table N.1.

Table N.1: Precedence Analysis – 2012 IPs – Feeds

Intersection by Count	Intersection by Percent	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Same Day Counts
62125	2.6835%	feed_02 18247	feed_03 43412	466
1946	72.6390%	feed_02 0	feed_04 1946	0
32895	99.8907%	feed_02 5233	feed_07 26435	1227
6455	54.4175%	feed_02 2065	feed_09 3999	391
3910	0.1689%	feed_02 2	feed_10 3908	0
103	3.8447%	feed_03 0	feed_04 103	0
982	2.9820%	feed_03 192	feed_07 789	1
280	2.3605%	feed_03 115	feed_09 165	0
19615	0.3875%	feed_03 4	feed_10 19611	0
6	0.2240%	feed_04 6	feed_07 0	0
2	0.0747%	feed_04 2	feed_09 0	0
79	2.9489%	feed_04 0	feed_10 0	0
5470	46.1136%	feed_07 1749	feed_09 2080	1641

25	0.0759%	feed_07 0	feed_10 25	0
10	0.0843%	feed_09 0	feed_10 10	0

The Feeds IP blacklists are examined for 2013, and the results are in Table N.2.

Table N.2: Precedence Analysis – 2013 IPs – Feeds

Intersection by Count	Intersection by Percent	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Same Day Counts
18428	1.1700%	feed_02 6662	feed_03 11320	446
436	31.8481%	feed_02 0	feed_04 436	0
9605	25.3792%	feed_02 3932	feed_07 778	4895
3593	55.9919%	feed_02 1581	feed_09 910	1102
2260	0.1435%	feed_02 1	feed_10 2258	1
30	2.1914%	feed_03 0	feed_04 30	0
504	1.3317%	feed_03 100	feed_07 368	36
67	1.0441%	feed_03 38	feed_09 28	1
128	0.0021%	feed_03 0	feed_10 128	0
2	0.1461%	feed_04 2	feed_07 0	0
58	4.2367%	feed_04 0	feed_10 0	0

3213	50.0701%	feed_07 1006	feed_09 931	1276
36	0.0951%	feed_07 0	feed_10 36	0
12	0.1870%	feed_09 0	feed_10 12	0

O All Lists – IPs

All the IP blacklists are examined for 2012, and the results are in Table O.1, except for those already in Table M.1 or Table N.1.

Table O.1: Precedence Analysis – 2012 IPs – All

Intersection by Count	Intersection by Percent	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Same Day Counts
14650	1.9287%	feed_02 0	list_10 14650	0
323	3.3879%	feed_02 115	list_01 206	2
23626	1.9521%	feed_02 4008	list_04 19436	182
23375	1.0097%	feed_02 5532	list_15 17561	282
4	0.0478%	feed_02 0	list_12 4	0
171	11.2574%	feed_02 52	list_03 108	11
33240	1.4358%	feed_02 6123	list_06 26956	161
31613	1.3655%	feed_02 7007	list_07 24307	299
33391	1.4423%	feed_02 6931	list_08 26127	333
38685	1.6710%	feed_02 8472	list_09 29934	279
113956	4.9223%	feed_02 31549	list_02 81539	868
470	22.0865%	feed_02 172	list_05 279	19
3910	0.1689%	feed_02 2	feed_10 3908	0

62	2.3143%	list_10 0	feed_04 0	62
289	0.8776%	list_10 289	feed_07 0	0
148	1.2477%	list_10 148	feed_09 0	0
2470	0.3252%	list_10 0	feed_10 0	2470
2	0.0747%	list_01 0	feed_04 2	0
21	0.2203%	list_01 13	feed_07 8	0
9	0.0944%	list_01 4	feed_09 5	0
103	3.8447%	list_04 0	feed_04 103	0
528	1.6034%	list_04 250	feed_07 275	3
303	2.5544%	list_04 172	feed_09 130	1
3816	0.3153%	list_04 0	feed_10 3816	0
66	2.4636%	list_15 0	feed_04 66	0
472	1.4333%	list_15 217	feed_07 254	1
208	1.7535%	list_15 113	feed_09 90	5
2146	0.0595%	list_15 0	feed_10 2146	0
13	0.1552%	list_12 0	feed_10 0	0
1	0.1395%	list_13 0	feed_10 1	0

6	0.3950%	list_03 0	feed_04 6	0
4	0.2633%	list_03 3	feed_07 1	0
6	0.3950%	list_03 2	feed_09 4	0
2	0.1317%	list_03 0	feed_10 2	0
119	4.4420%	feed_04 119	list_06 0	0
110	4.1060%	feed_04 110	list_07 0	0
97	3.6208%	feed_04 97	list_08 0	0
190	7.0922%	feed_04 190	list_09 0	0
427	15.9388%	feed_04 427	list_02 0	0
126	5.9211%	feed_04 126	list_05 0	0
898	2.7269%	list_06 488	feed_07 400	10
334	2.8157%	list_06 222	feed_09 110	2
4383	0.0866%	list_06 0	feed_10 4383	0
688	2.0892%	list_07 297	feed_07 388	3
335	2.8241%	list_07 199	feed_09 134	2
2752	0.0544%	list_07 0	feed_10 2752	0
770	2.3382%	feed_07 387	list_08 376	7

1008	3.0609%	feed_07 495	list_09 504	9
2549	7.7404%	feed_07 1316	list_02 1200	33
21	0.9868%	feed_07 13	list_05 7	1
327	2.7567%	list_08 190	feed_09 137	0
2537	0.0501%	list_08 0	feed_10 2537	0
539	4.5439%	list_09 317	feed_09 217	5
5427	0.1333%	list_09 0	feed_10 5427	0
1297	10.9341%	list_02 570	feed_09 656	71
27578	0.5449%	list_02 2	feed_10 27575	1
15	0.7049%	list_05 4	feed_09 10	1
7	0.3289%	list_05 0	feed_10 7	0

All of the IP blacklists are examined for 2013, and the results are in Table O.2, except for those already in Table M.2 or Table N.2.

Table O.2: Precedence Analysis – 2013 IPs – All

Intersection by Count	Intersection by Percent	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Blacklist and Number First Seen	Same Day Counts
7499	1.4512%	feed_02 0	list_10 7499	0
621	12.7830%	feed_02 393	list_01 201	27

9014	3.1955%	feed_02 2390	list_04 5254	1370
6827	0.8981%	feed_02 2563	list_15 3939	325
1	0.0438%	feed_02 0	list_12 1	0
132	3.8272%	feed_02 56	list_03 68	8
9902	0.6287%	feed_02 3693	list_06 5927	282
6970	0.6530%	feed_02 2500	list_07 4018	452
9611	0.7426%	feed_02 3368	list_08 5738	505
14356	1.1526%	feed_02 5237	list_09 8001	1118
41682	2.6464%	feed_02 21036	list_02 18377	2269
75	22.1893%	feed_02 30	list_05 38	7
17	1.2418%	list_10 0	feed_04 0	17
163	0.4307%	list_10 163	feed_07 0	0
40	0.6233%	list_10 40	feed_09 0	0
1006	0.1947%	list_10 0	feed_10 0	1006
2	0.0412%	list_01 0	feed_07 2	0
3	0.0618%	list_01 0	feed_10 3	0
16	1.1687%	list_04 0	feed_04 16	0

154	0.4069%	list_04 28	feed_07 123	3
44	0.6857%	list_04 32	feed_09 12	0
4447	1.5765%	list_04 0	feed_10 4447	0
11	0.8035%	list_15 0	feed_04 11	0
164	0.4333%	list_15 20	feed_07 137	7
30	0.4675%	list_15 21	feed_09 9	0
418	0.0550%	list_15 0	feed_10 418	0
6	0.2630%	list_12 0	feed_10 0	0
18	0.5219%	list_03 9	feed_07 9	0
10	0.2899%	list_03 6	feed_09 3	1
17	0.4929%	list_03 1	feed_10 16	0
39	2.8488%	feed_04 39	list_06 0	0
14	1.0226%	feed_04 14	list_07 0	0
29	2.1183%	feed_04 29	list_08 0	0
30	2.1914%	feed_04 30	list_09 0	0
138	10.0804%	feed_04 138	list_02 0	0
1	0.2959%	feed_04 1	list_05 0	0

380	1.0041%	list_06 63	feed_07 304	13
83	1.2934%	list_06 45	feed_09 37	1
313	0.0130%	list_06 0	feed_10 313	0
193	0.5100%	list_07 30	feed_07 155	8
42	0.6545%	list_07 24	feed_09 15	3
104	0.0097%	list_07 0	feed_10 104	0
266	0.7028%	feed_07 216	list_08 42	8
414	1.0939%	feed_07 329	list_09 73	12
1427	3.7705%	feed_07 975	list_02 318	134
2	0.5917%	feed_07 0	list_05 2	0
50	0.7792%	list_08 33	feed_09 15	2
370	0.0286%	list_08 0	feed_10 370	0
107	1.6674%	list_09 63	feed_09 40	4
9754	0.7831%	list_09 0	feed_10 9754	0
668	10.4098%	list_02 164	feed_09 446	58
19914	0.3306%	list_02 0	feed_10 19914	0
4	1.1834%	list_05 2	feed_09 2	0

P DNSBL – Domains

The DNSBL domain blacklists are examined for 2012, and the results are in Table P.1.

Table P.1: Precedence Analysis – 2012 Domains – DNSBL

Intersection	Intersection	Blacklist and	Blacklist and	Same Day
319	2.0959%	list_04 261238	list_12 1225347	17
2495	16.3929%	list_04 2865212	list_13 1223532	758
11711	76.9448%	list_04 2645307	list_16 1217855	4968
12967	85.1971%	list_04 332032	list_03 1217877	6936
13448	88.3574%	list_04 282143	list_05 1216107	6899
33228	17.1672%	list_12 2846235	list_13 246895	1460
96883	50.0545%	list_12 2582208	list_16 233461	3207
13250	6.8456%	list_12 340470	list_03 251530	758
3005	1.5525%	list_12 291546	list_05 259733	515
167649	79.3612%	list_13 2512903	list_16 2816239	24042
46567	22.0438%	list_13 313052	list_03 2838142	13318
27318	12.9317%	list_13 275860	list_05 2849357	7321
254849	74.5884%	list_16 150240	list_03 2492571	101267
192857	66.2238%	list_16 165663	list_05 2524542	64655

172675	59.2937%	list_03 185053	list_05 188495	91130
--------	----------	-------------------	-------------------	-------

The DNSBL domain blacklists are examined for 2013, and the results are in Table P.2.

Table P.2: Precedence Analysis – 2013 Domains – DNSBL

Intersection	Intersection	Blacklist and	Blacklist and	Same Day
40	0.8953%	list_04 52029	list_12 286548	4
594	13.2945%	list_04 932274	list_13 286226	153
3896	87.1979%	list_04 880635	list_16 284290	1330
4288	95.9714%	list_04 1025987	list_03 284627	1650
4112	92.0322%	list_04 98062	list_05 284482	1582
7492	18.9087%	list_12 928024	list_13 48726	498
20183	50.9389%	list_12 867096	list_16 47144	1234
16465	41.5552%	list_12 1020507	list_03 44501	783
436	1.1004%	list_12 101531	list_05 51745	67
37494	76.5559%	list_13 851365	list_16 922000	5425
32329	66.0099%	list_13 1008761	list_03 917005	4788
5254	10.7277%	list_13 97787	list_05 929178	2182

290637	32.8945%	list_16 902578	list_03 671283	49293
54039	53.3387%	list_16 60742	list_05 850029	20501
64742	63.9030%	list_03 54356	list_05 975027	37626

Q Feeds – Domains

The Feeds domain blacklists are examined for 2012, and the results are in Table Q.1.

Table Q.1: Precedence Analysis – 2012 Domains – Feeds

Intersection	Intersection	Blacklist and	Blacklist and	Same Day
156	32.5000%	feed_03 862	feed_01 41999275	692
1070	29.1951%	feed_03 2762	feed_04 41999406	543
73	0.2394%	feed_03 29458	feed_05 41998133	31
1	0.2083%	feed_01 3638	feed_04 2118	14
4	0.8333%	feed_01 30469	feed_05 1158	3
49	1.3370%	feed_04 30339	feed_05 2397	32

The Feeds domain blacklists are examined for 2013, and the results are in Table Q.2.

Table Q.2: Precedence Analysis – 2013 Domains – Feeds

Intersection	Intersection	Blacklist and	Blacklist and	Same Day
67	38.9535%	feed_01 15936458	feed_03 582	0
114	66.2791%	feed_01 20146	feed_05 343	0
206	11.9767%	feed_03 1511	feed_04 15936314	114
6409	29.1517%	feed_03 19296	feed_05 15930925	681

115	2.5658%	feed_03 3019	feed_06 15936423	1
690	40.1163%	feed_04 19697	feed_05 1003	444
4	0.2326%	feed_04 3067	feed_06 1677	0
199	4.4400%	feed_05 3037	feed_06 20073	8

R All Lists – Domains

The DNSBL blacklists were cross-checked against the Feeds blacklists for 2012, and the results are in Table R.1.

Table R.1: Precedence Analysis – 2012 Domains – All

Intersection	Intersection	Blacklist and	Blacklist and	Same Day
51	0.3351%	feed_03 939041	list_04 41629707	66708
119	0.0615%	feed_03 261374	list_12 42000097	0
63	0.0298%	feed_03 2866493	list_13 42000110	0
1070	0.0403%	feed_03 2654339	list_16 42000116	0
648	0.1897%	feed_03 344560	list_03 42000067	3
1443	0.4955%	feed_03 293321	list_05 42000077	2
3	0.6250%	feed_01 2654339	list_16 2157	0
25	5.2083%	feed_01 293378	list_05 2157	0
17	0.4638%	list_04 3665	feed_04 1225502	0
37	0.2431%	list_04 30488	feed_05 1225502	0
16	0.4366%	list_12 3665	feed_04 261421	0
317	1.0398%	list_12 30488	feed_05 261421	0
14	0.3820%	list_13 3665	feed_04 2866495	0
83	0.2722%	list_13 30488	feed_05 2866495	0

191	5.2115%	list_16 3665	feed_04 2654339	0
1034	3.3915%	list_16 30488	feed_05 2654339	0
112	3.0559%	list_03 3665	feed_04 344588	0
663	2.1746%	list_03 30488	feed_05 344588	0
389	10.6139%	feed_04 293378	list_05 3665	0
1812	5.9433%	feed_05 293378	list_05 30488	0

The DNSBL blacklists were cross-checked against the Feeds blacklists for 2013, and the results are in Table R.2.

Table R.2: Precedence Analysis – 2013 Domains – All

Intersection	Intersection	Blacklist and	Blacklist and	Same Day
3	0.0671%	feed_03 253452	list_04 15779945	24027
23	0.0580%	feed_03 52064	list_12 15936454	0
8	0.0163%	feed_03 932690	list_13 15936458	0
151	0.0171%	feed_03 883594	list_16 15936458	0
312	0.0312%	feed_03 1030151	list_03 15936191	33
352	0.3474%	feed_03 101712	list_05 15936452	0
1	0.5814%	feed_01 883594	list_16 610	0

1	0.5814%	feed_01 1030198	list_03 610	0
6	3.4884%	feed_01 101717	list_05 610	0
1	0.0581%	list_04 1679	feed_04 286557	0
4	0.0895%	list_04 20146	feed_05 286557	0
1	0.0224%	list_04 3067	feed_06 286554	0
3	0.1744%	list_12 1679	feed_04 52064	0
62	0.2820%	list_12 20146	feed_05 52064	0
11	0.2454%	list_12 3068	feed_06 52064	0
2	0.1163%	list_13 1679	feed_04 932690	0
35	0.1592%	list_13 20146	feed_05 932690	0
3	0.0669%	list_13 3068	feed_06 932690	0
11	0.6395%	list_16 1679	feed_04 883594	0
334	1.5192%	list_16 20146	feed_05 883594	0
47	1.0486%	list_16 3068	feed_06 883594	0
17	0.9884%	list_03 1679	feed_04 1030198	0
317	1.4419%	list_03 20145	feed_05 1030198	0
62	1.3833%	list_03 3068	feed_06 1030196	0

69	4.0116%	feed_04 101717	list_05 1679	0
654	2.9748%	feed_05 101717	list_05 20146	0
28	0.6247%	feed_06 101709	list_05 3066	1